

Calendar No. 249

117TH CONGRESS
2D SESSION**S. 3469**

To establish a review of United States multilateral aid.

IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

JANUARY 10, 2022

Mr. RISCH introduced the following bill; which was read the first time

JANUARY 18, 2022

Read the second time and placed on the calendar

A BILL

To establish a review of United States multilateral aid.

1 *Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-*
2 *tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,*

3 **SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE; TABLE OF CONTENTS.**

4 (a) SHORT TITLE.—This Act may be cited as the
5 “Multilateral Aid Review Act of 2022”.

6 (b) TABLE OF CONTENTS.—The table of contents for
7 this Act is as follows:

- Sec. 1. Short title; table of contents.
- Sec. 2. Purpose.
- Sec. 3. Appropriate congressional committees defined.
- Sec. 4. Objectives.

Sec. 5. Scope.

Sec. 6. Report on Review.

Sec. 7. United States Multilateral Review Task Force.

Sec. 8. United States Multilateral Aid Review Peer Review Group.

Sec. 9. Termination of authorities.

1 **SEC. 2. PURPOSE.**

2 The purpose of this Act is to establish a United
3 States Multilateral Aid Review (referred to in this Act as
4 the “Review”) to publicly assess the value of United States
5 Government investments in multilateral entities.

6 **SEC. 3. APPROPRIATE CONGRESSIONAL COMMITTEES DE-**
7 **FINED.**

8 In this Act, the term “appropriate congressional com-
9 mittees” means—

10 (1) the Committee on Foreign Relations of the
11 Senate;

12 (2) the Committee on Appropriations of the
13 Senate;

14 (3) the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the
15 House of Representatives;

16 (4) the Committee on Financial Services of the
17 House of Representatives; and

18 (5) the Committee on Appropriations of the
19 House of Representatives.

20 **SEC. 4. OBJECTIVES.**

21 The objectives of the Review are—

1 (1) to provide a tool to guide the United States
2 Government's decision making and prioritization
3 with regard to funding multilateral entities;

4 (2) to provide a methodological basis for allo-
5 cating budgetary resources to entities that advance
6 relevant United States foreign policy objectives;

7 (3) to incentivize improvements in the perform-
8 ance of multilateral entities to achieve better out-
9 comes, including in developing, fragile, and crisis-af-
10 flicted regions; and

11 (4) to protect United States taxpayer invest-
12 ments in foreign assistance by promoting trans-
13 parency with regard to the funding of multilateral
14 entities.

15 **SEC. 5. SCOPE.**

16 The Review shall assess, at a minimum, the following
17 multilateral entities to which the United States Govern-
18 ment contributes voluntary or assessed funding, whether
19 cash or in-kind:

20 (1) The World Bank Group, including the
21 International Bank for Reconstruction and Develop-
22 ment, the International Development Association,
23 and the International Finance Corporation.

24 (2) The regional development banks, including
25 the Asian Development Bank, the African Develop-

1 ment Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank,
2 the European Bank for Reconstruction and Develop-
3 ment, and the North American Development Bank.

4 (3) Climate Investment Funds.

5 (4) The Food and Agriculture Organization.

6 (5) Gavi, the Vaccine Alliance.

7 (6) The Global Environment Facility.

8 (7) The Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuber-
9 culosis and Malaria.

10 (8) The Green Climate Fund.

11 (9) The Inter-American Institute for Coopera-
12 tion for Agriculture.

13 (10) The International Civil Aviation Organiza-
14 tion.

15 (11) The International Committee of the Red
16 Cross.

17 (12) The International Fund for Agricultural
18 Development.

19 (13) The International Labour Organization.

20 (14) The International Organization for Migra-
21 tion.

22 (15) The International Telecommunication
23 Union.

24 (16) The Joint UN Program on HIV/AIDS.

1 (17) The Multilateral Fund for the Implemen-
2 tation of the Montreal Protocol.

3 (18) The Office of the United Nations High
4 Commissioner for Human Rights.

5 (19) The Office of the United Nations High
6 Commissioner for Refugees.

7 (20) The Organisation for Economic Co-oper-
8 ation and Development.

9 (21) The Organization of American States.

10 (22) The Pacific Forum Fisheries Agency.

11 (23) The Pan American Health Organization.

12 (24) The United Nations Children's Fund.

13 (25) The United Nations Department of Eco-
14 nomic and Social Affairs.

15 (26) The United Nations Development Pro-
16 gramme.

17 (27) The United Nations Entity for Gender
18 Equality and the Empowerment of Women.

19 (28) The United Nations Environment Pro-
20 gramme.

21 (29) The United Nations Framework Conven-
22 tion on Climate Change.

23 (30) The United Nations Office for Project
24 Services.

1 (31) The United Nations Office for the Coordi-
2 nation of Humanitarian Affairs.

3 (32) The United Nations Office on Drugs and
4 Crime.

5 (33) The United Nations Population Fund.

6 (34) The United Nations Relief and Works
7 Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East.

8 (35) The United Nations Voluntary Fund for
9 Victims of Torture.

10 (36) The World Food Program.

11 (37) The World Health Organization.

12 (38) The World Meteorological Organization.

13 **SEC. 6. REPORT ON REVIEW.**

14 (a) SUBMISSION.—

15 (1) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 21 months
16 after the date of the enactment of this Act, the Task
17 Force established under section 7, in regular con-
18 sultation with the Peer Review Group established
19 under section 8, shall submit a report to the appro-
20 priate congressional committees that describes the
21 findings of the Review.

22 (2) PUBLICATION.—The Secretary of State
23 shall publish the report described in paragraph (1)
24 on the internet website of the Department of State
25 not later than 15 days after the date on which the

1 report is submitted to the appropriate congressional
2 committees.

3 (b) METHODOLOGY.—

4 (1) USE OF CRITERIA.—The Task Force shall
5 establish an analytical framework and assessment
6 scorecard for the Review using the criteria set forth
7 in subsection (c).

8 (2) CONSULTATION WITH CONGRESS.—

9 (A) SUBMISSION OF METHODOLOGY.—Not
10 later than 90 days after the appointments to
11 the Peer Review Group are made pursuant to
12 section 8(b), the Task Force shall submit the
13 methodology for the Review to the appropriate
14 congressional committees.

15 (B) CONSIDERATION OF CONGRESSIONAL
16 VIEWS.—The Task Force may not proceed with
17 the Review until 30 days after the methodology
18 to the appropriate congressional committees,
19 taking into consideration the views of the
20 Chairmen and Ranking Members of each of the
21 appropriate congressional committees.

22 (3) PUBLICATION OF CRITERIA AND METHOD-
23 OLOGY.—The Secretary of State shall publish the
24 final criteria and methodology for the Review on the
25 internet website of the Department of State not

1 later than 60 days after submitting the proposed
2 methodology to the appropriate congressional com-
3 mittees pursuant to paragraph (2)(A).

4 (c) ASSESSMENT CRITERIA.—The assessment score-
5 card shall include the following criteria:

6 (1) RELATIONSHIP OF STATED GOALS TO AC-
7 TUAL RESULTS.—The extent to which the stated
8 mission, goals, and objectives of the entity have been
9 achieved during the review period, including—

10 (A) an identification of the stated mission,
11 goals, and objectives of each entity;

12 (B) an evaluation of the extent to which
13 the entity met its stated implementation
14 timelines and achieved declared results; and

15 (C) an evaluation of whether the entity op-
16 timizes resources to achieve the stated mission,
17 goals, and objectives of the entity.

18 (2) RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT.—The extent
19 to which management of the entity follows best man-
20 agement practices, including—

21 (A) an evaluation of the ratio of manage-
22 ment and administrative expenses to program
23 expenses, including an evaluation of entity re-
24 sources spent on nonprogrammatic expenses;

1 (B) an evaluation of program expense
2 growth, including a comparison of the annual
3 growth of program expenses to the annual
4 growth of management and administrative ex-
5 penses; and

6 (C) an evaluation of whether the entity has
7 established appropriate levels of senior manage-
8 ment compensation.

9 (3) ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY.—

10 The extent to which the policies and procedures of
11 the entity follow best practices of accountability and
12 transparency, taking into consideration credible re-
13 porting regarding unauthorized conversion or diver-
14 sion of entity resources, and including an evaluation
15 of whether the entity has—

16 (A) established and enforced—

17 (i) appropriate auditing procedures;

18 (ii) appropriate rules to reduce the
19 risk of conflicts of interest among the sen-
20 ior leadership of the entity; and

21 (iii) appropriate whistleblower policies;

22 (B) established and maintained—

23 (i) appropriate records retention poli-
24 cies and guidelines;

1 (ii) best practices with respect to
2 transparency and public disclosure; and

3 (iii) best practices with respect to dis-
4 closure of the compensation of senior lead-
5 ership officials.

6 (4) ALIGNMENT WITH UNITED STATES FOREIGN
7 POLICY OBJECTIVES.—The extent to which the poli-
8 cies and practices of the entity align with relevant
9 United States foreign policy objectives, including an
10 evaluation of—

11 (A) the entity’s stated mission, goals, and
12 objectives in comparison to relevant United
13 States foreign policy objectives;

14 (B) any significant divergence between the
15 actions of the entity and relevant United States
16 foreign policy objectives; and

17 (C) whether continued participation by the
18 United States in the entity contributes a net
19 benefit towards achieving relevant United
20 States foreign policy objectives, including the
21 reasons for such conclusion.

22 (5) MULTILATERAL APPROACH COMPARED TO
23 BILATERAL APPROACH.—The extent to which pur-
24 suing relevant United States foreign policy objectives
25 through a multilateral approach is effective and cost-

1 efficient compared to, or complementary to, a bilat-
2 eral approach, including an evaluation of—

3 (A) whether relevant United States foreign
4 policy objectives are effectively pursued through
5 the entity, compared to existing or potential bi-
6 lateral approaches, including the criteria used
7 in the evaluation; and

8 (B) whether relevant United States foreign
9 policy objectives are pursued on a cost-effective
10 basis through the entity, including the amount
11 of funding leveraged from non-United States
12 Government sources, compared to existing or
13 potential bilateral approaches.

14 (6) REDUNDANCIES AND OVERLAP.—The extent
15 to which the mission, goals, and objectives of the en-
16 tity overlap with, or complement, the mission, goals,
17 objectives, and programs of other multilateral insti-
18 tutions to which the United States Government con-
19 tributes voluntary or assessed funding, whether cash
20 or in-kind, including—

21 (A) a comparison of the extent to which
22 relevant United States foreign policy objectives
23 are effectively pursued on a cost-effective basis
24 through each of the overlapping entities; and

1 (B) whether continued participation in
2 each entity contributes a benefit towards
3 achieving United States foreign policy objec-
4 tives.

5 **SEC. 7. UNITED STATES MULTILATERAL REVIEW TASK**
6 **FORCE.**

7 (a) ESTABLISHMENT.—The President shall establish
8 an interagency Multilateral Review Task Force (referred
9 to in this Act as the “Task Force”) to review and assess
10 United States participation in multilateral entities identi-
11 fied in section 5 and to develop and submit the report re-
12 quired under section 6 to the appropriate congressional
13 committees.

14 (b) LEADERSHIP.—The Task Force shall be chaired
15 by the Secretary of State, who may delegate his or her
16 responsibilities under this Act to an appropriate senior
17 Senate-confirmed Department of State official.

18 (c) MEMBERSHIP.—The President may appoint to
19 the interagency Task Force senior Senate-confirmed offi-
20 cials from the Department of State, the Department of
21 the Treasury, the United States Agency for International
22 Development, the Centers for Disease Control and Preven-
23 tion, the Department of Agriculture, the Department of
24 Energy, and any other relevant executive branch depart-
25 ment or agency.

1 (d) CONSULTATION.—In preparing the report under
2 section 6, including the initial review of methodology, the
3 Task Force shall consult regularly with the Peer Review
4 Group established under section 8.

5 **SEC. 8. UNITED STATES MULTILATERAL AID REVIEW PEER**
6 **REVIEW GROUP.**

7 (a) ESTABLISHMENT.—There is established the
8 United States Multilateral Aid Review Peer Review Group
9 (referred to in this Act as the “Peer Review Group”).

10 (b) MEMBERSHIP.—

11 (1) COMPOSITION.—The Peer Review Group
12 shall be composed of 8 nongovernmental volunteer
13 members, of whom—

14 (A) 2 shall be appointed by the majority
15 leader of the Senate;

16 (B) 2 shall be appointed by the minority
17 leader of the Senate;

18 (C) 2 shall be appointed by the Speaker of
19 the House of Representatives; and

20 (D) 2 shall be appointed by the minority
21 leader of the House of Representatives.

22 (2) APPOINTMENT CRITERIA.—The members of
23 the Peer Review Group shall have appropriate exper-
24 tise and knowledge of the multilateral entities sub-
25 ject to the Review established by this Act. In making

1 appointments to the Peer Review Group, potential
2 conflicts of interest should be taken into account.

3 (3) DATE.—The appointments to the Peer Re-
4 view Group shall be made not later than 30 days
5 after the date on which the Task Force is estab-
6 lished pursuant to section 7(a), and the terms of the
7 members so appointed shall begin on such date.

8 (4) CHAIRMAN AND VICE CHAIRMAN.—The Peer
9 Review Group shall select a Chairman and Vice
10 Chairman from among the members of the Peer Re-
11 view Group.

12 (c) EXPERT ANALYSIS.—The Peer Review Group
13 shall meet regularly with the Task Force, including re-
14 garding the initial review of methodology, to offer their
15 expertise of the funding and performance of multilateral
16 entities.

17 (d) REVIEW OF REPORT.—

18 (1) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 180 days be-
19 fore submitting the report required under section
20 6(a), the Task Force shall submit a draft of the re-
21 port to—

22 (A) the Peer Review Group; and

23 (B) the appropriate congressional commit-
24 tees.

25 (2) REVIEW.—The Peer Review Group shall—

1 (A) review the draft report submitted
2 under paragraph (1); and

3 (B) not later than 90 days before the sub-
4 mission of the report required under section
5 6(a), provide to the Task Force and to the ap-
6 propriate congressional committees—

7 (i) an analysis of the conclusions of
8 the report;

9 (ii) an analysis of the established
10 methodologies used to reach such conclu-
11 sions;

12 (iii) an analysis of the evidence used
13 to reach such conclusions; and

14 (iv) any additional comments to im-
15 prove the evaluations and analysis of the
16 report.

17 (e) PERIOD OF APPOINTMENT; VACANCIES.—

18 (1) IN GENERAL.—Each member of the Peer
19 Review Group shall be appointed for a 2-year term.

20 (2) VACANCIES.—Any vacancy in the Peer Re-
21 view Group—

22 (A) shall not affect the powers of the Peer
23 Review Group; and

24 (B) shall be filled in the same manner as
25 the original appointment.

1 (f) MEETINGS.—

2 (1) IN GENERAL.—The Peer Review Group
3 shall meet at the call of the Chairman.

4 (2) INITIAL MEETING.—The Peer Review
5 Group shall hold its first meeting not later than 30
6 days after its last member is appointed.

7 (3) QUORUM.—A majority of the members of
8 the Peer Review Group shall constitute a quorum,
9 but a lesser number of members may hold meetings.

10 **SEC. 9. TERMINATION OF AUTHORITIES.**

11 The authorities and requirements provided under this
12 Act shall terminate on the date that is 2 years after the
13 date of the enactment of this Act.

Calendar No. 249

117TH CONGRESS
2^D SESSION

S. 3469

A BILL

To establish a review of United States multilateral
aid.

JANUARY 18, 2022

Read the second time and placed on the calendar