As Reported by the Senate Criminal Justice Committee

131st General Assembly

Regular Session 2015-2016

Am. S. B. No. 162

Senators Seitz, Williams

Cosponsors: Senators Lehner, Balderson, Sawyer, Brown, Hite, Thomas, Yuko, LaRose, Eklund, Schiavoni, Beagle, Tavares, Hackett

A BILL

To amend sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	1
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23	2
and to enact section 2929.025 of the Revised	3
Code to provide that a person convicted of	4
aggravated murder who shows that the person had	5
a serious mental illness at the time of	6
committing the offense cannot be sentenced to	7
death for the offense and to provide a mechanism	8
for resentencing to a life sentence a person	9
previously sentenced to death who proves that	10
the person had a serious mental illness at the	11
time of committing the offense.	12

BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	13
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 be amended and	14
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as	15
follows:	16
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of or pleads quilty	17
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of of predus guilty	± /
to aggravated murder in violation of section 2903.01 of the	18

Revised Code shall suffer death or be imprisoned for life, as	19
determined pursuant to sections 2929.022, 2929.03, and 2929.04	20
of the Revised Code, except that no person who raises the matter	21
of age pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and who	22
is not found to have been eighteen years of age or older at the	23
time of the commission of the offense and no person who raises	24
the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of	25
the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section	26
2929.025 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to	27
be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	28
illness shall suffer death. In addition, the offender may be	29
fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than twenty-	30
five thousand dollars.	31
(B)(1) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(2) or	32
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to	33
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall	34
be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.	35
(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of	36
this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to	37
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the	38
victim of the offense was less than thirteen years of age, and	39
the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual	40
motivation specification that was included in the indictment,	41
count in the indictment, or information charging the offense,	42
the court shall impose an indefinite prison term of thirty years	43
to life pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the	44
Revised Code.	45

(3) If a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder
in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code and also is
47
convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation
48

specification and a sexually violent predator specification that 49 were included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 50 information that charged the murder, the court shall impose upon 51 the offender a term of life imprisonment without parole that 52 shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 53

(4) In addition, the offender may be fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than fifteen thousand dollars.

(C) The court shall not impose a fine or fines for 56 aggravated murder or murder which, in the aggregate and to the 57 extent not suspended by the court, exceeds the amount which the 58 offender is or will be able to pay by the method and within the 59 time allowed without undue hardship to the offender or to the 60 dependents of the offender, or will prevent the offender from 61 making reparation for the victim's wrongful death. 62

(D)(1) In addition to any other sanctions imposed for a 63 violation of section 2903.01 or 2903.02 of the Revised Code, if 64 the offender used a motor vehicle as the means to commit the 65 violation, the court shall impose upon the offender a class two 66 suspension of the offender's driver's license, commercial 67 driver's license, temporary instruction permit, probationary 68 license, or nonresident operating privilege as specified in 69 division (A)(2) of section 4510.02 of the Revised Code. 70

(2) As used in division (D) of this section, "motor 71vehicle" has the same meaning as in section 4501.01 of the 72Revised Code. 73

Sec. 2929.022. (A) If an indictment or count in an 74 indictment charging a defendant with aggravated murder contains 75 a specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 76 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 77

54

Revised Code, the defendant may elect to have the panel of three 78 judges, if the defendant waives trial by jury, or the trial 79 judge, if the defendant is tried by jury, determine the 80 existence of that aggravating circumstance at the sentencing 81 hearing held pursuant to divisions (C) and (D) of section 82 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 83

(1) If the defendant does not elect to have the existence 84 of the aggravating circumstance determined at the sentencing 85 hearing, the defendant shall be tried on the charge of 86 aggravated murder, on the specification of the aggravating 87 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A) (5) of 88 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and on any other 89 specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in division 90 (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code in a single trial as 91 in any other criminal case in which a person is charged with 92 aggravated murder and specifications. 93

(2) If the defendant does elect to have the existence of
94
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in
95
division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code
96
determined at the sentencing hearing, then, following a verdict
97
of guilty of the charge of aggravated murder, the panel of three
98
judges or the trial judge shall:

(a) Hold a sentencing hearing pursuant to division (B) of 100
this section, unless required to do otherwise under division (A) 101
(2) (b) of this section; 102

(b) If the offender raises the matter of age at trial103pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and is not104found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older at105the time of the commission of the offense or raises the matter106of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of the107

alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 108 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to be 109 ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 110 illness, conduct a hearing to determine if the specification of 111 the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in 112 division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven 113 beyond a reasonable doubt. After conducting the hearing, the 114 panel or judge shall proceed as follows: 115 (i) If that aggravating circumstance is proven beyond a 116 reasonable doubt or if the defendant at trial was convicted of 117 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the 118 panel or judge shall impose sentence according to division (E) 119 of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 120 (ii) If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond 121 a reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted 122 of any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, 123 except as otherwise provided in this division, the panel or 124 judge shall impose sentence of life imprisonment with parole 125 eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on the 126 offender. If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond 127 a reasonable doubt, the defendant at trial was not convicted of 128 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the 129 victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of 130 age, and the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a 131 sexual motivation specification that was included in the 132 indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the 133 offense, the panel or judge shall sentence the offender pursuant 134 to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an 135 indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and 136 a maximum term of life imprisonment. 137

(B) At the sentencing hearing, the panel of judges, if the 138 defendant was tried by a panel of three judges, or the trial 139 judge, if the defendant was tried by jury, shall, when required 140 pursuant to division (A)(2) of this section, first determine if 141 the specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 142 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 143 Revised Code is proven beyond a reasonable doubt. If the panel 144 of judges or the trial judge determines that the specification 145 of the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in 146 division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven 147 beyond a reasonable doubt or if they do not determine that the 148 specification is proven beyond a reasonable doubt but the 149 defendant at trial was convicted of a specification of any other 150 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 151 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel of judges or the trial 152judge and trial jury shall impose sentence on the offender 153 pursuant to division (D) of section 2929.03 and section 2929.04 154 of the Revised Code. If the panel of judges or the trial judge 155 does not determine that the specification of the aggravating 156 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A)(5) of 157 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven beyond a 158 reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted of 159 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance listed in 160 division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel 161 of judges or the trial judge shall terminate the sentencing 162 hearing and impose sentence on the offender as follows: 163

(1) Subject to division (B) (2) of this section, the panel
or judge shall impose a sentence of life imprisonment with
parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on
the offender.

(2) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 168

thirteen years of age and the offender also is convicted of or 169 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 170 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 171 information charging the offense, the panel or judge shall 172 sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 173 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term consisting of 174 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 175 176 imprisonment.

Sec. 2929.024. If (A) In a case described in division (B) 177 of this <u>section, if</u> the court determines that the defendant is 178 indigent and that investigation services, experts, or other 179 services are reasonably necessary for the proper representation 180 of a defendant charged with aggravated murder at trial or at the 181 sentencing hearing, the court shall authorize the defendant's 182 counsel to obtain the necessary services for the defendant, and 183 shall order that payment of the fees and expenses for the 184 necessary services be made in the same manner that payment for 185 appointed counsel is made pursuant to Chapter 120. of the 186 Revised Code. If the court determines that the necessary 187 services had to be obtained prior to court authorization for 188 payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services, the 189 court may, after the services have been obtained, authorize the 190 defendant's counsel to obtain the necessary services and order 191 that payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services 192 be made as provided in this section. 193

(B) Division (A) of this section applies in a case in194which either of the following apply:195

(1) The court determines that the defendant is indigent. 196

(2) The defendant is described in division (C) of section1972929.025 of the Revised Code and raises the matter of the198

defendant's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	199
commission of the aggravated murder as described in that	200
division.	201
Sec. 2929.025. (A) As used in this section:	202
(1) A person has a "serious mental illness" if both of the	203
following apply with respect to the person, subject to division	204
(A) (2) of this section:	205
(a) The person has been diagnosed as described in division	206
(B) of this section with one or more of the following	207
<u>conditions:</u>	208
(i) Schizophrenia;	209
(ii) Schizoaffective disorder;	210
(iii) Bipolar disorder;	211
(iv) Major depressive disorder;	212
(v) Delusional disorder.	213
(b) At the time of the alleged aggravated murder with	214
which the person is charged, the condition or conditions	215
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section with which the	216
person has been diagnosed, while not meeting the standard to be	217
found not guilty by reason of insanity as defined in section	218
2901.01 of the Revised Code or the standard to be found	219
incompetent to stand trial as described in division (G) of	220
section 2945.37 of the Revised Code, nevertheless significantly	221
impaired the person's capacity to do one or more of the	222
following:	223
(i) Exercise rational judgment in relation to the person's	224
<u>conduct;</u>	225

(ii) Conform the person's conduct to the requirements of	226
law;	227
(iii) Appreciate the nature, consequences, or wrongfulness	228
of the person's conduct.	229
(2) A disorder manifested primarily by repeated criminal	230
conduct or attributable solely to the acute effects of voluntary	231
use of alcohol or any other drug of abuse does not, standing	232
alone, constitute a "serious mental illness" for purposes of	233
division (A)(1) of this section.	234
(3) "Examiner" means a person who makes an evaluation	235
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section.	236
(4) "Prosecutor" means a prosecuting attorney who has	237
authority to prosecute a charge of aggravated murder that is	238
before the court.	239
(B) The diagnosis of a person with a condition or	240
conditions described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section may	241
be made at any time prior to, on, or after the day of the	242
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged or	243
the day on which the person pursuant to division (C) of this	244
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	245
at the time of the alleged commission of that aggravated murder.	246
Diagnosis of the condition or conditions after the date of the	247
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged does	248
not preclude the person from presenting evidence that the person	249
had a serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	250
commission of that offense or, in the circumstances described in	251
division (C) of this section, from having the benefit of the	252
rebuttable presumption described in that division.	253
(C) A person charged with aggravated murder and one or	254

(C) A person charged with aggravated murder and one or

285

more specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in	255
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code may, before	256
trial, raise the matter of the person's serious mental illness	257
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense. If a	258
person raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	259
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense, the court	260
shall order an evaluation of the person in accordance with	261
division (F) of this section and shall hold a pretrial hearing	262
on the matter. The person who raises the matter may present	263
evidence that the person had a serious mental illness at the	264
time of the alleged commission of the offense, and the person	265
has the burden of raising that matter and of going forward with	266
the evidence relating to the diagnosis described in division (A)	267
(1) (a) of this section and the impairment described in division	268
(A)(1)(b) of this section. If the person submits prima facie	269
evidence that the person has been diagnosed with a condition	270
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	271
condition existed at the time of the alleged commission of the	272
offense, it shall be rebuttably presumed that the condition	273
significantly impaired the person's capacity at the time of the	274
alleged offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b)(i),	275
(ii), or (iii) of this section.	276
(D) If a person described in division (C) of this section	277
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	277
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	270
submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that	280
the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in	281
division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the condition	282
	282
existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,	
the prosecution shall have an opportunity to present evidence to	284

contest the diagnosis, to rebut the presumption that the

condition, if present, significantly impaired the person's	286
capacity at the time of the alleged commission of the offense in	287
a manner described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of	288
this section, or to both contest the diagnosis and rebut the	289
presumption. The prosecution has the burden of proving, by a	290
preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	291
condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	292
was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	293
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	294
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	295
division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section.	296
(E) If a person described in division (B) of this section	297
	297
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	299
submits prima facie evidence as described in that division that	300
the person has been diagnosed with a condition described in	301
division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the condition	302
existed at the time of the alleged commission of the offense,	303
one of the following applies:	304
(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that	305
the prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,	306
that the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A)(1)	307
(a) of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or	308
that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the	309
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	310
described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this	311
section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is	312
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	313
<u>illness.</u>	314
(2) If the court at the pretrial hearing finds that the	315
	-

prosecution has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that	316
the diagnosis of the condition described in division (A)(1)(a)	317
of this section that was made of the person was erroneous or	318
that the condition, if present, did not significantly impair the	319
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	320
described in division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this	321
section, one of the following applies:	322
(a) If the aggravated murder charge is not to be tried by	323
a jury, the court shall issue a finding that the person is not	324
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	325
illness.	326
(b) If the aggravated murder charge is to be tried by a	327
jury, the person may request that the matter of serious mental	328
illness be submitted to the jury at trial. If the person does	329
not request that the matter be submitted to the jury, the court	330
shall issue a finding that the person is not ineligible for a	331
sentence of death due to serious mental illness. If the person	332
requests that the matter be submitted to the jury, the matter	333
shall be submitted to the jury at trial, the procedures and	334
rules regarding introduction of evidence and burden of proof at	335
the pretrial hearing that are set forth in divisions (C) and (D)	336
of this section apply, and the person in accordance with those	337
procedures and rules may introduce all relevant evidence,	338
including, but not limited to evidence that is different from or	339
in addition to the evidence introduced at the pretrial hearing.	340
If the matter is submitted to the jury at trial, one of the	341
following applies:	342
(i) Unless the jury finds that the prosecution has proved,	343
by a preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	344
condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	345

was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	346
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	347
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	348
division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, the court	349
shall issue a finding that the person is ineligible for a	350
sentence of death due to serious mental illness.	351
(ii) If the jury finds that the prosecution has proved, by	352
a preponderance of the evidence, that the diagnosis of the	353
condition described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section that	354
was made of the person was erroneous or that the condition, if	355
present, did not significantly impair the person's capacity at	356
the time of the alleged offense in a manner described in	357
division (A)(1)(b)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, the court	358
shall issue a finding that the person is not ineligible for a	359
contained of death due to conjour mental illness	360
sentence of death due to serious mental illness.	500
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this	361
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this	361
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	361 362
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	361 362 363
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an	361 362 363 364
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code	361 362 363 364 365
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this	361 362 363 364 365 366
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division.	361 362 363 364 365 366 367
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation	361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial	361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E)	361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to the person's serious mental illness	361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370 371
(F) (1) If a person described in division (C) of this section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder as described in that division, the court shall order an evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this division. (2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation ordered under division (F) (1) of this section or in a pretrial hearing or a proceeding before a jury under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370 371 372

<u>prosecutor or defense counsel may call as a witness any examiner</u>	376
who evaluated the person or prepared a report pursuant to a	377
referral under this section. Neither the appointment nor the	378
testimony of an examiner in an evaluation ordered under division	379
(F)(1) of this section precludes the prosecutor or defense	380
counsel from calling other witnesses or presenting other	381
evidence on the issue of the person's serious mental illness at	382
the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder or	383
on competency or insanity issues.	384
(G) A person's pleading of not guilty by reason of	385
insanity or incompetence to stand trial, or a finding after such	386
a plea that the person is not insane or that the person is	387
competent to stand trial, does not preclude the person from	388
raising the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	389
time of the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to	390
division (C) of this section and, if a person so raises that	391
matter, does not limit or affect any of the procedures described	392
in this section or the authority of a court to make any finding	393
described in this section.	394
Sec. 2929.03. (A) If the indictment or count in the	395
indictment charging aggravated murder does not contain one or	396
more specifications of aggravating circumstances listed in	397
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, then,	398
following a verdict of guilty of the charge of aggravated	399
murder, the trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as	400
follows:	401
(1) Except as provided in division (A)(2) of this section,	402
the trial court shall impose one of the following sentences on	403
the offender:	404

(a) Life imprisonment without parole;

Page 14

(b) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment;

(c) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five
full years of imprisonment;
411

(d) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full
413
years of imprisonment;
414

(e) If the victim of the appravated murder was less than 415 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 416 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 417 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 418 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 419 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 420 offender pursuant to division (A)(1)(a) of this section, the 421 trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) 422 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term 423 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 424 425 of life imprisonment that shall be served pursuant to that section. 426

(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
427
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
428
predator specification that are included in the indictment,
429
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
430
aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the
431
offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that
432
shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(B) If the indictment or count in the indictment charging 434

408

406

aggravated murder contains one or more specifications of435aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section4362929.04 of the Revised Code, the verdict shall separately state437whether all of the following:438

(1) Whether the accused is found guilty or not guilty of the principal charge and, if ;

(2) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the 441 offender was eighteen years of age or older at the time of the 442 commission of the offense, if the matter of age was raised by 443 the offender pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, 444 and whether ; 445

(3) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the446offender was found under section 2929.025 of the Revised Code to447be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental448illness if the matter of serious mental illness at the time of449the commission of the offense was raised by the offender450pursuant to that section;451

(4) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the452offender is guilty or not guilty of each specification. The453

The jury shall be instructed on its duties in this regard.454The instruction to the jury shall include an instruction that a455specification shall be proved beyond a reasonable doubt in order456to support a guilty verdict on the specification, but the457instruction shall not mention the penalty that may be the458consequence of a guilty or not guilty verdict on any charge or459specification.460

(C) (1) If the indictment or count in the indictment
461
charging aggravated murder contains one or more specifications
462
of aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section
463

2929.04 of the Revised Code, then, following a verdict of guilty 464 of the charge but not quilty of each of the specifications, and 465 regardless of whether the offender raised the matter of age 466 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or the matter 467 of serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the 468 offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code, the 469 470 trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as follows: (a) Except as provided in division (C) (1) (b) of this 471 section, the trial court shall impose one of the following 472 sentences on the offender: 473 (i) Life imprisonment without parole; 474 (ii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 475 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty 476 years of imprisonment; 477 (iii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 478 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-479 five full years of imprisonment; 480 (iv) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 481 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty 482 full years of imprisonment; 483 484 (v) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 485 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 486 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 487 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 488 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 489 offender pursuant to division (C)(1)(a)(i) of this section, the 490 trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) 491 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term 492 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term
of life imprisonment.
 (b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
predator specification that are included in the indictment,
count in the indictment, or information that charged the

aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the 499 offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that 500 shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 501

(2) (a) If the indictment or count in the indictment 502 contains one or more specifications of aggravating circumstances 503 listed in division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code 504 and if the offender is found guilty of both the charge and one 505 or more of the specifications, the penalty to be imposed on the 506 offender shall be one of the following: 507

(i) Except as provided in division (C) (2) (a) (ii) or (iii), 508
and subject to division (D) (1) and (E), of this section, the 509
penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be death, life 510
imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment with parole 511
eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 512
imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 513
serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 514

(ii) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(iii) of this 515 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 516 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 517 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 518 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 519 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 520 impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment without parole 521 on the offender pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i) of this 522

493

494

495

496

497

section, the penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be an 523 indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and 524 a maximum term of life imprisonment that shall be imposed 525 pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised 526 Code and served pursuant to that section. 527

(iii) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads
guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually
violent predator specification that are included in the
indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged
the aggravated murder, the penalty to be imposed on the offender
shall be death or life imprisonment without parole that shall be
served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(b) A penalty imposed pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i),
(ii), or (iii) of this section shall be determined pursuant to
divisions (D) and (E) of this section and shall be determined by
537
one of the following:

(i) By the panel of three judges that tried the offender upon the offender's waiver of the right to trial by jury;

(ii) By the trial jury and the trial judge, if theoffender was tried by jury.542

(D) (1) Death may not be imposed as a penalty for 543 aggravated murder if the offender raised the matter of age at 544 trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and was 545 not found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older 546 at the time of the commission of the offense or raised the 547 matter of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of 548 the commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of 549 the Revised Code and was found under that section to be 550 ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 551

539

illness. When death may be imposed as a penalty for aggravated 552 murder, the court shall proceed under this division. When death 553 may be imposed as a penalty, the court, upon the request of the 554 defendant, shall require a pre-sentence investigation to be made 555 and, upon the request of the defendant, shall require a mental 556 examination to be made, and shall require reports of the 557 investigation and of any mental examination submitted to the 558 court, pursuant to section 2947.06 of the Revised Code. No 559 statement made or information provided by a defendant in a 560 mental examination or proceeding conducted pursuant to this 561 division shall be disclosed to any person, except as provided in 562 this division, or be used in evidence against the defendant on 563 the issue of quilt in any retrial. A pre-sentence investigation 564 or mental examination shall not be made except upon request of 565 the defendant. Copies of any reports prepared under this 566 division shall be furnished to the court, to the trial jury if 567 the offender was tried by a jury, to the prosecutor, and to the 568 offender or the offender's counsel for use under this division. 569 The court, and the trial jury if the offender was tried by a 570 jury, shall consider any report prepared pursuant to this 571 division and furnished to it and any evidence raised at trial 572 that is relevant to the aggravating circumstances the offender 573 was found guilty of committing or to any factors in mitigation 574 of the imposition of the sentence of death, shall hear testimony 575 and other evidence that is relevant to the nature and 576 circumstances of the aggravating circumstances the offender was 577 found quilty of committing, the mitigating factors set forth in 578 division (B) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and any 579 other factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of

580 death, and shall hear the statement, if any, of the offender, 581 and the arguments, if any, of counsel for the defense and 582

prosecution, that are relevant to the penalty that should be

Page 20

imposed on the offender. The defendant shall be given great 584 latitude in the presentation of evidence of the mitigating 585 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 586 Revised Code and of any other factors in mitigation of the 587 imposition of the sentence of death. If the offender chooses to 588 make a statement, the offender is subject to cross-examination 589 590 only if the offender consents to make the statement under oath or affirmation. 591

The defendant shall have the burden of going forward with the evidence of any factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of death. The prosecution shall have the burden of proving, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating circumstances the defendant was found guilty of committing are sufficient to outweigh the factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of death.

(2) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 599 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 600 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 601 pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, the trial jury, if 602 the offender was tried by a jury, shall determine whether the 603 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of 604 committing are sufficient to outweigh the mitigating factors 605 present in the case. If the trial jury unanimously finds, by 606 proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating 607 circumstances the offender was found quilty of committing 608 outweigh the mitigating factors, the trial jury shall recommend 609 to the court that the sentence of death be imposed on the 610 offender. Absent such a finding, the jury shall recommend that 611 the offender be sentenced to one of the following: 612

(a) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(b) or (c) of

Page 21

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

this section, to life imprisonment without parole, life614imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five615full years of imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole616eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment;617

(b) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(c) of this 618 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 619 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 620 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 621 622 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the offense, and the jury does not 623 624 recommend a sentence of life imprisonment without parole pursuant to division (D)(2)(a) of this section, to an indefinite 625 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 626 term of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B) 627 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant 628 to that section. 629

(c) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
for specification that are included in the indictment,
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
aggravated murder, to life imprisonment without parole.

If the trial jury recommends that the offender be 635 sentenced to life imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment 636 with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 637 imprisonment, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 638 serving thirty full years of imprisonment, or an indefinite term 639 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 640 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B)(3) 641 of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code, the court shall impose 642 the sentence recommended by the jury upon the offender. If the 643

sentence is an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of 644 thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment imposed as 645 described in division (D)(2)(b) of this section or a sentence of 646 life imprisonment without parole imposed under division (D)(2) 647 (c) of this section, the sentence shall be served pursuant to 648 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. If the trial jury 649 recommends that the sentence of death be imposed upon the 650 offender, the court shall proceed to impose sentence pursuant to 651 division (D)(3) of this section. 652

(3) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 653 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 654 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 655 to the court pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, if, 656 after receiving pursuant to division (D)(2) of this section the 657 trial jury's recommendation that the sentence of death be 658 imposed, the court finds, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, or 659 if the panel of three judges unanimously finds, by proof beyond 660 a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating circumstances the 661 offender was found guilty of committing outweigh the mitigating 662 factors, it shall impose sentence of death on the offender. 663 Absent such a finding by the court or panel, the court or the 664 panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the 665 offender: 666

(a) Except as provided in division (D) (3) (b) of thissection, one of the following:668

(i) Life imprisonment without parole; 669

(ii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twentyfive full years of imprisonment;
672

(iii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty
full years of imprisonment;
675

(iv) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 676 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 677 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 678 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 679 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 680 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 681 682 offender pursuant to division (D)(3)(a)(i) of this section, the court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division 683 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite 684 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 685 term of life imprisonment. 686

(b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent predator specification that are included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged the aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(E) If the offender raised the matter of age at trial-693 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, was convicted 694 of aggravated murder and one or more specifications of an 695 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 696 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and if the offender either raised 697 the matter of age at trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the 698 <u>Revised Code</u> and was not found at trial to have been eighteen 699 years of age or older at the time of the commission of the 700 offense or raised the matter of the offender's serious mental 701 illness at the time of the commission of the offense pursuant to 702

687

688

689

690

691

section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and was found under that	703
section to be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious	704
mental illness, the court or the panel of three judges shall not	705
impose a sentence of death on the offender. Instead, the court	706
or panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the	707
offender:	708
(1) Except as provided in division (E)(2) of this section,	709
one of the following:	710
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	711
(b) Subject to division (E) $\frac{(2)}{(1)}$ (d) of this section, life	712
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	713
full years of imprisonment;	714
(c) Subject to division (E) $\frac{(2)}{(1)}$ (d) of this section, life	715
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full	716
years of imprisonment;	717
(d) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	718
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	719
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	720
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	721
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	722
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	723
offender pursuant to division (E) $\frac{(2)(1)}{(2)}$ (a) of this section, the	724
court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division	725
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite	726
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	727
term of life imprisonment.	728
(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	729

to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 730 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 731

count in the indictment, or information that charged the732aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall733be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.734

(F) The court or the panel of three judges, when it 735 imposes sentence of death, shall state in a separate opinion its 736 specific findings as to the existence of any of the mitigating 737 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 738 Revised Code, the existence of any other mitigating factors, the 739 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of 740 741 committing, and the reasons why the aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing were sufficient to 742 outweigh the mitigating factors. The court or panel, when it 743 imposes life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting of a 744 minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 745 imprisonment under division (D) of this section, shall state in 746 a separate opinion its specific findings of which of the 747 mitigating factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 748 of the Revised Code it found to exist, what other mitigating 749 factors it found to exist, what appravating circumstances the 750 offender was found guilty of committing, and why it could not 751 find that these aggravating circumstances were sufficient to 752 outweigh the mitigating factors. For cases in which a sentence 753 of death is imposed for an offense committed before January 1, 754 1995, the court or panel shall file the opinion required to be 755 prepared by this division with the clerk of the appropriate 756 court of appeals and with the clerk of the supreme court within 757 fifteen days after the court or panel imposes sentence. For 758 cases in which a sentence of death is imposed for an offense 759 committed on or after January 1, 1995, the court or panel shall 760 file the opinion required to be prepared by this division with 761 the clerk of the supreme court within fifteen days after the 762

court or panel imposes sentence. The judgment in a case in which 763 a sentencing hearing is held pursuant to this section is not 764 final until the opinion is filed. 765

(G)(1) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges 766 imposes a sentence of death for an offense committed before 767 January 1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is 768 rendered shall deliver the entire record in the case to the 769 770 appellate court.

771 (2) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges imposes a sentence of death for an offense committed on or after January 1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is rendered shall deliver the entire record in the case to the supreme court.

Sec. 2929.04. (A) Imposition of the death penalty for 776 aggravated murder is precluded unless one or more of the 777 following is specified in the indictment or count in the 778 indictment pursuant to section 2941.14 of the Revised Code and 779 proved beyond a reasonable doubt: 780

(1) The offense was the assassination of the president of 781 782 the United States or a person in line of succession to the presidency, the governor or lieutenant governor of this state, 783 the president-elect or vice president-elect of the United 784 States, the governor-elect or lieutenant governor-elect of this 785 state, or a candidate for any of the offices described in this 786 division. For purposes of this division, a person is a candidate 787 if the person has been nominated for election according to law, 788 if the person has filed a petition or petitions according to law 789 to have the person's name placed on the ballot in a primary or 790 general election, or if the person campaigns as a write-in 791 candidate in a primary or general election. 792

772

773

774

Page 28

793

(2) The offense was committed for hire.

(3) The offense was committed for the purpose of escaping
detection, apprehension, trial, or punishment for another
offense committed by the offender.
796

(4) The offense was committed while the offender was under 797 detention or while the offender was at large after having broken 798 detention. As used in division (A)(4) of this section, 799 "detention" has the same meaning as in section 2921.01 of the 800 Revised Code, except that detention does not include 801 hospitalization, institutionalization, or confinement in a 802 mental health facility or mental retardation and developmentally 803 disabled facility unless at the time of the commission of the 804 offense either of the following circumstances apply: 805

(a) The offender was in the facility as a result of being806charged with a violation of a section of the Revised Code.807

(b) The offender was under detention as a result of being
 convicted of or pleading guilty to a violation of a section of
 809
 the Revised Code.
 810

(5) Prior to the offense at bar, the offender was
811
convicted of an offense an essential element of which was the
purposeful killing of or attempt to kill another, or the offense
at bar was part of a course of conduct involving the purposeful
killing of or attempt to kill two or more persons by the
offender.

(6) The victim of the offense was a law enforcement
817
officer, as defined in section 2911.01 of the Revised Code, whom
818
the offender had reasonable cause to know or knew to be a law
819
enforcement officer as so defined, and either the victim, at the
820
time of the commission of the offense, was engaged in the
821

victim's duties, or it was the offender's specific purpose to 822
kill a law enforcement officer as so defined. 823

(7) The offense was committed while the offender was 824
committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after 825
committing or attempting to commit kidnapping, rape, aggravated 826
arson, aggravated robbery, or aggravated burglary, and either 827
the offender was the principal offender in the commission of the 828
aggravated murder or, if not the principal offender, committed 829
the aggravated murder with prior calculation and design. 830

(8) The victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to 831 an offense who was purposely killed to prevent the victim's 832 testimony in any criminal proceeding and the aggravated murder 833 was not committed during the commission, attempted commission, 834 or flight immediately after the commission or attempted 835 commission of the offense to which the victim was a witness, or 836 the victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to an offense 837 and was purposely killed in retaliation for the victim's 838 testimony in any criminal proceeding. 839

(9) The offender, in the commission of the offense,
purposefully caused the death of another who was under thirteen
years of age at the time of the commission of the offense, and
either the offender was the principal offender in the commission
of the offense or, if not the principal offender, committed the
offense with prior calculation and design.

(10) The offense was committed while the offender was
 committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after
 847
 committing or attempting to commit terrorism.
 848

(B) If one or more of the aggravating circumstances listed849in division (A) of this section is specified in the indictment850

or count in the indictment and proved beyond a reasonable doubt,

and if the offender did not raise the matter of age pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or $\frac{1}{1000}$ the offender after raising the that matter of age, was found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older at the time of the commission of the offense, and if the offender did not raise the matter of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code or the offender after raising that matter was found by the court to not be ineligible for a sentence of death, the court, trial jury, or panel of three judges shall consider, and weigh against the appravating circumstances proved beyond a reasonable doubt, the nature and circumstances of the offense, the history, character, and background of the offender, and all of the following factors: (1) Whether the victim of the offense induced or facilitated it; (2) Whether it is unlikely that the offense would have been committed, but for the fact that the offender was under

(3) Whether, at the time of committing the offense, the
871
offender, because of a mental disease or defect, lacked
872
substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the
873
offender's conduct or to conform the offender's conduct to the
874
requirements of the law;
875

(4) The youth of the offender;

duress, coercion, or strong provocation;

(5) The offender's lack of a significant history of prior877criminal convictions and delinquency adjudications;878

(6) If the offender was a participant in the offense but 879

851

852

853

854

855

856

857

858

859

860

861

862

863

864

865

866

867

868

869

870

not the principal offender, the degree of the offender's 880 participation in the offense and the degree of the offender's 881 participation in the acts that led to the death of the victim; 882

(7) Any other factors that are relevant to the issue of883whether the offender should be sentenced to death.884

(C) The defendant shall be given great latitude in the
presentation of evidence of the factors listed in division (B)
of this section and of any other factors in mitigation of the
887
imposition of the sentence of death.

The existence of any of the mitigating factors listed in 889 division (B) of this section does not preclude the imposition of 890 a sentence of death on the offender but shall be weighed 891 pursuant to divisions (D)(2) and (3) of section 2929.03 of the 892 Revised Code by the trial court, trial jury, or the panel of 893 three judges against the aggravating circumstances the offender 894 was found guilty of committing. 895

Sec. 2929.06. (A) (1) If a sentence of death imposed upon896an offender is set aside, nullified, or vacated because the , or897voided for any of the following reasons, the trial court that898sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the899offender in accordance with division (A) (2) of this section:900

(a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of901death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1,9021995, or the supreme court, in cases a case in which the supreme903court reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the904sentence of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05905of the Revised Code, is set aside, nullified, or vacated for906the;907

(b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for 908

imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections	909
2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional $ au_{i}$	910
(c) The sentence of death is set aside, nullified, or	911
vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the	912
Revised Code , or is set aside, nullified, or vacated because a <u>;</u>	913
(d) A court has determined that the offender is mentally	914
retarded under standards set forth in decisions of the supreme	915
court of this state or the United States supreme court, the	916
trial court that sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing	917
to resentence the offender;	918
(e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to	919
division (G) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.	920
(2) At the a resentencing hearing conducted under division	921
(A)(1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender	922
a sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting	923
of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	924
imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division.	925
If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the	926
time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the	927
sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a	928
sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life	929
imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term	930
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	931
of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or	932
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served	933
pursuant to that section, the court shall impose the sentence so	934
required. In all other cases, the sentences of life imprisonment	935
that are available at the hearing, and from which the court	936
shall impose sentence, shall be the same sentences of life	937
imprisonment that were available under division (D) of section	938

2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time939the offender committed the offense for which the sentence of940death was imposed. Nothing in this division regarding the941resentencing of an offender shall affect the operation of942section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.943

(B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court 944 sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed 945 upon an offender because of error that occurred in the 946 947 sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the 948 offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender. 949 If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall 950 impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by 951 a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new 952 panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing, 953 the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in 954 division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in 955 determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of 956 death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term 957 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 958 of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court 959 or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a 960 sentence of death, the court or panel shall impose upon the 961 offender one of the sentences of life imprisonment that could 962 have been imposed at the time the offender committed the offense 963 for which the sentence of death was imposed, determined as 964 specified in this division, or an indefinite term consisting of 965 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 966 imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 967 If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the 968 time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the 969

sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a 970 sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life 971 imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term 972 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 973 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or 974 (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served 975 pursuant to that section, the court or panel shall impose the 976 sentence so required. In all other cases, the sentences of life 977 978 imprisonment that are available at the hearing, and from which the court or panel shall impose sentence, shall be the same 979 sentences of life imprisonment that were available under 980 division (D) of section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the 981 Revised Code at the time the offender committed the offense for 982 which the sentence of death was imposed. 983

(C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 984 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 985 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 986 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the 987 sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 988 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 989 990 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 991 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 992 full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole 993 eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 994

(D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights
995
of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or
996
vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of
997
that nature otherwise would be available.
998

(E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th

general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been 1000 sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed 1001 on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was 1002 committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by 1003 H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to 1004 all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after 1005 March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are 1006 challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence 1007 of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court 1008 of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23, 1009 2005, have not yet been resentenced. 1010

Sec. 2953.21. (A) (1) (a) <u>A person in any of the following</u> <u>categories may file a petition in the court that imposed</u> <u>sentence, stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking</u> <u>the court to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to</u> <u>grant other appropriate relief:</u>

(i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal1016offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that1017there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights1018as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio1019Constitution or the Constitution of the United States, and any;1020

(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal 1021 offense that is a felony and who is an offender for whom DNA 1022 testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of 1023 the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised 1024 Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of 1025 all available admissible evidence related to the person's case 1026 as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised 1027 Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing 1028 evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the 1029

Page 35

1011

1012

1013

1014

person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and 1030 convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating 1031 circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of 1032 committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of 1033 death, may file a petition in the court that imposed sentence, 1034 1035 stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant-1036 1037 other appropriate relief; (iii) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated 1038 murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims 1039 that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the 1040 commission of the offense and that as a result the court should 1041 render void the sentence of death. 1042 The (b) A petitioner under division (A)(1)(a) of this 1043 section may file a supporting affidavit and other documentary 1044 evidence in support of the claim for relief. 1045 $\frac{(b)}{(c)}$ As used in division (A) (1) (a) of this section, 1046 "actual : 1047 (i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the 1048 DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the 1049 Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code 1050 1051 been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of all available 1052 admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in 1053 division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no 1054 reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner quilty of 1055 the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the 1056 person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would 1057 have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance 1058 or circumstances the petitioner was found guilty of committing 1059

6, 2010.

and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death.
 (ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in
 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code.
 (c) (d) As used in divisions (A) (1) (a) and (b) (c) of this
 section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means
 section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July

1067 (2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, a petition under division (A)(1)(a)(i) or (ii) 1068 of this section shall be filed no later than three hundred 1069 sixty-five days after the date on which the trial transcript is 1070 filed in the court of appeals in the direct appeal of the 1071 judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the direct appeal 1072 involves a sentence of death, the date on which the trial 1073 transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal is taken, 1074 except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised 1075 Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three hundred 1076 sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for filing the 1077 1078 appeal.

(b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of1079the Revised Code, a petition under division (A) (1) (a) (iii) of1080this section shall be filed not later than three hundred sixty-1081five days after the effective date of this amendment.1082

(3) In a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i) or
(ii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to death
1083
(iii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to death
1084
may ask the court to render void or voidable the judgment with
1085
respect to the conviction of aggravated murder or the
specification of an aggravating circumstance or the sentence of
1087
death. A person who has been sentenced to death who files a
1088

Page 37

1060

1061

1062

1063

1064

1065

petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iii) of this section may ask 1089 the court to render void the sentence of death and to order the 1090 resentencing of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06 1091 of the Revised Code. 1092 (4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended 1093 petition filed under division (A) of this section all grounds 1094 for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided in 1095 section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any ground for relief that 1096 is not so stated in the petition is waived. 1097 (5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 1098 (A) (1) (a) (i) or (ii) of this section was convicted of or pleaded 1099 quilty to a felony, the petition may include a claim that the 1100 petitioner was denied the equal protection of the laws in 1101 violation of the Ohio Constitution or the United States 1102 Constitution because the sentence imposed upon the petitioner 1103 for the felony was part of a consistent pattern of disparity in 1104 sentencing by the judge who imposed the sentence, with regard to 1105 the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic background, or religion. 1106 If the supreme court adopts a rule requiring a court of common 1107 pleas to maintain information with regard to an offender's race, 1108 gender, ethnic background, or religion, the supporting evidence 1109 for the petition shall include, but shall not be limited to, a 1110 copy of that type of information relative to the petitioner's 1111 sentence and copies of that type of information relative to 1112 sentences that the same judge imposed upon other persons. 1113

(B) The clerk of the court in which the petition is filed
1114
shall docket the petition and bring it promptly to the attention
of the court. The clerk of the court in which the petition is
filed immediately shall forward a copy of the petition to the
prosecuting attorney of that county.

(C) The court shall consider a petition that is timely 1119 filed under division (A)(2) of this section even if a direct 1120 appeal of the judgment is pending. Before granting a hearing on 1121 a petition filed under division (A) of this section, the court 1122 shall determine whether there are substantive grounds for 1123 relief. In making such a determination, the court shall 1124 consider, in addition to the petition, the supporting 1125 affidavits, and the documentary evidence, all the files and 1126 records pertaining to the proceedings against the petitioner, 1127 including, but not limited to, the indictment, the court's 1128 journal entries, the journalized records of the clerk of the 1129 court, and the court reporter's transcript. The court reporter's 1130 transcript, if ordered and certified by the court, shall be 1131 taxed as court costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it 1132 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law with 1133 respect to such dismissal. 1134

(D) Within ten days after the docketing of the petition,
or within any further time that the court may fix for good cause
1136
shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or
1137
motion. Within twenty days from the date the issues are raised,
either party may move for summary judgment. The right to summary
judgment shall appear on the face of the record.

(E) Unless the petition and the files and records of the 1141 case show the petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court 1142 shall proceed to a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct 1143 appeal of the case is pending. If the court notifies the parties 1144 that it has found grounds for granting relief, either party may 1145 request an appellate court in which a direct appeal of the 1146 judgment is pending to remand the pending case to the court. 1147

With respect to a petition filed under division (A)(1)(a) 1148

(iii) of this section, the procedures and rules regarding	1149
introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the pretrial	1150
hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and (F) of	1151
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering the	1152
petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for	1153
granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one	1154
or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of	1155
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of	1156
the aggravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of	1157
death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the	1158
person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b)	1159
(i), (ii), or (iii) of that section.	1160

(F) At any time before the answer or motion is filed, the
petitioner may amend the petition with or without leave or
prejudice to the proceedings. The petitioner may amend the
petition with leave of court at any time thereafter.

(G) If the court does not find grounds for granting 1165 relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions 1166 of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition. 1167 If no direct appeal of the case is pending and the court finds 1168 grounds for relief or if a pending direct appeal of the case has 1169 been remanded to the court pursuant to a request made pursuant 1170 to division (E) of this section and the court finds grounds for 1171 granting relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and 1172 conclusions of law and shall enter a judgment that vacates and 1173 sets aside the judgment in question, and, in the case of a 1174 petitioner who is a prisoner in custody, except as otherwise 1175 described in this division, shall discharge or resentence the 1176 petitioner or grant a new trial as the court determines 1177 appropriate. If the court finds grounds for relief in the case 1178 of a petitioner who filed a petition under division (A)(1)(a) 1179

(iii) of this section, the court shall render void the sentence 1180 of death and order the resentencing of the offender under 1181 division (A) of section 2929.06 of the Revised Code. The court 1182 also may make supplementary orders to the relief granted, 1183 concerning such matters as rearraignment, retrial, custody, and 1184 bail. If the trial court's order granting the petition is 1185 reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of the case has been 1186 remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a request under 1187 division (E) of this section, the appellate court reversing the 1188 order granting the petition shall notify the appellate court in 1189 which the direct appeal of the case was pending at the time of 1190 the remand of the reversal and remand of the trial court's 1191 order. Upon the reversal and remand of the trial court's order 1192 granting the petition, regardless of whether notice is sent or 1193 received, the direct appeal of the case that was remanded is 1194 reinstated. 1195

(H) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A)
of this section by a person sentenced to death, only the supreme
court may stay execution of the sentence of death.

(I) (1) If a person sentenced to death intends to file a 1199 petition under this section, the court shall appoint counsel to 1200 represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent 1201 and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or 1202 is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or 1203 reject the appointment of counsel. The court may decline to 1204 appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a 1205 hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of 1206 counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision 1207 or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. 1208

(2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division 1209

(I) (1) of this section an attorney who represented the 1210 petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates 1211 unless the person and the attorney expressly request the 1212 appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division 1213 (I) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified under 1214 Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of Ohio 1215 to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted of an 1216 offense for which the death penalty can be or has been imposed. 1217 The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during 1218 proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds for 1219 relief in a proceeding under this section, in an appeal of any 1220 action under this section, or in an application to reopen a 1221 direct appeal. 1222

(3) Division (I) of this section does not preclude 1223 attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the 1224 provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that 1225 were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July 1226 1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were 1227 represented in proceedings under this section by one or more 1228 counsel appointed by the court under this section or section 1229 120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those 1230 appointed counsel meet the requirements of division (I)(2) of 1231 this section. 1232

(J) Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony that 1233 is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the remedy 1234 set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by which a 1235 person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity of a 1236 conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the validity of 1237 an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for the 1238 commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if 1239 committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of 1240

Page 43

1241

1249

disposition.

Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a 1242 petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, 1243 a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration 1244 of the period prescribed in division (A) of that section or a 1245 second petition or successive petitions for similar relief on 1246 behalf of a petitioner unless division (A)(1) or (2) of this 1247 section applies: 1248

(1) Both of the following apply:

(a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was 1250 unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the 1251 petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or, 1252 subsequent to the period prescribed in division (A)(2) of 1253 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an 1254 earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a 1255 new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons 1256 in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim 1257 based on that right. 1258

(b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence
1259
that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable
factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense
of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim
challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional
error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would
have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence.

(2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the
petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed
under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under
former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the
1269

context of and upon consideration of all available admissible 1270 evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division 1271 (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of 1272 the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1273 actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was 1274 sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1275 actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or 1276 circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that 1277 is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 1278

As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same 1279 meaning as in division (A)(1)(b)(c) of section 2953.21 of the 1280 Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" 1281 has the same meaning as in division (A)(1)(c)(d) of section 1282 2953.21 of the Revised Code. 1283

(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a 1284
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code 1285
is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter 1286
2953. of the Revised Code. 1287

Section 2. That existing sections 2929.02, 2929.022,12882929.024, 2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the1289Revised Code are hereby repealed.1290