### As Introduced

# 133rd General Assembly Regular Session

S. B. No. 46

5

# 2019-2020

#### **Senator Eklund**

Cosponsor: Senator Huffman, M.

## A BILL

To amend section 2315.21 of the Revised Code to	1
expand the exemption from punitive or exemplary	2
damages limitations in tort law that is related	3
to certain felony convictions.	4

### BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That section 2315.21 of the Revised Code be

amended to read as follows:	6
Sec. 2315.21. (A) As used in this section:	7
(1) "Tort action" means a civil action for damages for	8
injury or loss to person or property. "Tort action" includes a	9
product liability claim for damages for injury or loss to person	10
or property that is subject to sections 2307.71 to 2307.80 of	11
the Revised Code, but does not include a civil action for	12
damages for a breach of contract or another agreement between	13
persons.	14
(2) "Trier of fact" means the jury or, in a nonjury	15
action, the court.	16
(3) "Home" has the same meaning as in section 3721.10 of	17

S. B. No. 46 Page 2
As Introduced

the	Revised Code.	18

(4) "Employer" includes, but is not limited to, a parent,	19
subsidiary, affiliate, division, or department of the employer.	20
If the employer is an individual, the individual shall be	21
considered an employer under this section only if the subject of	22
the tort action is related to the individual's capacity as an	23
employer.	24

(5) "Small employer" means an employer who employs not

25
more than one hundred persons on a full-time permanent basis,

or, if the employer is classified as being in the manufacturing

27
sector by the North American industrial classification system,

"small employer" means an employer who employs not more than

29
five hundred persons on a full-time permanent basis.

30

- (B)(1) In a tort action that is tried to a jury and in which a plaintiff makes a claim for compensatory damages and a claim for punitive or exemplary damages, upon the motion of any party, the trial of the tort action shall be bifurcated as follows:
- (a) The initial stage of the trial shall relate only to the presentation of evidence, and a determination by the jury, with respect to whether the plaintiff is entitled to recover compensatory damages for the injury or loss to person or property from the defendant. During this stage, no party to the tort action shall present, and the court shall not permit a party to present, evidence that relates solely to the issue of whether the plaintiff is entitled to recover punitive or exemplary damages for the injury or loss to person or property from the defendant.
  - (b) If the jury determines in the initial stage of the

trial that the plaintiff is entitled to recover compensatory	47
damages for the injury or loss to person or property from the	48
defendant, evidence may be presented in the second stage of the	49
trial, and a determination by that jury shall be made, with	50
respect to whether the plaintiff additionally is entitled to	51
recover punitive or exemplary damages for the injury or loss to	52
person or property from the defendant.	53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

- (2) In a tort action that is tried to a jury and in which a plaintiff makes a claim for both compensatory damages and punitive or exemplary damages, the court shall instruct the jury to return, and the jury shall return, a general verdict and, if that verdict is in favor of the plaintiff, answers to an interrogatory that specifies the total compensatory damages recoverable by the plaintiff from each defendant.
- (3) In a tort action that is tried to a court and in which a plaintiff makes a claim for both compensatory damages and punitive or exemplary damages, the court shall make its determination with respect to whether the plaintiff is entitled to recover compensatory damages for the injury or loss to person or property from the defendant and, if that determination is in favor of the plaintiff, shall make findings of fact that specify the total compensatory damages recoverable by the plaintiff from the defendant.
- (C) Subject to division (E) of this section, punitive or exemplary damages are not recoverable from a defendant in question in a tort action unless both of the following apply:
- (1) The actions or omissions of that defendant demonstrate 73 malice or aggravated or egregious fraud, or that defendant as 74 principal or master knowingly authorized, participated in, or 75 ratified actions or omissions of an agent or servant that so 76

demonstrate.	77
(2) The trier of fact has returned a verdict or has made a	78
determination pursuant to division (B)(2) or (3) of this section	79
of the total compensatory damages recoverable by the plaintiff	80
from that defendant.	81
(D)(1) In a tort action, the trier of fact shall determine	82
the liability of any defendant for punitive or exemplary damages	83
and the amount of those damages.	84
(2) Except as provided in division (D)(6) of this section,	85
all of the following apply regarding any award of punitive or	86
exemplary damages in a tort action:	87
(a) The court shall not enter judgment for punitive or	88
exemplary damages in excess of two times the amount of the	89
compensatory damages awarded to the plaintiff from that	90
defendant, as determined pursuant to division (B)(2) or (3) of	91
this section.	92
(b) If the defendant is a small employer or individual,	93
the court shall not enter judgment for punitive or exemplary	94
damages in excess of the lesser of two times the amount of the	95
compensatory damages awarded to the plaintiff from the defendant	96
or ten <pre>percent</pre> per cent of the employer's or individual's net	97
worth when the tort was committed up to a maximum of three	98
hundred fifty thousand dollars, as determined pursuant to	99
division (B)(2) or (3) of this section.	100
(c) Any attorneys attorney's fees awarded as a result of a	101
claim for punitive or exemplary damages shall not be considered	102
for purposes of determining the cap on punitive damages.	103
(3) No award of prejudgment interest under division (C)(1)	104
of section 1343.03 of the Revised Code shall include any	105

prejudgment interest on punitive or exemplary damages found by	106
the trier of fact.	107
(4) In a tort action, the burden of proof shall be upon a	108
plaintiff in question, by clear and convincing evidence, to	109
establish that the plaintiff is entitled to recover punitive or	110
exemplary damages.	111
(5)(a) In any tort action, except as provided in division	112
(D)(5)(b) or (6) of this section, punitive or exemplary damages	113
shall not be awarded against a defendant if that defendant files	114
with the court a certified judgment, judgment entries, or other	115
evidence showing that punitive or exemplary damages have already	116
been awarded and have been collected, in any state or federal	117
court, against that defendant based on the same act or course of	118
conduct that is alleged to have caused the injury or loss to	119
person or property for which the plaintiff seeks compensatory	120
damages and that the aggregate of those previous punitive or	121
exemplary damage awards exceeds the maximum amount of punitive	122
or exemplary damages that may be awarded under division (D)(2)	123
of this section against that defendant in the tort action.	124
(b) Notwithstanding division (D)(5)(a) of this section and	125
except as provided in division (D)(6) of this section, punitive	126
or exemplary damages may be awarded against a defendant in	127
either of the following types of tort actions:	128
(i) In subsequent tort actions involving the same act or	129
course of conduct for which punitive or exemplary damages have	130
already been awarded, if the court determines by clear and	131
convincing evidence that the plaintiff will offer new and	132
substantial evidence of previously undiscovered, additional	133
behavior of a type described in division (C) of this section on	134
the part of that defendant, other than the injury or loss for	135

which the plaintiff seeks compensatory damages. In that case,	136
the court shall make specific findings of fact in the record to	137
support its conclusion. The court shall reduce the amount of any	138
punitive or exemplary damages otherwise awardable pursuant to	139
this section by the sum of the punitive or exemplary damages	140
awards previously rendered against that defendant in any state	141
or federal court. The court shall not inform the jury about the	142
court's determination and action under division (D)(5)(b)(i) of	143
this section.	144
(ii) In subsequent tort actions involving the same act or	145
course of conduct for which punitive or exemplary damages have	146
already been awarded, if the court determines by clear and	147
convincing evidence that the total amount of prior punitive or	148
exemplary damages awards was totally insufficient to punish that	149
defendant's behavior of a type described in division (C) of this	150
section and to deter that defendant and others from similar	151
behavior in the future. In that case, the court shall make	152
specific findings of fact in the record to support its	153
conclusion. The court shall reduce the amount of any punitive or	154
exemplary damages otherwise awardable pursuant to this section	155
by the sum of the punitive or exemplary damages awards	156
previously rendered against that defendant in any state or	157
federal court. The court shall not inform the jury about the	158
court's determination and action under division (D)(5)(b)(ii) of	159
this section.	160
(6) Division (D)(2) of this section does not apply to a	161
tort action where the alleged injury, death, or loss to person	162
or property resulted from the defendant acting with one or more	163

of the culpable mental states of purposely and knowingly as

 $\underline{\text{a law}}$  and when the defendant has been convicted of or pleaded

described in section 2901.22 of the Revised Code in violation of

164

165

guilty to a criminal offense that is a felony, that is a strict	167
criminal liability offense or that had as an element of the	168
offense one or more of the culpable mental states of purposely	169
and knowingly as described in that section 2901.22 of the	170
Revised Code, and that is the basis of the tort action.	171
(E) This section does not apply to tort actions against	172
the state in the court of claims, including, but not limited to,	173
tort actions against a state university or college that are	174
subject to division (B)(1) of section 3345.40 of the Revised	175
Code, to tort actions against political subdivisions of this	176
state that are commenced under or are subject to Chapter 2744.	177
of the Revised Code, or to the extent that another section of	178
the Revised Code expressly provides any of the following:	179
(1) Punitive or exemplary damages are recoverable from a	180
defendant in question in a tort action on a basis other than	181
that the actions or omissions of that defendant demonstrate	182
malice or aggravated or egregious fraud or on a basis other than	183
that the defendant in question as principal or master knowingly	184
authorized, participated in, or ratified actions or omissions of	185
an agent or servant that so demonstrate.	186
(2) Punitive or exemplary damages are recoverable from a	187
defendant in question in a tort action irrespective of whether	188
the plaintiff in question has adduced proof of actual damages.	189
(3) The burden of proof upon a plaintiff in question to	190
recover punitive or exemplary damages from a defendant in	191
question in a tort action is one other than clear and convincing	192
evidence.	193

(4) Punitive or exemplary damages are not recoverable from

a defendant in question in a tort action.

194

S. B. No. 46	Page 8
As Introduced	

(F) If the trier of fact is a jury, the court shall not	196
instruct the jury with respect to the limits on punitive or	197
exemplary damages pursuant to division (D) of this section, and	198
neither counsel for any party or a witness shall inform the jury	199
or potential jurors of those limits.	200
(G) When determining the amount of an award of punitive or	201
exemplary damages against either a home or a residential	202
facility licensed under section 5123.19 of the Revised Code, the	203
trier of fact shall consider all of the following:	204
(1) The ability of the home or residential facility to pay	205
the award of punitive or exemplary damages based on the home's	206
or residential facility's assets, income, and net worth;	207
(2) Whether the amount of punitive or exemplary damages is	208
sufficient to deter future tortious conduct;	209
(3) The financial ability of the home or residential	210
facility, both currently and in the future, to provide	211
accommodations, personal care services, and skilled nursing	212
care.	213
Section 2. That existing section 2315.21 of the Revised	214
Code is hereby repealed.	215