
THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 1336 Session of
2015

INTRODUCED BY CUTLER, DEAN, M. DALEY, BRIGGS, SIMS, McCARTER,
LAWRENCE, ROSS, KAMPF, EVANKOVICH, ACOSTA, BROWNLEE, DAVIS,
ROZZI, SCHREIBER, DIGIROLAMO, QUINN, DeLISSIO, MULLERY,
VITALI AND O'BRIEN, JUNE 16, 2015

AS REPORTED FROM COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, HOUSE OF
REPRESENTATIVES, AS AMENDED, OCTOBER 20, 2015

A JOINT RESOLUTION

1 Proposing integrated amendments to the Constitution of the
2 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, changing and adding provisions
3 relating to selection of justices and judges.

4 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
5 hereby resolves as follows:

6 Section 1. The following integrated amendments to the
7 Constitution of Pennsylvania are proposed in accordance with
8 Article XI:

9 (1) That section 8(b) of Article IV be amended to read:

10 § 8. Appointing power.

11 * * *

12 (b) [The] Except as provided in Article V, the Governor
13 shall fill vacancies in offices to which he appoints by
14 nominating to the Senate a proper person to fill the vacancy
15 within 90 days of the first day of the vacancy and not
16 thereafter. The Senate shall act on each executive nomination

1 within 25 legislative days of its submission. If the Senate has
2 not voted upon a nomination within 15 legislative days following
3 such submission, any five members of the Senate may, in writing,
4 request the presiding officer of the Senate to place the
5 nomination before the entire Senate body whereby the nomination
6 must be voted upon prior to the expiration of five legislative
7 days or 25 legislative days following submission by the
8 Governor, whichever occurs first. If the nomination is made
9 during a recess or after adjournment sine die, the Senate shall
10 act upon it within 25 legislative days after its return or
11 reconvening. If the Senate for any reason fails to act upon a
12 nomination submitted to it within the required 25 legislative
13 days, the nominee shall take office as if the appointment had
14 been consented to by the Senate. [The] Except as provided in
15 Article V, the Governor shall in a similar manner fill vacancies
16 in the offices of Auditor General, State Treasurer, [justice,
17 judge, justice of the peace] judge, magisterial district judge
18 and in any other elective office he is authorized to fill. In
19 the case of a vacancy in an elective office, a person shall be
20 elected to the office on the next election day appropriate to
21 the office unless the first day of the vacancy is within two
22 calendar months immediately preceding the election day in which
23 case the election shall be held on the second succeeding
24 election day appropriate to the office.

25 * * *

26 (2) That section 13 of Article V be amended to read:

27 § 13. [Election] Selection of justices, judges and [justices of
28 the peace] magisterial district judges; vacancies.

29 (a) [Justices, judges and justices of the peace] Judges,
30 other than judges of the Superior Court and Commonwealth Court,

1 and magisterial district judges shall be elected at the
2 municipal election next preceding the commencement of their
3 respective terms of office by the electors of the [Commonwealth
4 or the] respective districts in which they are to serve.

5 (b) A vacancy in the office of [justice, judge or justice of
6 the peace] judge, other than judge of the Superior Court and
7 Commonwealth Court, or magisterial district judge shall be
8 filled by appointment by the Governor. The appointment shall be
9 with the advice and consent of two-thirds of the members elected
10 to the Senate, except in the case of [justices of the peace]
11 magisterial district judges which shall be by a majority. The
12 person so appointed shall serve for a term ending on the first
13 Monday of January following the next municipal election more
14 than ten months after the vacancy occurs or for the remainder of
15 the unexpired term whichever is less. [, except in the case of
16 persons selected as additional judges to the Superior Court,
17 where the General Assembly may stagger and fix the length of the
18 initial terms of such additional judges by reference to any of
19 the first, second and third municipal elections more than ten
20 months after the additional judges are selected.] The manner by
21 which any additional judges are selected shall be provided by
22 this section for the filling of vacancies in judicial offices.

23 (b.1) (1) A vacancy in the office of justice of the Supreme
24 Court, and judge of the Superior Court and Commonwealth Court,
25 shall be filled by appointment by the Governor. The appointment
26 shall be for the initial term of each justice or judge. The
27 Governor shall nominate to the Senate individuals for
28 appointment exclusively from the list of individuals recommended
29 for appointment by the Appellate Court Nominating Commission
30 described under section 14, and the appointment shall be with

1 the advice and consent of a majority of the members elected to
2 the Senate. Within 30 days after receiving a list of
3 recommendations from the commission, the Governor shall nominate
4 to the Senate one individual from the list to fill the vacancy
5 for which the list was submitted. The Senate shall act on each
6 such nomination within 25 legislative days following the
7 submission. If the nomination is made during a recess or after
8 adjournment sine die, the Senate shall act upon it within 25
9 legislative days after its return or reconvening. If the Senate
10 has not voted upon a nomination within 15 legislative days
11 following submission of the nomination by the Governor or within
12 15 legislative days after its return or reconvening, any five
13 members of the Senate may, in writing, request the presiding
14 officer of the Senate to place the nomination before the entire
15 Senate body whereby the nomination must be voted upon prior to
16 the expiration of 25 legislative days following submission of
17 the nomination by the Governor or five legislative days
18 following the submission of the request by the members,
19 whichever occurs first. If the Senate fails to act upon a
20 nomination submitted under this paragraph, the nominee shall
21 take office as if the appointment had been consented to by the
22 Senate.

23 (2) If the Senate rejects the appointment of a nominee, the
24 Governor shall make a substitute nomination from the
25 commission's list within 30 days after the rejection from the
26 Senate. The Senate shall act upon the nomination in the manner
27 prescribed in paragraph (1). If the Senate rejects a total of
28 three nominations made for a specific vacancy, the commission
29 shall appoint any other individual on the list, the appointee
30 shall take office upon notification of the appointment by the

1 commission, and neither the Governor nor the Senate shall
2 participate further in the appointment process for that vacancy.

3 (c) The provisions of section 13(b) shall not apply either
4 in the case of a vacancy to be filled by retention election as
5 provided in section 15(b), or in the case of a vacancy created
6 by failure of a [justice or] judge to file a declaration for
7 retention election as provided in section 15(b). In the case of
8 a vacancy occurring at the expiration of an appointive term
9 under section 13(b), the vacancy shall be filled by election as
10 provided in section 13(a).

11 [(d) At the primary election in 1969, the electors of the
12 Commonwealth may elect to have the justices and judges of the
13 Supreme, Superior, Commonwealth and all other statewide courts
14 appointed by the Governor from a list of persons qualified for
15 the offices submitted to him by the Judicial Qualifications
16 Commission. If a majority vote of those voting on the question
17 is in favor of this method of appointment, then whenever any
18 vacancy occurs thereafter for any reason in such court, the
19 Governor shall fill the vacancy by appointment in the manner
20 prescribed in this subsection. Such appointment shall not
21 require the consent of the Senate.]

22 (e) Each justice or judge of the Superior Court or
23 Commonwealth Court appointed by the Governor under section
24 [13(d)] 13(b.1) shall hold office for an initial term ending the
25 first Monday of January following the next municipal election
26 more than [24] 48 months following the appointment.

27 (3) That section 14 of Article V be amended to read:
28 § 14. [Judicial Qualifications] Appellate Court Nominating
29 Commission.

30 [(a) Should the method of judicial selection be adopted as

1 provided in section 13 (d), there shall be a Judicial
2 Qualifications Commission, composed of four non-lawyer electors
3 appointed by the Governor and three non-judge members of the bar
4 of the Supreme Court appointed by the Supreme Court. No more
5 than four members shall be of the same political party. The
6 members of the commission shall serve for terms of seven years,
7 with one member being selected each year. The commission shall
8 consider all names submitted to it and recommend to the Governor
9 not fewer than ten nor more than 20 of those qualified for each
10 vacancy to be filled.

11 (b) During his term, no member shall hold a public office or
12 public appointment for which he receives compensation, nor shall
13 he hold office in a political party or political organization.

14 (c) A vacancy on the commission shall be filled by the
15 appointing authority for the balance of the term.]

16 (d) There shall be an independent board within the Executive
17 Department, known as the Appellate Court Nominating Commission,
18 the composition of which shall be as follows:

19 (1) The commission shall be composed of 13 members as
20 follows:

21 (i) Five individuals appointed by the Governor, four of whom
22 shall be members of the bar of the Supreme Court in good
23 standing and one of whom shall not be a member of the bar of the
24 Supreme Court or of any other jurisdiction. The members
25 appointed under this subparagraph shall reside in different
26 counties and no more than three members may be registered in the
27 same political party.

28 (ii) Two individuals appointed by the majority leader of the
29 Senate, one of whom shall be a member of the bar of the Supreme
30 Court in good standing and one of whom shall not be a member of

1 the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other jurisdiction. The
2 members appointed under this subparagraph shall reside in
3 different counties.

4 (iii) Two individuals appointed by the minority leader of
5 the Senate, one of whom shall be a member of the bar of the
6 Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall not be a
7 member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other
8 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
9 shall reside in different counties.

10 (iv) Two individuals appointed by the majority leader of the
11 House of Representatives, one of whom shall be a member of the
12 bar of the Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall
13 not be a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other
14 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
15 shall reside in different counties.

16 (v) Two individuals appointed by the minority leader of the
17 House of Representatives, one of whom shall be a member of the
18 bar of the Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall
19 not be a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other
20 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
21 shall reside in different counties.

22 (2) Except for the initial appointees whose terms shall be
23 staggered as provided by law, the members shall serve for terms
24 of four years. Each member must be at least 18 years of age and
25 a resident of this Commonwealth for at least one year
26 immediately prior to the member's appointment and throughout the
27 member's term on the commission.

28 (3) No member of the commission, during the member's term,
29 may hold office in a political party or political organization,
30 hold an appointed or elected public office, whether compensated

1 or uncompensated, or be an employee of the Commonwealth. An
2 individual who has held any of the foregoing positions within
3 one year prior to the individual's appointment shall not be
4 eligible to serve on the commission. The provisions of this
5 paragraph shall not prohibit a member from serving as a part-
6 time solicitor to a political subdivision.

7 (4) Membership on the commission shall terminate if a member
8 attains a position or characteristic that would have rendered
9 the member ineligible for appointment at the time of the
10 appointment. A vacancy shall be filled by the respective
11 appointing authority for the remainder of the term to which the
12 member was appointed. No member may serve for more than one full
13 term but may be reappointed after a lapse of four years. An
14 appointment of two years or less shall not be deemed a full
15 term. When making appointments, appointing authorities shall
16 consider that the commission should reflect the geographic,
17 racial, ethnic, gender and other diversity of this Commonwealth.
18 The General Assembly may provide for additional qualifications
19 of members of the commission, not inconsistent with this
20 section, as it deems appropriate in furthering the purposes of
21 this article.

22 (5) Members shall not be compensated for their services but
23 may be reimbursed for expenses necessarily incurred in the
24 discharge of their official duties.

25 (e) The Governor shall convene the first meeting of the
26 commission. At that meeting and annually thereafter, the members
27 of the commission shall elect a chairperson from among the
28 members. Except as provided in ~~section 13(e)~~, SUBSECTION (H), <--
29 the commission shall act only with the concurrence of a majority
30 of its members.

1 (f) The commission shall prescribe general rules governing
2 the conduct of members. A member may be removed by the
3 commission for a violation of the rules governing the conduct of
4 members.

5 (g) The commission may appoint staff as it deems necessary,
6 prepare and administer its own budget as provided by law,
7 exercise supervisory and administrative authority over staff and
8 commission functions, establish and promulgate its own rules of
9 procedure, prepare and disseminate an annual report and take
10 other actions as are necessary to ensure its efficient
11 operation. The General Assembly may authorize staff of other
12 Commonwealth agencies to assist the commission in the
13 commission's work. The budget request of the commission shall be
14 submitted to the General Assembly by the Governor as a separate
15 item in the budget of the Executive Department.

16 (h) Whenever a vacancy occurs in the office of justice of
17 the Supreme Court or judge of the Superior Court or Commonwealth
18 Court, the commission shall publicly announce the vacancy and
19 solicit applications for individuals who desire to be considered
20 for the vacancy. The General Assembly shall prescribe the timing
21 for solicitation of applications and the process for evaluation
22 of candidates by the commission. From the applications received,
23 the commission shall agree, by the affirmative votes of at least
24 ten of the members, to a list of five of the most qualified
25 individuals whose names will be submitted to the Governor for
26 consideration for appointment. In comprising the list, the
27 commission shall consider that the appellate courts should
28 reflect the geographic, racial, ethnic, gender and other
29 diversity of this Commonwealth. Only one list shall be compiled
30 for each vacancy. Each individual whose name is submitted to the

1 Governor shall:

2 (1) be a resident of this Commonwealth for at least one year
3 immediately prior to submission of the individual's application;

4 (2) be a licensed member of the bar of the Supreme Court in
5 good standing; and

6 (3) for an aggregate of at least ten years prior to the
7 individual's selection, have either practiced law or been
8 engaged in a law-related occupation.

9 (i) The General Assembly may provide for additional
10 procedures of the commission relating to the nomination of
11 candidates for judicial offices and for additional
12 qualifications of candidates, in both cases not inconsistent
13 with this section, as it deems appropriate in furthering the
14 purposes of this article.

15 (j) Members of the commission and its staff shall be
16 absolutely immune from suit for all conduct in the course of
17 their official duties.

18 (4) That section 15 of Article V be amended to read:

19 § 15. Tenure of justices, judges and [justices of the peace]
20 magisterial district judges.

21 (a) [The] Except as provided in section 13(e), the regular
22 term of office of justices and judges shall be ten years and the
23 regular term of office for judges of the municipal court and
24 traffic court in the City of Philadelphia and of [justices of
25 the peace] magisterial district judges shall be six years. The
26 tenure of any justice or judge shall not be affected by changes
27 in judicial districts or by reduction in the number of judges.

28 (b) A justice ~~of the Supreme Court~~ or judge ~~selected~~ OR <--
29 APPOINTED under section [13(a),] ~~of the Superior Court or~~ <--
30 ~~Commonwealth Court~~ appointed under section ~~[13(d)]~~ 13(b.1) 13 or <--

1 retained under this section 15(b) ~~or a judge elected under~~
2 ~~section 13(a) or retained under this section~~ may file a
3 declaration of candidacy for retention election with the officer
4 of the Commonwealth who under law shall have supervision over
5 elections on or before the first Monday of January of the year
6 preceding the year in which [his] the term of office of the
7 justice or judge expires. If no declaration is filed, a vacancy
8 shall exist upon the expiration of the term of office of such
9 justice or judge, to be filled by [election under section 13(a)
10 or by appointment under section 13(d) if applicable] appointment
11 under section 13(b.1) or by election under section 13(a). If a
12 justice or judge files a declaration, [his name] the name of the
13 justice or judge shall be submitted to the electors without
14 party designation, on a separate judicial ballot or in a
15 separate column on voting machines, at the municipal election
16 immediately preceding the expiration of the term of office of
17 the justice or judge, to determine only the question whether
18 [he] the justice or judge shall be retained in office. If a
19 majority is against retention, a vacancy shall exist upon the
20 expiration of [his] the term of office of that justice or judge,
21 to be filled by appointment under section 13(b) [or under
22 section 13(d) if applicable]. If a majority favors retention,
23 the justice or judge shall serve for the regular term of office
24 provided herein, unless sooner removed or retired. At the
25 expiration of each term a justice or judge shall be eligible for
26 retention as provided herein, subject only to the retirement
27 provisions of this article.

28 Section 2. These proposed constitutional amendments will
29 become effective on January 1 next following approval by the
30 qualified electors of this Commonwealth under section 1 of

1 Article XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania.

2 Section 3. (a) Upon the first passage by the General
3 Assembly of these proposed constitutional amendments, the
4 Secretary of the Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to
5 comply with the advertising requirements of section 1 of Article
6 XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the
7 required advertisements to two newspapers in every county in
8 which such newspapers are published in sufficient time after
9 passage of these proposed constitutional amendments.

10 (b) Upon the second passage by the General Assembly of these
11 proposed constitutional amendments, the Secretary of the
12 Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to comply with the
13 advertising requirements of section 1 of Article XI of the
14 Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the required
15 advertisements to two newspapers in every county in which such
16 newspapers are published in sufficient time after passage of
17 these proposed constitutional amendments. The Secretary of the
18 Commonwealth shall submit the proposed constitutional amendments
19 under section 1 of this resolution to the qualified electors of
20 this Commonwealth as a single ballot question at the first
21 primary, general or municipal election which meets the
22 requirements of and is in conformance with section 1 of Article
23 XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania and which occurs at least
24 three months after the proposed constitutional amendments are
25 passed by the General Assembly.