THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL No. 1466 Session of 2017

INTRODUCED BY RABB, THOMAS, SCHLOSSBERG, V. BROWN, YOUNGBLOOD, KINSEY AND BOYLE, MAY 31, 2017

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, MAY 31, 2017

AN ACT

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Amending Titles 18 (Crimes and Offenses) and 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, in authorized disposition of offenders, further providing for sentence for murder, murder of unborn child and murder of law enforcement officer; in arson, criminal mischief and other property destruction, further providing for the offense of arson and related offenses; and, in sentencing, further providing for sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree.
10	The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
11	hereby enacts as follows:
12	Section 1. Sections 1102(a) and 3301(b)(1) of Title 18 of
13	the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes are amended to read:
14	§ 1102. Sentence for murder, murder of unborn child and murder
15	of law enforcement officer.
16	(a) First degree
17	(1) Except as provided under section 1102.1 (relating to
18	sentence of persons under the age of 18 for murder, murder of
19	an unborn child and murder of a law enforcement officer), a
20	person who has been convicted of a murder of the first degree
21	or of murder of a law enforcement officer of the first degree

1 shall be sentenced to [death or to] a term of life
2 imprisonment in accordance with 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711 (relating
3 to sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree).

4 (2) The sentence for a person who has been convicted of
5 first degree murder of an unborn child shall be the same as
6 the sentence for murder of the first degree.[, except that
7 the death penalty shall not be imposed. This paragraph shall
8 not affect the determination of an aggravating circumstance
9 under 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711(d)(17) for the killing of a pregnant
10 woman.]

11 * * *

12 § 3301. Arson and related offenses.

13 * * *

14 (b) Sentence.--

15 A person convicted of violating the provisions of (1) 16 subsection (a)(2), murder of the first degree[,] or second 17 degree shall be sentenced to [death or] life imprisonment without right to parole [; a person convicted of murder of the 18 19 second degree, pursuant to subsection (a)(2), shall be 20 sentenced to life imprisonment without right to parole]. 21 Notwithstanding provisions to the contrary, no language 22 herein shall infringe upon the inherent powers of the Governor to commute said sentence. 23

24 * * *

25 Section 2. Section 9711 of Title 42 is amended to read: 26 § 9711. Sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree. 27 [(a) Procedure in jury trials.--

(1)] After a verdict of murder of the first degree is
recorded [and before the jury is discharged], the court shall
[conduct a separate sentencing hearing in which the jury

20170HB1466PN1871

- 2 -

shall determine whether the defendant shall be sentenced to
 death or] <u>sentence the defendant to</u> life imprisonment.

3 [(2)]In the sentencing hearing, evidence concerning the victim and the impact that the death of the victim has had on 4 5 the family of the victim is admissible. Additionally, evidence may be presented as to any other matter that the 6 7 court deems relevant and admissible on the question of the 8 sentence to be imposed. Evidence shall include matters 9 relating to any of the aggravating or mitigating circumstances specified in subsections (d) and (e), and 10 11 information concerning the victim and the impact that the 12 death of the victim has had on the family of the victim. 13 Evidence of aggravating circumstances shall be limited to 14 those circumstances specified in subsection (d).

15 (3) After the presentation of evidence, the court shall 16 permit counsel to present argument for or against the 17 sentence of death. The court shall then instruct the jury in 18 accordance with subsection (c).

(4) Failure of the jury to unanimously agree upon a
sentence shall not impeach or in any way affect the guilty
verdict previously recorded.

(b) Procedure in nonjury trials and guilty pleas.--If the defendant has waived a jury trial or pleaded guilty, the sentencing proceeding shall be conducted before a jury impaneled for that purpose unless waived by the defendant with the consent of the Commonwealth, in which case the trial judge shall hear the evidence and determine the penalty in the same manner as would a jury as provided in subsection (a).

29 (c) Instructions to jury.--

30 (1) Before the jury retires to consider the sentencing 20170HB1466PN1871 - 3 - verdict, the court shall instruct the jury on the following
 matters:

(i) The aggravating circumstances specified in subsection (d) as to which there is some evidence.

5 (ii) The mitigating circumstances specified in 6 subsection (e) as to which there is some evidence.

7 (iii) Aggravating circumstances must be proved by
8 the Commonwealth beyond a reasonable doubt; mitigating
9 circumstances must be proved by the defendant by a
10 preponderance of the evidence.

(iv) The verdict must be a sentence of death if the jury unanimously finds at least one aggravating circumstance specified in subsection (d) and no mitigating circumstance or if the jury unanimously finds one or more aggravating circumstances which outweigh any mitigating circumstances. The verdict must be a sentence of life imprisonment in all other cases.

(v) The court may, in its discretion, discharge the jury if it is of the opinion that further deliberation will not result in a unanimous agreement as to the sentence, in which case the court shall sentence the defendant to life imprisonment.

23 (2)The court shall instruct the jury that if it finds 24 at least one aggravating circumstance and at least one 25 mitigating circumstance, it shall consider, in weighing the 26 aggravating and mitigating circumstances, any evidence 27 presented about the victim and about the impact of the murder 28 on the victim's family. The court shall also instruct the 29 jury on any other matter that may be just and proper under 30 the circumstances.

20170HB1466PN1871

3

4

- 4 -

(d) Aggravating circumstances.--Aggravating circumstances
 shall be limited to the following:

The victim was a firefighter, peace officer, public 3 (1)servant concerned in official detention, as defined in 18 4 5 Pa.C.S. § 5121 (relating to escape), judge of any court in the unified judicial system, the Attorney General of 6 7 Pennsylvania, a deputy attorney general, district attorney, 8 assistant district attorney, member of the General Assembly, 9 Governor, Lieutenant Governor, Auditor General, State 10 Treasurer, State law enforcement official, local law enforcement official, Federal law enforcement official or 11 12 person employed to assist or assisting any law enforcement 13 official in the performance of his duties, who was killed in 14 the performance of his duties or as a result of his official 15 position.

16 (2) The defendant paid or was paid by another person or
17 had contracted to pay or be paid by another person or had
18 conspired to pay or be paid by another person for the killing
19 of the victim.

20 (3) The victim was being held by the defendant for21 ransom or reward, or as a shield or hostage.

(4) The death of the victim occurred while defendant wasengaged in the hijacking of an aircraft.

(5) The victim was a prosecution witness to a murder or other felony committed by the defendant and was killed for the purpose of preventing his testimony against the defendant in any grand jury or criminal proceeding involving such offenses.

29 (6) The defendant committed a killing while in the30 perpetration of a felony.

20170HB1466PN1871

- 5 -

(7) In the commission of the offense the defendant
 knowingly created a grave risk of death to another person in
 addition to the victim of the offense.

4

(8) The offense was committed by means of torture.

5 (9) The defendant has a significant history of felony 6 convictions involving the use or threat of violence to the 7 person.

8 (10) The defendant has been convicted of another Federal 9 or State offense, committed either before or at the time of 10 the offense at issue, for which a sentence of life 11 imprisonment or death was imposable or the defendant was 12 undergoing a sentence of life imprisonment for any reason at 13 the time of the commission of the offense.

14 (11) The defendant has been convicted of another murder 15 committed in any jurisdiction and committed either before or 16 at the time of the offense at issue.

17 (12) The defendant has been convicted of voluntary 18 manslaughter, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 2503 (relating to 19 voluntary manslaughter), or a substantially equivalent crime 20 in any other jurisdiction, committed either before or at the 21 time of the offense at issue.

22 The defendant committed the killing or was an (13)accomplice in the killing, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c) 23 24 (relating to liability for conduct of another; complicity), 25 while in the perpetration of a felony under the provisions of 26 the act of April 14, 1972 (P.L.233, No.64), known as The Controlled Substance, Drug, Device and Cosmetic Act, and 27 28 punishable under the provisions of 18 Pa.C.S. § 7508 29 (relating to drug trafficking sentencing and penalties). 30 (14) At the time of the killing, the victim was or had

20170HB1466PN1871

- 6 -

1 been involved, associated or in competition with the 2 defendant in the sale, manufacture, distribution or delivery 3 of any controlled substance or counterfeit controlled substance in violation of The Controlled Substance, Drug, 4 5 Device and Cosmetic Act or similar law of any other state, 6 the District of Columbia or the United States, and the 7 defendant committed the killing or was an accomplice to the 8 killing as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing 9 resulted from or was related to that association, involvement or competition to promote the defendant's activities in 10 selling, manufacturing, distributing or delivering controlled 11 12 substances or counterfeit controlled substances.

13 (15) At the time of the killing, the victim was or had 14 been a nongovernmental informant or had otherwise provided 15 any investigative, law enforcement or police agency with 16 information concerning criminal activity and the defendant 17 committed the killing or was an accomplice to the killing as 18 defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing was in 19 retaliation for the victim's activities as a nongovernmental 20 informant or in providing information concerning criminal 21 activity to an investigative, law enforcement or police 22 agency.

23

(16) The victim was a child under 12 years of age.

24 (17) At the time of the killing, the victim was in her
25 third trimester of pregnancy or the defendant had knowledge
26 of the victim's pregnancy.

(18) At the time of the killing the defendant was
subject to a court order restricting in any way the
defendant's behavior toward the victim pursuant to 23 Pa.C.S.
Ch. 61 (relating to protection from abuse) or any other order

20170HB1466PN1871

- 7 -

of a court of common pleas or of the minor judiciary designed in whole or in part to protect the victim from the defendant. (e) Mitigating circumstances.--Mitigating circumstances shall include the following:

5 (1) The defendant has no significant history of prior
6 criminal convictions.

7 (2) The defendant was under the influence of extreme8 mental or emotional disturbance.

9 (3) The capacity of the defendant to appreciate the 10 criminality of his conduct or to conform his conduct to the 11 requirements of law was substantially impaired.

12

(4) The age of the defendant at the time of the crime.

13 (5) The defendant acted under extreme duress, although 14 not such duress as to constitute a defense to prosecution 15 under 18 Pa.C.S. § 309 (relating to duress), or acted under 16 the substantial domination of another person.

17 (6) The victim was a participant in the defendant's18 homicidal conduct or consented to the homicidal acts.

19 (7) The defendant's participation in the homicidal act20 was relatively minor.

(8) Any other evidence of mitigation concerning the
character and record of the defendant and the circumstances
of his offense.

24 (f) Sentencing verdict by the jury.--

(1) After hearing all the evidence and receiving the instructions from the court, the jury shall deliberate and render a sentencing verdict. In rendering the verdict, if the sentence is death, the jury shall set forth in such form as designated by the court the findings upon which the sentence is based.

20170HB1466PN1871

- 8 -

(2) Based upon these findings, the jury shall set forth
 in writing whether the sentence is death or life
 imprisonment.

4 (g) Recording sentencing verdict.--Whenever the jury shall
5 agree upon a sentencing verdict, it shall be received and
6 recorded by the court. The court shall thereafter impose upon
7 the defendant the sentence fixed by the jury.

8

(h) Review of death sentence.--

9 (1) A sentence of death shall be subject to automatic 10 review by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania pursuant to its 11 rules.

12 (2) In addition to its authority to correct errors at 13 trial, the Supreme Court shall either affirm the sentence of 14 death or vacate the sentence of death and remand for further 15 proceedings as provided in paragraph (4).

16 (3) The Supreme Court shall affirm the sentence of death 17 unless it determines that:

18 (i) the sentence of death was the product of
19 passion, prejudice or any other arbitrary factor; or

20 (ii) the evidence fails to support the finding of at 21 least one aggravating circumstance specified in 22 subsection (d).

23 (4) If the Supreme Court determines that the death 24 penalty must be vacated because none of the aggravating 25 circumstances are supported by sufficient evidence, then it 26 shall remand for the imposition of a life imprisonment 27 sentence. If the Supreme Court determines that the death 28 penalty must be vacated for any other reason, it shall remand 29 for a new sentencing hearing pursuant to subsections (a) 30 through (g).

20170HB1466PN1871

- 9 -

1 (i) Record of death sentence to Governor.--Where a sentence 2 of death is upheld by the Supreme Court, the prothonotary of the 3 Supreme Court shall transmit to the Governor a full and complete 4 record of the trial, sentencing hearing, imposition of sentence, 5 opinion and order by the Supreme Court within 30 days of one of 6 the following, whichever occurs first:

7 (1) the expiration of the time period for filing a
8 petition for writ of certiorari or extension thereof where
9 neither has been filed;

10 (2) the denial of a petition for writ of certiorari; or
11 (3) the disposition of the appeal by the United States
12 Supreme Court, if that court grants the petition for writ of
13 certiorari.

14 Notice of this transmission shall contemporaneously be provided 15 to the Secretary of Corrections.]

16 Section 3. This act shall apply to defendants and 17 individuals who have not been sentenced as of the effective date 18 of this section.

19 Section 4. This act shall take effect in 60 days.

- 10 -