THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 2184 Session of 2020

INTRODUCED BY SAYLOR, BERNSTINE, DeLUCA, GILLESPIE, HELM, KORTZ, MILLARD, MOUL, PICKETT, ROTHMAN, RYAN, WHEELAND, ZIMMERMAN AND GAYDOS, JANUARY 2, 2020

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, JANUARY 2, 2020

A JOINT RESOLUTION

- 1 Proposing integrated amendments to the Constitution of the
- 2 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, providing for hearing and
- deciding cases involving dissolution of marriage, custody,
- 4 child support, spousal support, alimony, equitable division
- of marital property and related family law matters.
- 6 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
- 7 hereby resolves as follows:
- 8 Section 1. The following integrated amendments to the
- 9 Constitution of Pennsylvania are proposed in accordance with
- 10 Article XI:
- 11 (1) That section 5 of Article V be amended to read:
- 12 § 5. Courts of common pleas.
- 13 There shall be one court of common pleas for each judicial
- 14 district (a) having such divisions and consisting of such number
- 15 of judges as shall be provided by law, one of whom shall be the
- 16 president judge; and
- 17 (b) having unlimited original jurisdiction in all cases
- 18 except as may otherwise be provided by law[.]; and

- 1 (c) having a procedure for the disposition of cases
- 2 <u>involving dissolution of marriage, custody, child support,</u>
- 3 spousal support, alimony, alimony pendente lite, equitable
- 4 <u>division of marital property and related family law matters as</u>
- 5 provided by statute; and
- 6 (d) having a family resource center as provided by statute;
- 7 and
- 8 (e) having educational requirements for judges and family
- 9 <u>law masters and mediators as provided by statute.</u>
- 10 (2) That section 10(c) of Article V be amended to read:
- 11 § 10. Judicial administration.
- 12 * * *
- 13 (c) The Supreme Court shall have the power to prescribe
- 14 general rules governing practice, procedure and the conduct of
- 15 all courts, justices of the peace and all officers serving
- 16 process or enforcing orders, judgments or decrees of any court
- 17 or justice of the peace, including the power to provide for
- 18 assignment and reassignment of classes of actions or classes of
- 19 appeals among the several courts as the needs of justice shall
- 20 require, and for admission to the bar and to practice law, and
- 21 the administration of all courts and supervision of all officers
- 22 of the Judicial Branch, if such rules are consistent with this
- 23 Constitution and neither abridge, enlarge nor modify the
- 24 substantive rights of any litigant, nor affect the right of the
- 25 General Assembly to determine the jurisdiction of any court or
- 26 justice of the peace, nor suspend nor alter any statute of
- 27 limitation or repose. [All] <u>Except for statutes enacted pursuant</u>
- 28 to section 5 of this article, all laws shall be suspended to the
- 29 extent that they are inconsistent with rules prescribed under
- 30 these provisions. Notwithstanding the provisions of this

- 1 section, the General Assembly may by statute provide for the
- 2 manner of testimony of child victims or child material witnesses
- 3 in criminal proceedings, including the use of videotaped
- 4 depositions or testimony by closed-circuit television.
- 5 * * *
- 6 (3) That section 18(a)(7), (8) and (9), (b)(5), (c)(1), (3)
- 7 and (4) and (d) introductory paragraph and (1), (2) and (3) of
- 8 Article V be amended to read:
- 9 § 18. Suspension, removal, discipline and other sanctions.
- 10 (a) There shall be an independent board within the Judicial
- 11 Branch, known as the Judicial Conduct Board, the composition,
- 12 powers and duties of which shall be as follows:
- 13 * * *
- 14 (7) The board shall receive and investigate complaints
- 15 regarding judicial conduct filed by individuals or initiated by
- 16 the board against a justice, judge, justice of the peace or
- 17 <u>family law master</u>; issue subpoenas to compel testimony under
- 18 oath of witnesses, including the subject of the investigation,
- 19 and to compel the production of documents, books, accounts and
- 20 other records relevant to the investigation; determine whether
- 21 there is probable cause to file formal charges against a
- 22 justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master
- 23 for conduct proscribed by this section; and present the case in
- 24 support of the charges before the Court of Judicial Discipline.
- 25 (8) Complaints filed with the board or initiated by the
- 26 board shall not be public information. Statements, testimony,
- 27 documents, records or other information or evidence acquired by
- 28 the board in the conduct of an investigation shall not be public
- 29 information. A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or
- 30 <u>family law master</u> who is the subject of a complaint filed with

- 1 the board or initiated by the board or of an investigation
- 2 conducted by the board shall be apprised of the nature and
- 3 content of the complaint and afforded an opportunity to respond
- 4 fully to the complaint prior to any probable cause determination
- 5 by the board. All proceedings of the board shall be confidential
- 6 except when the subject of the investigation waives
- 7 confidentiality. If, independent of any action by the board, the
- 8 fact that an investigation by the board is in progress becomes a
- 9 matter of public record, the board may, at the direction of the
- 10 subject of the investigation, issue a statement to confirm that
- 11 the investigation is in progress, to clarify the procedural
- 12 aspects of the proceedings, to explain the rights of the subject
- 13 of the investigation to a fair hearing without prejudgment or to
- 14 provide the response of the subject of the investigation to the
- 15 complaint. In acting to dismiss a complaint for lack of probable
- 16 cause to file formal charges, the board may, at its discretion,
- 17 issue a statement or report to the complainant or to the subject
- 18 of the complaint, which may contain the identity of the
- 19 complainant, the identity of the subject of the complaint, the
- 20 contents and nature of the complaint, the actions taken in the
- 21 conduct of the investigation and the results and conclusions of
- 22 the investigation. The board may include with a report a copy of
- 23 information or evidence acquired in the course of the
- 24 investigation.
- 25 (9) If the board finds probable cause to file formal charges
- 26 concerning mental or physical disability against a justice,
- 27 judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master, the board
- 28 shall so notify the subject of the charges and provide the
- 29 subject with an opportunity to resign from [judicial] his office
- 30 or, when appropriate, to enter a rehabilitation program prior to

- 1 the filing of the formal charges with the Court of Judicial
- 2 Discipline.
- 3 * * *
- 4 (b) There shall be a Court of Judicial Discipline, the
- 5 composition, powers and duties of which shall be as follows:
- 6 * * *
- 7 (5) Upon the filing of formal charges with the court by the
- 8 board, the court shall promptly schedule a hearing or hearings
- 9 to determine whether a sanction should be imposed against a
- 10 justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master
- 11 pursuant to the provisions of this section. The court shall be a
- 12 court of record, with all the attendant duties and powers
- 13 appropriate to its function. Formal charges filed with the court
- 14 shall be a matter of public record. All hearings conducted by
- 15 the court shall be public proceedings conducted pursuant to the
- 16 rules adopted by the court and in accordance with the principles
- 17 of due process and the law of evidence. Parties appearing before
- 18 the court shall have a right to discovery pursuant to the rules
- 19 adopted by the court and shall have the right to subpoena
- 20 witnesses and to compel the production of documents, books,
- 21 accounts and other records as relevant. The subject of the
- 22 charges shall be presumed innocent in any proceeding before the
- 23 court, and the board shall have the burden of proving the
- 24 charges by clear and convincing evidence. All decisions of the
- 25 court shall be in writing and shall contain findings of fact and
- 26 conclusions of law. A decision of the court may order removal
- 27 from office, suspension, censure or other discipline as
- 28 authorized by this section and as warranted by the record.
- 29 * * *
- 30 (c) Decisions of the court shall be subject to review as

- 1 follows:
- 2 (1) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
- 3 <u>law master</u> shall have the right to appeal a final adverse order
- 4 of discipline of the court. A judge [or], justice of the peace
- 5 or family law master shall have the right to appeal to the
- 6 Supreme Court in a manner consistent with rules adopted by the
- 7 Supreme Court; a justice shall have the right to appeal to a
- 8 special tribunal composed of seven judges, other than senior
- 9 judges, chosen by lot from the judges of the Superior Court and
- 10 Commonwealth Court who do not sit on the Court of Judicial
- 11 Discipline or the board, in a manner consistent with rules
- 12 adopted by the Supreme Court. The special tribunal shall hear
- 13 and decide the appeal in the same manner in which the Supreme
- 14 Court would hear and decide an appeal from an order of the
- 15 court.
- 16 * * *
- 17 (3) An order of the court which dismisses a complaint
- 18 against a judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master
- 19 may be appealed by the board to the Supreme Court, but the
- 20 appeal shall be limited to questions of law. An order of the
- 21 court which dismisses a complaint against a justice of the
- 22 Supreme Court may be appealed by the board to a special tribunal
- 23 in accordance with paragraph (1), but the appeal shall be
- 24 limited to questions of law.
- 25 (4) No justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
- 26 <u>law master</u> may participate as a member of the board, the court,
- 27 a special tribunal or the Supreme Court in any proceeding in
- 28 which the justice, judge or justice of the peace is a
- 29 complainant, the subject of a complaint, a party or a witness.
- 30 (d) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family

- 1 <u>law master</u> shall be subject to disciplinary action pursuant to
- 2 this section as follows:
- 3 (1) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
- 4 <u>law master</u> may be suspended, removed from office or otherwise
- 5 disciplined for conviction of a felony; [violation of section 17]
- 6 of this article;] misconduct in office; neglect or failure to
- 7 perform the duties of office or conduct which prejudices the
- 8 proper administration of justice or brings the judicial office
- 9 into disrepute, whether or not the conduct occurred while acting
- 10 in a judicial capacity or is prohibited by law; or conduct in
- 11 violation of a canon or rule prescribed by the Supreme Court. \underline{A}
- 12 justice, judge or justice of the peace may be suspended, removed
- 13 from office or otherwise disciplined for a violation of section
- 14 17 of this article. A judge or family law master may be
- 15 <u>suspended or removed from office for failure to complete</u>
- 16 judicial education requirements as provided by statute. In the
- 17 case of a mentally or physically disabled justice, judge [or],
- 18 justice of the peace or family law master, the court may enter
- 19 an order of removal from office, retirement, suspension or other
- 20 limitations on the activities of the justice, judge [or],
- 21 justice of the peace or family law master as warranted by the
- 22 record. Upon a final order of the court for suspension without
- 23 pay or removal, prior to any appeal, the justice, judge [or],
- 24 justice of the peace or family law master shall be suspended or
- 25 removed from office; and the salary of the justice, judge [or],
- 26 justice of the peace or family law master shall cease from the
- 27 date of the order.
- 28 (2) Prior to a hearing, the court may issue an interim order
- 29 directing the suspension, with or without pay, of any justice,
- 30 judge [or] _ justice of the peace <u>or family law master</u> against

- 1 whom formal charges have been filed with the court by the board
- 2 or against whom has been filed an indictment or information
- 3 charging a felony. An interim order under this paragraph shall
- 4 not be considered a final order from which an appeal may be
- 5 taken.
- 6 (3) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
- 7 <u>law master</u> convicted of misbehavior in office by a court,
- 8 disbarred as a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or removed
- 9 under this section shall forfeit automatically his judicial
- 10 office and thereafter be ineligible for judicial office.
- 11 * * *
- 12 Section 2. (a) Upon the first passage by the General
- 13 Assembly of these proposed constitutional amendments, the
- 14 Secretary of the Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to
- 15 comply with the advertising requirements of section 1 of Article
- 16 XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the
- 17 required advertisements to two newspapers in every county in
- 18 which such newspapers are published in sufficient time after
- 19 passage of these proposed constitutional amendments.
- 20 (b) Upon the second passage by the General Assembly of these
- 21 proposed constitutional amendments, the Secretary of the
- 22 Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to comply with the
- 23 advertising requirements of section 1 of Article XI of the
- 24 Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the required
- 25 advertisements to two newspapers in every county in which such
- 26 newspapers are published in sufficient time after passage of
- 27 these proposed constitutional amendments. The Secretary of the
- 28 Commonwealth shall submit the proposed constitutional amendments
- 29 under section 1 to the qualified electors of this Commonwealth
- 30 as a single ballot question at the first primary, general or

- 1 municipal election which meets the requirements of and is in
- 2 conformance with section 1 of Article XI of the Constitution of
- 3 Pennsylvania and which occurs at least three months after the
- 4 proposed constitutional amendments are passed by the General
- 5 Assembly.