As Reported by the House Criminal Justice Committee

132nd General Assembly

Regular Session 2017-2018 Sub. H. B. No. 81

Representatives Seitz, Antonio

Cosponsors: Representatives Dever, Miller, Hambley, Duffey, Brinkman, Blessing, Riedel, Lepore-Hagan, Smith, K., Ryan, Stein, Manning

A BILL

To amend sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	1
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23	2
and to enact section 2929.025 of the Revised	3
Code to provide that a person convicted of	4
aggravated murder who shows that the person had	5
a serious mental illness at the time of	6
committing the offense cannot be sentenced to	7
death for the offense and to provide a mechanism	8
for resentencing to a life sentence a person	9
previously sentenced to death who proves that	10
the person had a serious mental illness at the	11
time of committing the offense.	12

BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	13
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 be amended and	14
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as	15
follows:	16
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty	17
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of of pleads guilty	Τ /
to aggravated murder in violation of section 2903.01 of the	18

Revised Code.

Revised Code shall suffer death or be imprisoned for life, as	19
determined pursuant to sections 2929.022, 2929.03, and 2929.04	20
of the Revised Code, except that no person who raises the matter	21
of age pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and who	22
is not found to have been eighteen years of age or older at the	23
time of the commission of the offense and no person who raises	24
the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of	25
the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section	26
2929.025 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to	27
be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	28
$\underline{\text{illness}}$ shall suffer death. In addition, the offender may be	29
fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than twenty-	30
five thousand dollars.	31
(B)(1) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(2) or	32
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to	33
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall	34
be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.	35
(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of	36
this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to	37
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the	38
victim of the offense was less than thirteen years of age, and	39
the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual	40
motivation specification that was included in the indictment,	41
count in the indictment, or information charging the offense,	42
the court shall impose an indefinite prison term of thirty years	43
to life pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the	44

(3) If a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code and also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation

45

46

47

specification and a sexually violent predator specification that 49 were included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 50 information that charged the murder, the court shall impose upon 51 the offender a term of life imprisonment without parole that 52 shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 53

(4) In addition, the offender may be fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than fifteen thousand dollars.

(C) The court shall not impose a fine or fines for 56 aggravated murder or murder which, in the aggregate and to the 57 extent not suspended by the court, exceeds the amount which the 58 offender is or will be able to pay by the method and within the 59 time allowed without undue hardship to the offender or to the 60 dependents of the offender, or will prevent the offender from 61 making reparation for the victim's wrongful death. 62

(D)(1) In addition to any other sanctions imposed for a 63 violation of section 2903.01 or 2903.02 of the Revised Code, if 64 the offender used a motor vehicle as the means to commit the 65 violation, the court shall impose upon the offender a class two 66 suspension of the offender's driver's license, commercial 67 driver's license, temporary instruction permit, probationary 68 license, or nonresident operating privilege as specified in 69 division (A)(2) of section 4510.02 of the Revised Code. 70

(2) As used in division (D) of this section, "motor 71vehicle" has the same meaning as in section 4501.01 of the 72Revised Code. 73

Sec. 2929.022. (A) If an indictment or count in an 74 indictment charging a defendant with aggravated murder contains 75 a specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 76 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 77

54

Revised Code, the defendant may elect to have the panel of three 78 judges, if the defendant waives trial by jury, or the trial 79 judge, if the defendant is tried by jury, determine the 80 existence of that aggravating circumstance at the sentencing 81 hearing held pursuant to divisions (C) and (D) of section 82 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 83

(1) If the defendant does not elect to have the existence 84 of the aggravating circumstance determined at the sentencing 85 hearing, the defendant shall be tried on the charge of 86 aggravated murder, on the specification of the aggravating 87 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A) (5) of 88 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and on any other 89 specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in division 90 (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code in a single trial as 91 in any other criminal case in which a person is charged with 92 aggravated murder and specifications. 93

(2) If the defendant does elect to have the existence of
94
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in
95
division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code
96
determined at the sentencing hearing, then, following a verdict
97
of guilty of the charge of aggravated murder, the panel of three
98
judges or the trial judge shall:

(a) Hold a sentencing hearing pursuant to division (B) of 100
this section, unless required to do otherwise under division (A) 101
(2) (b) of this section; 102

(b) If the offender raises the matter of age at trial103pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and is not104found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older at105the time of the commission of the offense or raises the matter106of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of the107

alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 108 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to be 109 ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 110 illness, conduct a hearing to determine if the specification of 111 the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in 112 division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven 113 beyond a reasonable doubt. After conducting the hearing, the 114 panel or judge shall proceed as follows: 115 (i) If that aggravating circumstance is proven beyond a 116 reasonable doubt or if the defendant at trial was convicted of 117 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the 118 panel or judge shall impose sentence according to division (E) 119 of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 120 (ii) If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond 121 a reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted 122 of any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, 123 except as otherwise provided in this division, the panel or 124 judge shall impose sentence of life imprisonment with parole 125 eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on the 126 offender. If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond 127 a reasonable doubt, the defendant at trial was not convicted of 128 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the 129 victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of 130 age, and the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a 131 sexual motivation specification that was included in the 132 indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the 133 offense, the panel or judge shall sentence the offender pursuant 134 to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an 135 indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and 136 a maximum term of life imprisonment. 137

(B) At the sentencing hearing, the panel of judges, if the 138 defendant was tried by a panel of three judges, or the trial 139 judge, if the defendant was tried by jury, shall, when required 140 pursuant to division (A)(2) of this section, first determine if 141 the specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 142 conviction listed in division (A) (5) of section 2929.04 of the 143 Revised Code is proven beyond a reasonable doubt. If the panel 144 of judges or the trial judge determines that the specification 145 of the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in 146 division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven 147 beyond a reasonable doubt or if they do not determine that the 148 specification is proven beyond a reasonable doubt but the 149 defendant at trial was convicted of a specification of any other 150 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 151 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel of judges or the trial 152judge and trial jury shall impose sentence on the offender 153 pursuant to division (D) of section 2929.03 and section 2929.04 154 of the Revised Code. If the panel of judges or the trial judge 155 does not determine that the specification of the aggravating 156 circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A)(5) of 157 section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven beyond a 158 reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted of 159 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance listed in 160 division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel 161 of judges or the trial judge shall terminate the sentencing 162 hearing and impose sentence on the offender as follows: 163

(1) Subject to division (B) (2) of this section, the panel
or judge shall impose a sentence of life imprisonment with
parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on
the offender.

(2) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 168

Page 6

thirteen years of age and the offender also is convicted of or 169 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 170 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 171 information charging the offense, the panel or judge shall 172 sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 173 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term consisting of 174 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 175 176 imprisonment.

Sec. 2929.024. If (A) In a case described in division (B) 177 of this <u>section, if</u> the court determines that the defendant is 178 indigent and that investigation services, experts, or other 179 services are reasonably necessary for the proper representation 180 of a defendant charged with aggravated murder at trial or at the 181 sentencing hearing, the court shall authorize the defendant's 182 counsel to obtain the necessary services for the defendant, and 183 shall order that payment of the fees and expenses for the 184 necessary services be made in the same manner that payment for 185 appointed counsel is made pursuant to Chapter 120. of the 186 Revised Code. If the court determines that the necessary 187 services had to be obtained prior to court authorization for 188 payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services, the 189 court may, after the services have been obtained, authorize the 190 defendant's counsel to obtain the necessary services and order 191 that payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services 192 be made as provided in this section. 193

(B) Division (A) of this section applies in a case in194which either of the following apply:195(1) The court determines that the defendant is indigent.196

(2) The defendant is described in division (C) of section1972929.025 of the Revised Code and raises the matter of the198

defendant's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	199
commission of the aggravated murder as described in that	200
division.	201
Sec. 2929.025. (A) As used in this section:	202
(1) A person has a "serious mental illness" if both of the	203
following apply with respect to the person, subject to division	204
(A) (2) of this section:	205
(a) The person has been diagnosed as described in division	206
(B) of this section with one or more of the following	207
conditions:	208
(i) Schizophrenia;	209
(ii) Schizoaffective disorder;	210
<u>(iii) Bipolar disorder;</u>	211
<u>(iv) Major depressive disorder;</u>	212
(v) Delusional disorder.	213
(b) At the time of the alleged aggravated murder with	214
which the person is charged, the condition or conditions	215
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section with which the	216
person has been diagnosed, while not meeting the standard to be	217
found not guilty by reason of insanity as defined in section	218
2901.01 of the Revised Code or the standard to be found	219
incompetent to stand trial as described in division (G) of	220
section 2945.37 of the Revised Code, nevertheless significantly	221
impaired the person's capacity to exercise rational judgment in	222
relation to the person's conduct with respect to either of the	223
following:	224
(i) Conforming the person's conduct to the requirements of	225

Page 8

Page 9

law;	226
(ii) Appreciating the nature, consequences, or	227
wrongfulness of the person's conduct.	228
(2) A disorder manifested primarily by repeated criminal	229
conduct or attributable solely to the acute effects of voluntary	230
use of alcohol or any other drug of abuse does not, standing	231
alone, constitute a "serious mental illness" for purposes of	232
division (A)(1) of this section.	233
(3) "Examiner" means a person who makes an evaluation	234
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section.	235
(4) "Prosecutor" means a prosecuting attorney who has	236
authority to prosecute a charge of aggravated murder that is	237
before the court.	238
(B) The diagnosis of a person with a condition or	239
conditions described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section may	240
be made at any time prior to, on, or after the day of the	241
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged or	242
the day on which the person pursuant to division (C) of this	243
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	244
at the time of the alleged commission of that aggravated murder.	245
Diagnosis of the condition or conditions after the date of the	246
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged does	247
not preclude the person from presenting evidence that the person	248
had a serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	249
commission of that offense.	250
(C) A person charged with aggravated murder and one or	251
more specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in	252
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code may, before	253
trial, raise the matter of the person's serious mental illness	254

at the time of the alleged commission of the offense. If a	255
person raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	256
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense, the court	257
shall order an evaluation of the person in accordance with	258
division (F) of this section and shall hold a pretrial hearing	259
on the matter. The person who raises the matter may present	260
evidence that the person had a serious mental illness at the	261
time of the alleged commission of the offense, and the person	262
has the burden of raising that matter and of going forward with	263
the evidence relating to the diagnosis described in division (A)	264
(1) (a) of this section and the impairment described in division	265
(A)(1)(b) of this section.	266
(D) If a person described in division (C) of this section	267
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	268
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	269
submits evidence that the person has been diagnosed with one or	270
more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this	271
section and that the condition or conditions diagnosed	272
significantly impaired the person's capacity at the time of the	273
alleged offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of_	274
this section, the prosecution shall have an opportunity to	275
present evidence to contest the diagnosis. The defendant has the	276
burden of proving, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the	277
person has been diagnosed with one or more of the conditions set	278
forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	279
condition or conditions diagnosed significantly impaired the	280
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	281
described in division (A)(1)(b) of this section.	282
(E)(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that	283
the defendant has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,	284

the defendant has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the person has been diagnosed with one or more of the

conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and	286
that the condition or conditions diagnosed significantly	287
impaired the person's capacity at the time of the alleged	288
offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of this	289
section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is not	290
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	291
<u>illness.</u>	292
	0.00
(2) If the court at the pretrial hearing finds that the	293
defendant has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that	294
the person has been diagnosed with one or more of the conditions	295
set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	296
condition or conditions diagnosed significantly impaired the	297
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	298
described in division (A)(1)(b) of this section, the court shall	299
issue a finding that the person is ineligible for a sentence of	300
<u>death due to serious mental illness.</u>	301
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this	302
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	303
at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	304
as described in that division, the court shall order an	305
evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code	306
applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this	307
division.	308
(2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation	309
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section or in a pretrial_	310
hearing under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to	311
the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	312
commission of the aggravated murder with which the person is	313
charged shall be used against the person on the issue of guilt	314
in any animinal action on proceeding but in a animinal action	21 5

in any criminal action or proceeding, but, in a criminal action 315

or proceeding, the prosecutor or defense counsel may call as a	316
witness any examiner who evaluated the person or prepared a	317
report pursuant to a referral under this section. Neither the	318
appointment nor the testimony of an examiner in an evaluation	319
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section precludes the	320
prosecutor or defense counsel from calling other witnesses or	321
presenting other evidence on the issue of the person's serious	322
mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the	323
aggravated murder or on competency or insanity issues.	324
(G) A person's pleading of not guilty by reason of	325
insanity or incompetence to stand trial, or a finding after such	326
a plea that the person is not insane or that the person is	327
competent to stand trial, does not preclude the person from	328
raising the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	329
time of the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to	330
division (C) of this section and, if a person so raises that	331
matter, does not limit or affect any of the procedures described	332
in this section or the authority of a court to make any finding	333
described in this section.	334
Sec. 2929.03. (A) If the indictment or count in the	335
indictment charging aggravated murder does not contain one or	336
more specifications of aggravating circumstances listed in	337
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, then,	338
following a verdict of guilty of the charge of aggravated	339
murder, the trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as	340
follows:	341
(1) Except as provided in division (A)(2) of this section,	342
the trial court shall impose one of the following sentences on	343
the offender:	344
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	345

(b) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment;

(c) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of imprisonment; 351

(d) Subject to division (A) (1) (e) of this section, life 352 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full 353 354 years of imprisonment;

(e) If the victim of the appravated murder was less than 355 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 356 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 357 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 358 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 359 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 360 offender pursuant to division (A)(1)(a) of this section, the 361 trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) 362 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term 363 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 364 of life imprisonment that shall be served pursuant to that 365 section. 366

(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty 367 to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 368 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 369 count in the indictment, or information that charged the 370 aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the 371 offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that 372 shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 373

(B) If the indictment or count in the indictment charging 374

349 350

346

347

aggravated murder contains one or more specifications of

aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the verdict shall separately state whether all of the following: (1) Whether the accused is found guilty or not guilty of the principal charge and, if; (2) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the offender was eighteen years of age or older at the time of the commission of the offense, if the matter of age was raised by the offender pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, and whether; (3) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the offender was found under section 2929.025 of the Revised Code to be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental

illness if the matter of serious mental illness at the time of389the commission of the offense was raised by the offender390pursuant to that section;391

(4) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the392offender is guilty or not guilty of each specification. The393

The jury shall be instructed on its duties in this regard. 394 The instruction to the jury shall include an instruction that a 395 specification shall be proved beyond a reasonable doubt in order 396 to support a guilty verdict on the specification, but the 397 instruction shall not mention the penalty that may be the 398 consequence of a guilty or not guilty verdict on any charge or 399 specification. 400

(C) (1) If the indictment or count in the indictment
401
charging aggravated murder contains one or more specifications
402
of aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section
403

375

376

377

378

379 380

381

382

383

384 385

386

387

2929.04 of the Revised Code, then, following a verdict of quilty 404 of the charge but not quilty of each of the specifications, and 405 regardless of whether the offender raised the matter of age 406 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or the matter_ 407 of serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the 408 offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code, the 409 410 trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as follows: (a) Except as provided in division (C) (1) (b) of this 411 412 section, the trial court shall impose one of the following sentences on the offender: 413 (i) Life imprisonment without parole; 414 (ii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 415 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty 416 years of imprisonment; 417 (iii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 418 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-419 five full years of imprisonment; 420 (iv) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section, 421 life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty 422 full years of imprisonment; 423 424 (v) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 425 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 426 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 427 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 428 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 429 offender pursuant to division (C)(1)(a)(i) of this section, the 430

trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)

(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term

431

consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 433 of life imprisonment. 434 (b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads quilty 435 to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 436 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 437 count in the indictment, or information that charged the 438 aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the 439 440 offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 441 (2) (a) If the indictment or count in the indictment 442 contains one or more specifications of aggravating circumstances 443 listed in division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code 444 and if the offender is found quilty of both the charge and one 445 or more of the specifications, the penalty to be imposed on the 446 offender shall be one of the following: 447 (i) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(ii) or (iii), 448

and subject to divisions (D) (1) and (E) of this section, the449penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be death, life450imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment with parole451eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of452imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole eligibility after453serving thirty full years of imprisonment.454

(ii) Except as provided in division (C) (2) (a) (iii) of this 455 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 456 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 457 pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 458 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 459 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 460 impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment without parole 461 on the offender pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i) of this 462

section, the penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be an
463
indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and
464
a maximum term of life imprisonment that shall be imposed
465
pursuant to division (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised
466
Code and served pursuant to that section.

(iii) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads
guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually
violent predator specification that are included in the
indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged
the aggravated murder, the penalty to be imposed on the offender
shall be death or life imprisonment without parole that shall be
served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

(b) A penalty imposed pursuant to division (C) (2) (a) (i),
(ii), or (iii) of this section shall be determined pursuant to
divisions (D) and (E) of this section and shall be determined by
477
one of the following:

(i) By the panel of three judges that tried the offender upon the offender's waiver of the right to trial by jury;

```
(ii) By the trial jury and the trial judge, if the481offender was tried by jury.482
```

483 (D) (1) Death may not be imposed as a penalty for aggravated murder if the offender raised the matter of age at 484 trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and was 485 not found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older 486 at the time of the commission of the offense or raised the 487 matter of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of 488 the commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of 489 the Revised Code and was found under that section to be 490 ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental 491

479

illness. When death may be imposed as a penalty for aggravated 492 murder, the court shall proceed under this division. When death 493 may be imposed as a penalty, the court, upon the request of the 494 defendant, shall require a pre-sentence investigation to be made 495 and, upon the request of the defendant, shall require a mental 496 examination to be made, and shall require reports of the 497 investigation and of any mental examination submitted to the 498 court, pursuant to section 2947.06 of the Revised Code. No 499 statement made or information provided by a defendant in a 500 mental examination or proceeding conducted pursuant to this 501 division shall be disclosed to any person, except as provided in 502 this division, or be used in evidence against the defendant on 503 the issue of quilt in any retrial. A pre-sentence investigation 504 or mental examination shall not be made except upon request of 505 the defendant. Copies of any reports prepared under this 506 division shall be furnished to the court, to the trial jury if 507 the offender was tried by a jury, to the prosecutor, and to the 508 offender or the offender's counsel for use under this division. 509 The court, and the trial jury if the offender was tried by a 510 jury, shall consider any report prepared pursuant to this 511 division and furnished to it and any evidence raised at trial 512 that is relevant to the aggravating circumstances the offender 513 was found guilty of committing or to any factors in mitigation 514 of the imposition of the sentence of death, shall hear testimony 515 and other evidence that is relevant to the nature and 516 circumstances of the aggravating circumstances the offender was 517 found quilty of committing, the mitigating factors set forth in 518 division (B) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and any 519 other factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of 520 death, and shall hear the statement, if any, of the offender, 521 and the arguments, if any, of counsel for the defense and 522 523 prosecution, that are relevant to the penalty that should be

imposed on the offender. The defendant shall be given great 524 latitude in the presentation of evidence of the mitigating 525 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 526 Revised Code and of any other factors in mitigation of the 527 imposition of the sentence of death. If the offender chooses to 528 make a statement, the offender is subject to cross-examination 529 530 only if the offender consents to make the statement under oath or affirmation. 531

The defendant shall have the burden of going forward with the evidence of any factors in mitigation of the imposition of 533 the sentence of death. The prosecution shall have the burden of proving, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the 535 aggravating circumstances the defendant was found guilty of 536 committing are sufficient to outweigh the factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of death.

(2) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 539 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 540 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 541 pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, the trial jury, if 542 the offender was tried by a jury, shall determine whether the 543 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of 544 committing are sufficient to outweigh the mitigating factors 545 present in the case. If the trial jury unanimously finds, by 546 proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating 547 circumstances the offender was found quilty of committing 548 outweigh the mitigating factors, the trial jury shall recommend 549 to the court that the sentence of death be imposed on the 550 offender. Absent such a finding, the jury shall recommend that 551 the offender be sentenced to one of the following: 552

(a) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(b) or (c) of

Page 19

532

534

537

538

this section, to life imprisonment without parole, life554imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five555full years of imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole556eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment;557

(b) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(c) of this 558 section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 559 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 560 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 561 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 562 information charging the offense, and the jury does not 563 recommend a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 564 pursuant to division (D)(2)(a) of this section, to an indefinite 565 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 566 term of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B) 567 (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant 568 to that section. 569

(c) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
570
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
571
predator specification that are included in the indictment,
572
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
573
aggravated murder, to life imprisonment without parole.
574

If the trial jury recommends that the offender be 575 sentenced to life imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment 576 with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 577 imprisonment, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 578 serving thirty full years of imprisonment, or an indefinite term 579 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 580 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B)(3) 581 of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code, the court shall impose 582 the sentence recommended by the jury upon the offender. If the 583

sentence is an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of 584 thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment imposed as 585 described in division (D)(2)(b) of this section or a sentence of 586 life imprisonment without parole imposed under division (D)(2) 587 (c) of this section, the sentence shall be served pursuant to 588 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. If the trial jury 589 recommends that the sentence of death be imposed upon the 590 offender, the court shall proceed to impose sentence pursuant to 591 division (D)(3) of this section. 592

(3) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at 593 trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender, 594 arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted 595 to the court pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, if, 596 after receiving pursuant to division (D)(2) of this section the 597 trial jury's recommendation that the sentence of death be 598 imposed, the court finds, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, or 599 if the panel of three judges unanimously finds, by proof beyond 600 a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating circumstances the 601 602 offender was found quilty of committing outweigh the mitigating factors, it shall impose sentence of death on the offender. 603 Absent such a finding by the court or panel, the court or the 604 panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the 605 offender: 606

(a) Except as provided in division (D) (3) (b) of thissection, one of the following:608

(i) Life imprisonment without parole; 609

(ii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twentyfive full years of imprisonment;
612

(iii) Subject to division (D) (3) (a) (iv) of this section,
613
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty
614
full years of imprisonment;
615

(iv) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than 616 thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or 617 pleads quilty to a sexual motivation specification that was 618 included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or 619 information charging the offense, and the trial court does not 620 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the 621 622 offender pursuant to division (D)(3)(a)(i) of this section, the 623 court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite 624 term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum 625 term of life imprisonment. 626

(b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty
627
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent
628
predator specification that are included in the indictment,
629
count in the indictment, or information that charged the
630
aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall
631
be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.
632

(E) If the offender raised the matter of age at trial-633 pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, was convicted 634 of aggravated murder and one or more specifications of an 635 aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section 636 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and if the offender either raised 637 the matter of age at trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the 638 <u>Revised Code</u> and was not found at trial to have been eighteen 639 years of age or older at the time of the commission of the 640 offense or raised the matter of the offender's serious mental 641 illness at the time of the commission of the offense pursuant to 642

section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and was found under that	643
section to be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious	644
mental illness, the court or the panel of three judges shall not	645
impose a sentence of death on the offender. Instead, the court	646
or panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the	647
offender:	648
(1) Except as provided in division (E)(2) of this section,	649
one of the following:	650
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	651
(b) Subject to division (E) (2)<u>(</u>1) (d) of this section, life	652
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	653
full years of imprisonment;	654
(c) Subject to division (E) (2)<u>(</u>1) (d) of this section, life	655
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full	656
years of imprisonment;	657
(d) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	658
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	659
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	660
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	661
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	662
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	663
offender pursuant to division (E) $\frac{(2)(1)}{(2)}$ (a) of this section, the	664
court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division	665
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite	666
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	667
term of life imprisonment.	668
(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	669

to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 670 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 671

count in the indictment, or information that charged the672aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall673be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.674

(F) The court or the panel of three judges, when it 675 imposes sentence of death, shall state in a separate opinion its 676 specific findings as to the existence of any of the mitigating 677 factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the 678 Revised Code, the existence of any other mitigating factors, the 679 aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of 680 681 committing, and the reasons why the aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing were sufficient to 682 outweigh the mitigating factors. The court or panel, when it 683 imposes life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting of a 684 minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 685 imprisonment under division (D) of this section, shall state in 686 a separate opinion its specific findings of which of the 687 mitigating factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 688 of the Revised Code it found to exist, what other mitigating 689 690 factors it found to exist, what aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing, and why it could not 691 find that these aggravating circumstances were sufficient to 692 outweigh the mitigating factors. For cases in which a sentence 693 of death is imposed for an offense committed before January 1, 694 1995, the court or panel shall file the opinion required to be 695 prepared by this division with the clerk of the appropriate 696 court of appeals and with the clerk of the supreme court within 697 fifteen days after the court or panel imposes sentence. For 698 cases in which a sentence of death is imposed for an offense 699 committed on or after January 1, 1995, the court or panel shall 700 file the opinion required to be prepared by this division with 701 the clerk of the supreme court within fifteen days after the 702

court or panel imposes sentence. The judgment in a case in which703a sentencing hearing is held pursuant to this section is not704final until the opinion is filed.705

(G) (1) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges 706
imposes a sentence of death for an offense committed before 707
January 1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is 708
rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in 709
the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in 710
the case to the appellate court. 711

(2) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges imposes
a sentence of death for an offense committed on or after January
1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is
714
rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in
715
the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in
716
the case to the supreme court.

Sec. 2929.04. (A) Imposition of the death penalty for 718 aggravated murder is precluded unless one or more of the 719 following is specified in the indictment or count in the 720 indictment pursuant to section 2941.14 of the Revised Code and 721 proved beyond a reasonable doubt: 722

(1) The offense was the assassination of the president of 723 the United States or a person in line of succession to the 724 presidency, the governor or lieutenant governor of this state, 725 the president-elect or vice president-elect of the United 726 States, the governor-elect or lieutenant governor-elect of this 727 state, or a candidate for any of the offices described in this 728 division. For purposes of this division, a person is a candidate 729 if the person has been nominated for election according to law, 730 if the person has filed a petition or petitions according to law 731 to have the person's name placed on the ballot in a primary or 732

general election, or if the person campaigns as a write-in 733 candidate in a primary or general election. 734 (2) The offense was committed for hire. 735 (3) The offense was committed for the purpose of escaping 736 detection, apprehension, trial, or punishment for another 737 offense committed by the offender. 738 (4) The offense was committed while the offender was under 739 detention or while the offender was at large after having broken 740 detention. As used in division (A)(4) of this section, 741 "detention" has the same meaning as in section 2921.01 of the 742 743 Revised Code, except that detention does not include hospitalization, institutionalization, or confinement in a 744 mental health facility or intellectual disabilities facility 745 unless at the time of the commission of the offense either of 746 the following circumstances apply: 747

(a) The offender was in the facility as a result of beingcharged with a violation of a section of the Revised Code.749

(b) The offender was under detention as a result of being
 convicted of or pleading guilty to a violation of a section of
 751
 the Revised Code.
 752

(5) Prior to the offense at bar, the offender was
753
convicted of an offense an essential element of which was the
754
purposeful killing of or attempt to kill another, or the offense
755
at bar was part of a course of conduct involving the purposeful
756
killing of or attempt to kill two or more persons by the
757
offender.
758

(6) The victim of the offense was a law enforcement
officer, as defined in section 2911.01 of the Revised Code, whom
the offender had reasonable cause to know or knew to be a law
761

enforcement officer as so defined, and either the victim, at the762time of the commission of the offense, was engaged in the763victim's duties, or it was the offender's specific purpose to764kill a law enforcement officer as so defined.765

(7) The offense was committed while the offender was 766 committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after 767 committing or attempting to commit kidnapping, rape, aggravated 768 arson, aggravated robbery, or aggravated burglary, and either 769 the offender was the principal offender in the commission of the 770 aggravated murder or, if not the principal offender, committed 771 the aggravated murder with prior calculation and design. 722

(8) The victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to 773 an offense who was purposely killed to prevent the victim's 774 testimony in any criminal proceeding and the aggravated murder 775 was not committed during the commission, attempted commission, 776 or flight immediately after the commission or attempted 777 commission of the offense to which the victim was a witness, or 778 the victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to an offense 779 and was purposely killed in retaliation for the victim's 780 781 testimony in any criminal proceeding.

(9) The offender, in the commission of the offense,
purposefully caused the death of another who was under thirteen
years of age at the time of the commission of the offense, and
either the offender was the principal offender in the commission
of the offense or, if not the principal offender, committed the
offense with prior calculation and design.

(10) The offense was committed while the offender was
committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after
committing or attempting to commit terrorism.
790

(B) If one or more of the aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of this section is specified in the indictment

or count in the indictment and proved beyond a reasonable doubt, 793 and if the offender did not raise the matter of age pursuant to 794 section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or $\frac{1}{100}$ the offender, after 795 raising the that matter of age, was found at trial to have been 796 797 eighteen years of age or older at the time of the commission of the offense, and if the offender did not raise the matter of the 798 offender's serious mental illness at the time of the commission 799 of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code 800 or the offender after raising that matter was found by the court 801 to not be ineligible for a sentence of death, the court, trial 802 jury, or panel of three judges shall consider, and weigh against 803 the aggravating circumstances proved beyond a reasonable doubt, 804 the nature and circumstances of the offense, the history, 805 character, and background of the offender, and all of the 806 following factors: 807

(1) Whether the victim of the offense induced or808facilitated it;809

(2) Whether it is unlikely that the offense would have
been committed, but for the fact that the offender was under
duress, coercion, or strong provocation;
812

(3) Whether, at the time of committing the offense, the
813
offender, because of a mental disease or defect, lacked
814
substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the
815
offender's conduct or to conform the offender's conduct to the
816
requirements of the law;

(4) The youth of the offender; 818

(5) The offender's lack of a significant history of prior 819

791

Page 29

820

831

832

833

834

835

836

837

criminal convictions and delinquency adjudications;

(6) If the offender was a participant in the offense but
not the principal offender, the degree of the offender's
participation in the offense and the degree of the offender's
participation in the acts that led to the death of the victim;

(7) Any other factors that are relevant to the issue of825whether the offender should be sentenced to death.826

(C) The defendant shall be given great latitude in the
presentation of evidence of the factors listed in division (B)
of this section and of any other factors in mitigation of the
829
imposition of the sentence of death.

The existence of any of the mitigating factors listed in division (B) of this section does not preclude the imposition of a sentence of death on the offender but shall be weighed pursuant to divisions (D)(2) and (3) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code by the trial court, trial jury, or the panel of three judges against the aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing.

Sec. 2929.06. (A) (1)If a sentence of death imposed upon838an offender is set aside, nullified, or vacated because the, or839voided for any of the following reasons, the trial court that840sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the841offender in accordance with division (A) (2) of this section:842

(a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of843death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1,8441995, or the supreme court, in cases a case in which the supreme845court reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the846sentence of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05847of the Revised Code, is set aside, nullified, or vacated for848

Page 30

the.

(b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for850imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections8512929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional.852

(c) The sentence of deathis set aside, nullified, or853vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the854Revised Code, or is set aside, nullified, or vacated because a.855

(d) A court has determined that the offender is a person 856 with an intellectual disability under standards set forth in 857 decisions of the supreme court of this state or the United 858 States supreme court, the trial court that sentenced the 859 offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender. 860

(e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to861division (H) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.862

(2) At the a resentencing hearing conducted under division 863 (A) (1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender 864 a sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting 865 of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 866 imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 867 If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the 868 time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the 869 sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a 870 sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life 871 imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term 872 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 873 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or 874 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served 875 pursuant to that section, the court shall impose the sentence so 876 required. In all other cases, the sentences of life imprisonment 877

that are available at the hearing, and from which the court 878 shall impose sentence, shall be the same sentences of life 879 imprisonment that were available under division (D) of section 880 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time 881 the offender committed the offense for which the sentence of 882 death was imposed. Nothing in this division regarding the 883 resentencing of an offender shall affect the operation of 884 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 885

886 (B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court 887 sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed upon an offender because of error that occurred in the 888 sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this 889 section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the 890 offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender. 891 If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall 892 impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by 893 a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new 894 panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing, 895 the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in 896 division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in 897 determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of 898 death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term 899 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 900 of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court 901 or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a 902 sentence of death, the court or panel shall impose upon the 903 offender one of the sentences of life imprisonment that could 904 have been imposed at the time the offender committed the offense 905 for which the sentence of death was imposed, determined as 906 specified in this division, or an indefinite term consisting of 907 a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 908

which the sentence of death was imposed.

imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 909 If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the 910 time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the 911 sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a 912 sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life 913 imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term 914 915 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or 916 (B) (3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served 917 pursuant to that section, the court or panel shall impose the 918 sentence so required. In all other cases, the sentences of life 919 imprisonment that are available at the hearing, and from which 920 the court or panel shall impose sentence, shall be the same 921 sentences of life imprisonment that were available under 922 division (D) of section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the 923 Revised Code at the time the offender committed the offense for 924

(C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 926 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 927 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 928 929 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 930 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 931 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender 932 shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 933 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 934 full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole 935 eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 936

(D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights
937
of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or
938
vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of
939

that nature otherwise would be available.

(E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th 941 general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been 942 sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed 943 on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was 944 committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by 945 H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to 946 all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after 947 March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are 948 challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence 949 of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court 950 of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23, 951 2005, have not yet been resentenced. 952

Sec. 2953.21. (A)(1)(a) <u>A person in any of the following</u> 953 categories may file a petition in the court that imposed sentence, stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to 956 grant other appropriate relief:

958 (i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that 959 there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights 960 as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio 961 Constitution or the Constitution of the United States, any; 962

(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal 963 offense and sentenced to death and who claims that there was a 964 denial or infringement of the person's rights under either of 965 those Constitutions that creates a reasonable probability of an 966 altered verdict, and any; 967

(iii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal

940

954 955

957

testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of 970 the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised 971 Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of 972 all available admissible evidence related to the person's case 973 as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised 974 Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing 975 evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the 976 977 person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating 978 circumstance or circumstances the person was found quilty of 979 committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of 980 death, may file a petition in the court that imposed sentence, 981 stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court 982 to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant 983 984 other appropriate relief;

(iv) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the offense and that as a result the court should render void the sentence of death.

The (b) A petitioner under division (A)(1)(a) of this section may file a supporting affidavit and other documentary evidence in support of the claim for relief.

 (b) (c)
 As used in division (A) (1) (a) of this section,
 993

 "actual:
 994

(i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the995DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the996Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code997been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in998

969

985

986

987

988

989

990

991

the context of and upon consideration of all available 999 admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in 1000 division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no 1001 reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of 1002 the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the 1003 person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would 1004 have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance 1005 or circumstances the petitioner was found guilty of committing 1006 and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 1007

(ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in 1008 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code. 1009

(c) (d)As used in divisions (A) (1) (a) and (b) (c) of this1010section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means1011section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July10126, 2010.1013

(d) (e) At any time in conjunction with the filing of a 1014 petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of this 1015 section by a person who has been sentenced to death, or with the 1016 litigation of a petition so filed, the court, for good cause 1017 shown, may authorize the petitioner in seeking the 1018 postconviction relief and the prosecuting attorney of the county 1019 served by the court in defending the proceeding, to take 1020 depositions and to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in 1021 accordance with divisions (A) (1) $\frac{(d)}{(e)}$, (A) (1) $\frac{(e)}{(f)}$, and (C) of 1022 this section, and to any other form of discovery as in a civil 1023 action that the court in its discretion permits. The court may 1024 limit the extent of discovery under this division. In addition 1025 to discovery that is relevant to the claim and was available 1026 under Criminal Rule 16 through conclusion of the original 1027 criminal trial, the court, for good cause shown, may authorize 1028

Page 35

Page 36

the petitioner or prosecuting attorney to take depositions and 1029 issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in either of the 1030 following circumstances: 1031 (i) For any witness who testified at trial or who was 1032 disclosed by the state prior to trial, except as otherwise 1033 provided in this division, the petitioner or prosecuting 1034 attorney shows clear and convincing evidence that the witness is 1035 material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of 1036 a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to 1037 substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a 1038 reasonable probability of an altered verdict. This division does 1039 not apply if the witness was unavailable for trial or would not 1040 voluntarily be interviewed by the defendant or prosecuting 1041 attorney. 1042

(ii) For any witness with respect to whom division (A) (1)
(d) (e) (i) of this section does not apply, the petitioner or
1043
prosecuting attorney shows good cause that the witness is
1045
material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of
1046
a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to
1047
substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a
1048
reasonable probability of an altered verdict.

 $\frac{(e)}{(f)}$ If a person who has been sentenced to death and who 1050 files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of 1051 this section requests postconviction discovery as described in 1052 division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section or if the prosecuting 1053 attorney of the county served by the court requests 1054 postconviction discovery as described in that division, within 1055 ten days after the docketing of the request, or within any other 1056 time that the court sets for good cause shown, the prosecuting 1057 attorney shall respond by answer or motion to the petitioner's 1058

request or the petitioner shall respond by answer or motion to 1059 the prosecuting attorney's request, whichever is applicable. 1060

 $\frac{f}{f}$ (g) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who 1061 files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of 1062 this section requests postconviction discovery as described in 1063 division (A) (1) (d) (e) of this section or if the prosecuting 1064 attorney of the county served by the court requests 1065 postconviction discovery as described in that division, upon 1066 motion by the petitioner, the prosecuting attorney, or the 1067 person from whom discovery is sought, and for good cause shown, 1068 the court in which the action is pending may make any order that 1069 justice requires to protect a party or person from oppression or 1070 undue burden or expense, including but not limited to the orders 1071 described in divisions (A)(1)((g)(i) to (viii) of this 1072 section. The court also may make any such order if, in its 1073 discretion, it determines that the discovery sought would be 1074 irrelevant to the claims made in the petition; and if the court 1075 makes any such order on that basis, it shall explain in the 1076 order the reasons why the discovery would be irrelevant. 1077

(g)(h) If a petitioner, prosecuting attorney, or person 1078 from whom discovery is sought makes a motion for an order under 1079 division (A) (1) $\frac{(f)}{(f)}$ (q) of this section and the order is denied in 1080 whole or in part, the court, on terms and conditions as are 1081 just, may order that any party or person provide or permit 1082 discovery as described in division (A) (1) (e) of this section. 1083 The provisions of Civil Rule 37(A)(4) apply to the award of 1084 expenses incurred in relation to the motion, except that in no 1085 case shall a court require a petitioner who is indigent to pay 1086 expenses under those provisions. 1087

Before any person moves for an order under division (A)(1) 1088

 $\frac{f}{(q)}$ of this section, that person shall make a reasonable 1089 effort to resolve the matter through discussion with the 1090 petitioner or prosecuting attorney seeking discovery. A motion 1091 for an order under division (A) (1) $\frac{(f)}{(g)}$ (g) of this section shall 1092 be accompanied by a statement reciting the effort made to 1093 resolve the matter in accordance with this paragraph. 1094 The orders that may be made under division (A) (1) $\frac{(f)}{(f)}$ (g) of 1095 this section include, but are not limited to, any of the 1096 following: 1097 1098 (i) That the discovery not be had; (ii) That the discovery may be had only on specified terms 1099 and conditions, including a designation of the time or place; 1100 (iii) That the discovery may be had only by a method of 1101 discovery other than that selected by the party seeking 1102 discovery; 1103 (iv) That certain matters not be inquired into or that the 1104 scope of the discovery be limited to certain matters; 1105 (v) That discovery be conducted with no one present except 1106 persons designated by the court; 1107 (vi) That a deposition after being sealed be opened only 1108 by order of the court; 1109 (vii) That a trade secret or other confidential research, 1110 development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be 1111 disclosed only in a designated way; 1112 (viii) That the parties simultaneously file specified 1113 documents or information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be 1114 opened as directed by the court. 1115

(h)(i)Any postconviction discovery authorized under1116division (A)(1)(d)(e)of this section shall be completed not1117later than eighteen months after the start of the discovery1118proceedings unless, for good cause shown, the court extends that1119period for completing the discovery.1120

(i)(j)Nothing in division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section1121authorizes, or shall be construed as authorizing, the1122relitigation, or discovery in support of relitigation, of any1123matter barred by the doctrine of res judicata.1124

(j)(k)Division (A)(1) of this section does not apply to1125any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense and1126sentenced to death and who has unsuccessfully raised the same1127claims in a petition for postconviction relief.1128

(2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of 1129 the Revised Code, a petition under division (A)(1)(a)(i), (ii), 1130 or (iii) of this section shall be filed no later than three 1131 hundred sixty-five days after the date on which the trial 1132 transcript is filed in the court of appeals in the direct appeal 1133 of the judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the direct 1134 appeal involves a sentence of death, the date on which the trial 1135 transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal is taken, 1136 except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised 1137 Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three hundred 1138 sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for filing the 1139 1140 appeal.

(b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the1141Revised Code, a petition under division (A) (1) (a) (iv) of this1142section shall be filed not later than three hundred sixty-five1143days after the effective date of this amendment.1144

(3) In a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), 1145 or (iii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to 1146 death may ask the court to render void or voidable the judgment 1147 with respect to the conviction of aggravated murder or the 1148 specification of an aggravating circumstance or the sentence of 1149 death. A person sentenced to death who files a petition under 1150 division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section may ask the court to 1151 render void the sentence of death and to order the resentencing 1152 of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06 of the 1153 Revised Code. 1154

(4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended
petition filed under division (A) of this section all grounds
for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided in
section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any ground for relief that
is not so stated in the petition is waived.

(5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 1160 (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section was convicted of or 1161 pleaded guilty to a felony, the petition may include a claim 1162 that the petitioner was denied the equal protection of the laws 1163 in violation of the Ohio Constitution or the United States 1164 Constitution because the sentence imposed upon the petitioner 1165 for the felony was part of a consistent pattern of disparity in 1166 sentencing by the judge who imposed the sentence, with regard to 1167 the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic background, or religion. 1168 If the supreme court adopts a rule requiring a court of common 1169 pleas to maintain information with regard to an offender's race, 1170 gender, ethnic background, or religion, the supporting evidence 1171 for the petition shall include, but shall not be limited to, a 1172 copy of that type of information relative to the petitioner's 1173 sentence and copies of that type of information relative to 1174 sentences that the same judge imposed upon other persons. 1175

(6) Notwithstanding any law or court rule to the contrary, 1176 there is no limit on the number of pages in, or on the length 1177 of, a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), 1178 or (iv) of this section by a person who has been sentenced to 1179 death. If any court rule specifies a limit on the number of 1180 pages in, or on the length of, a petition filed under division 1181 (A) (1) (a) (i), (iii), (iii), or (iv) of this section or on a 1182 prosecuting attorney's response to such a petition by answer or 1183 motion and a person who has been sentenced to death files a 1184 petition that exceeds the limit specified for the petition, the 1185 prosecuting attorney may respond by an answer or motion that 1186 exceeds the limit specified for the response. 1187

(B) The clerk of the court in which the petition for 1188 postconviction relief and, if applicable, a request for 1189 postconviction discovery described in division (A) (1) $\frac{(d)}{(d)}$ of 1190 this section is filed shall docket the petition and the request 1191 and bring them promptly to the attention of the court. The clerk 1192 of the court in which the petition for postconviction relief 1193 and, if applicable, a request for postconviction discovery 1194 described in division (A)(1)(d)(e) of this section is filed 1195 immediately shall forward a copy of the petition and a copy of 1196 the request if filed by the petitioner to the prosecuting 1197 attorney of the county served by the court. If the request for 1198 postconviction discovery is filed by the prosecuting attorney, 1199 the clerk of the court immediately shall forward a copy of the 1200 request to the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel. 1201

(C) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) (1)
(a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section requests a
deposition or the prosecuting attorney in the case requests a
deposition, and if the court grants the request under division
1202

(A) (1) (d) (e) of this section, the court shall notify the
petitioner or the petitioner's counsel and the prosecuting
attorney. The deposition shall be conducted pursuant to
divisions (B), (D), and (E) of Criminal Rule 15. Notwithstanding
division (C) of Criminal Rule 15, the petitioner is not entitled
to attend the deposition. The prosecuting attorney shall be
permitted to attend and participate in any deposition.

(D) The court shall consider a petition that is timely 1214 filed under within the period specified in division (A) (2) of 1215 this section even if a direct appeal of the judgment is pending. 1216 Before granting a hearing on a petition filed under division (A) 1217 (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section, the court shall 1218 determine whether there are substantive grounds for relief. In 1219 making such a determination, the court shall consider, in 1220 addition to the petition, the supporting affidavits, and the 1221 documentary evidence, all the files and records pertaining to 1222 the proceedings against the petitioner, including, but not 1223 limited to, the indictment, the court's journal entries, the 1224 journalized records of the clerk of the court, and the court 1225 reporter's transcript. The court reporter's transcript, if 1226 ordered and certified by the court, shall be taxed as court 1227 costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it shall make and 1228 file findings of fact and conclusions of law with respect to 1229 such dismissal. If the petition was filed by a person who has 1230 been sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of 1231 law shall state specifically the reasons for the dismissal of 1232 the petition and of each claim it contains. 1233

(E) Within ten days after the docketing of the petition,
or within any further time that the court may fix for good cause
shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or
motion. Division (A) (6) of this section applies with respect to

the prosecuting attorney's response. Within twenty days from the1238date the issues are raised, either party may move for summary1239judgment. The right to summary judgment shall appear on the face1240of the record.1241

(F) Unless the petition and the files and records of the 1242 case show the petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court 1243 shall proceed to a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct 1244 appeal of the case is pending. If the court notifies the parties 1245 that it has found grounds for granting relief, either party may 1246 request an appellate court in which a direct appeal of the 1247 judgment is pending to remand the pending case to the court. 1248

With respect to a petition filed under division (A)(1)(a) 1249 (iv) of this section, the procedures and rules regarding 1250 introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the pretrial 1251 hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and (F) of 1252 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering the 1253 petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for 1254 granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one 1255 or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of 1256 1257 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of the appravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of 1258 death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the 1259 person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of 1260 that section. 1261

(G) A petitioner who files a petition under division (A) 1262
(1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section may amend the 1263
petition as follows: 1264

(1) If the petition was filed by a person who has been
1265
sentenced to death, at any time that is not later than one
1266
hundred eighty days after the petition is filed, the petitioner
1267

may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the proceedings.

(2) If division (G) (1) of this section does not apply, at
any time before the answer or motion is filed, the petitioner
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the
proceedings.

(3) The petitioner may amend the petition with leave of
1274
court at any time after the expiration of the applicable period
specified in division (G) (1) or (2) of this section.

(H) If the court does not find grounds for granting 1277 relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions 1278 of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition. 1279 If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to 1280 death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law shall state 1281 specifically the reasons for the denial of relief on the 1282 petition and of each claim it contains. If no direct appeal of 1283 the case is pending and the court finds grounds for relief or if 1284 a pending direct appeal of the case has been remanded to the 1285 court pursuant to a request made pursuant to division (F) of 1286 this section and the court finds grounds for granting relief, it 1287 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law and 1288 shall enter a judgment that vacates and sets aside the judgment 1289 in question, and, in the case of a petitioner who is a prisoner 1290 in custody, except as otherwise described in this division, 1291 shall discharge or resentence the petitioner or grant a new 1292 trial as the court determines appropriate. If the court finds 1293 grounds for relief in the case of a petitioner who filed a 1294 petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section, the court 1295 shall render void the sentence of death and order the 1296 resentencing of the offender under division (A) of section 1297

1268

1269

Page 45

2929.06 of the Revised Code. If the petitioner has been 1298 sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law 1299 shall state specifically the reasons for the finding of grounds 1300 for granting the relief, with respect to each claim contained in 1301 the petition. The court also may make supplementary orders to 1302 the relief granted, concerning such matters as rearraignment, 1303 retrial, custody, and bail. If the trial court's order granting 1304 the petition is reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of 1305 the case has been remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a 1306 request under division (F) of this section, the appellate court 1307 reversing the order granting the petition shall notify the 1308 appellate court in which the direct appeal of the case was 1309 pending at the time of the remand of the reversal and remand of 1310 the trial court's order. Upon the reversal and remand of the 1311 trial court's order granting the petition, regardless of whether 1312 notice is sent or received, the direct appeal of the case that 1313 was remanded is reinstated. 1314

(I) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A)
(1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section by a person
1316
sentenced to death, only the supreme court may stay execution of
1317
the sentence of death.

(J) (1) If a person sentenced to death intends to file a 1319 petition under this section, the court shall appoint counsel to 1320 represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent 1321 and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or 1322 is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or 1323 reject the appointment of counsel. The court may decline to 1324 appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a 1325 hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of 1326 counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision 1327 or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. 1328

(2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division 1329 (J) (1) of this section an attorney who represented the 1330 petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates 1331 unless the person and the attorney expressly request the 1332 appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division 1333 (J) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified under 1334 Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of Ohio 1335 to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted of an 1336 offense for which the death penalty can be or has been imposed. 1337 The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during 1338 proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds for 1339 relief in a proceeding under this section, in an appeal of any 1340 action under this section, or in an application to reopen a 1341 direct appeal. 1342

(3) Division (J) of this section does not preclude 1343 attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the 1344 provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that 1345 were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July 1346 1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were 1347 represented in proceedings under this section by one or more 1348 counsel appointed by the court under this section or section 1349 120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those 1350 appointed counsel meet the requirements of division (J)(2) of 1351 this section. 1352

(K) Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony that 1353 is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the remedy 1354 set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by which a 1355 person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity of a 1356 conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the validity of 1357 an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for the 1358 commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if 1359

committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of disposition.

Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a 1362 petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, 1363 a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration 1364 of the period prescribed in division (A) of that section or a 1365 second petition or successive petitions for similar relief on 1366 behalf of a petitioner unless division (A) (1) or (2) of this 1367 section applies: 1368

(1) Both of the following apply: 1369

(a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was 1370 unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the 1371 petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or, 1372 subsequent to the period prescribed in division (A) (2) of 1373 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an 1374 earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a 1375 new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons 1376 in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim 1377 based on that right. 1378

(b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence
1379
that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable
factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense
1381
of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim
challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional
error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would
1384
have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence.

(2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the
petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed
under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under
1388

1360

1361

former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the 1389 context of and upon consideration of all available admissible 1390 evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division 1391 (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of 1392 the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1393 actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was 1394 sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1395 actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or 1396 circumstances the person was found quilty of committing and that 1397 is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 1398

As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same 1399 meaning as in division (A)(1)(b)(c) of section 2953.21 of the 1400 Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" 1401 has the same meaning as in division (A)(1)(c)(d) of section 1402 2953.21 of the Revised Code. 1403

(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a 1404
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code 1405
is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter 1406
2953. of the Revised Code. 1407

If a petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the 1408 Revised Code by a person who has been sentenced to death is 1409 denied and the person appeals the judgment, notwithstanding any 1410 law or court rule to the contrary, there is no limit on the 1411 number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or 1412 briefs related to an appeal filed by the person. If any court 1413 rule specifies a limit on the number of pages in, or on the 1414 length of, a notice of appeal or briefs described in this 1415 division or on a prosecuting attorney's response or briefs with 1416 respect to such an appeal and a person who has been sentenced to 1417 death files a notice of appeal or briefs that exceed the limit 1418

specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may file a	1419
response or briefs that exceed the limit specified for the	1420
answer or briefs.	1421
Section 2. That existing sections 2929.02, 2929.022,	1422
2929.024, 2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the	1423
Revised Code are hereby repealed.	1424
Section 3. Notwithstanding section 1.50 of the Revised	1425
Section 3. Notwithstanding section 1.50 of the Revised Code, if any provision of a section as amended or enacted by	1425 1426
Code, if any provision of a section as amended or enacted by	1426
Code, if any provision of a section as amended or enacted by this act is determined to be unconstitutional or otherwise	1426 1427