## As Introduced

## **134th General Assembly**

## **Regular Session**

2021-2022

### **Representatives Leland, Hicks-Hudson**

Cosponsors: Representatives Kelly, Ingram, Addison, Smith, K., Lightbody, Humphrey, Upchurch, Davis, Miranda, Weinstein, Liston, Blackshear, Brown, Miller, J., Sobecki, Lepore-Hagan, Boggs, Sheehy, Brent, Robinson, West

# A BILL

| То | amend sections 181.25, 2929.06, 2953.21, and     | 1 |
|----|--|---|
|    | 2953.23 and to enact sections 181.26 and 2953.85 | 2 |
|    | of the Revised Code to make changes to the law   | 3 |
|    | regarding postconviction relief proceedings and  | 4 |
|    | to establish the Ohio Innocence Commission.      | 5 |

## BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

| Section 1. That sections 181.25, 2929.06, 2953.21, and           | 6  |
|--|----|
| 2953.23 be amended and sections 181.26 and 2953.85 of the        | 7  |
| Revised Code be enacted to read as follows:                      | 8  |
| Sec. 181.25. (A) If the comprehensive criminal sentencing        | 9  |
| structure that it recommends to the general assembly pursuant to | 10 |
| section 181.24 of the Revised Code or any aspects of that        | 11 |
| sentencing structure are enacted into law, the state criminal    | 12 |
| sentencing commission shall do all of the following:             | 13 |
| (1) Assist the general assembly in the implementation of         | 14 |
| those aspects of the sentencing structure that are enacted into  | 15 |
| law;   | 16 |

H. B. No. 738

#### H. B. No. 738 As Introduced

(2) Monitor the operation of the aspects of the sentencing
17
structure that are enacted into law and report to the general
assembly no later than January 1, 1997, and biennially
thereafter, on all of the following matters:

(a) The impact of the sentencing structure in effect on and after July 1, 1996, on political subdivisions and other relevant aspects of local government in this state, including all of the following information:

(i) The number and type of offenders who were being imprisoned in a state correctional institution under the law in effect prior to July 1, 1996, but who are being punished under a community control sanction, as defined in section 2929.01 of the Revised Code, under the law in effect on and after July 1, 1996;

(ii) The fiscal and other impact of the law in effect on 30 and after July 1, 1996, on political subdivisions and other 31 relevant aspects of local government in this state, including 32 law enforcement agencies, the court system, prosecutors, as 33 defined in section 2935.01 of the Revised Code, the public 34 defender and assigned counsel system, jails and workhouses, 35 probation departments, the drug and alcohol abuse intervention 36 and treatment system, and the mental health intervention and 37 treatment system. 38

(b) The impact of the sentencing structure in effect on 39 and after July 1, 1996, on the population of state correctional 40 institutions, including information regarding the number and 41 types of offenders who are being imprisoned under the law in 42 effect on and after July 1, 1996, and the amount of space in 43 state correctional institutions that is necessary to house those 44 offenders; 45

Page 2

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

(c) The impact of the sentencing structure and the 46 sentence appeal provisions in effect on and after July 1, 1996, 47 on the appellate courts of this state, including information 48 regarding the number of sentence-based appeals, the cost of 49 reviewing appeals of that nature, whether a special court should 50 be created to review sentences, and whether changes should be 51 made to ensure that sentence-based appeals are conducted 52 expeditiously. 53

(3) Review all bills that are introduced in the general assembly that provide for new criminal offenses or that change the penalty for any criminal offense, determine if those bills are consistent with the sentencing policy adopted under division (B) of section 181.23 of the Revised Code, determine the impact of those bills upon the correctional resources of the state, and recommend to the general assembly any necessary amendments to those bills. When the commission recommends any amendment for a bill before the general assembly, it shall do so in a manner that is consistent with the requirements of section 181.24 of the Revised Code.

(4) Study criminal sentencing structures in this state,
other states, and the federal government, recommend necessary
changes to the sentencing structure of the state, and determine
the costs and effects of any proposed changes in the sentencing
structure of the state;
69

(5) Collect and maintain data that pertains to the cost to70counties of the felony sentence appeal provisions set forth in71section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, of the postconviction72relief proceeding provisions set forth in division (A) (2) of73section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, and of appeals from74judgments entered in such postconviction relief proceedings. The75

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

#### H. B. No. 738 As Introduced

data so collected and maintained shall include, but shall not be76limited to, the increase in expenses that counties experience as77a result of those provisions and those appeals and the number of78felony sentence appeals made, postconviction relief proceedings79filed, and appeals of postconviction relief proceeding judgments80made in each county under those provisions.81

(B) In addition to its duties set forth in section 181.24
66 the Revised Code and division (A) of this section, the state
76 criminal sentencing commission shall review all forfeiture
76 statutes in Titles XXIX and XLV of the Revised Code and, not
78 later than July 1, 2002, recommend to the general assembly any
78 necessary changes to those statutes.

Sec. 181.26. (A) Each appellate court shall collect and 88 maintain data that pertains to the felony sentence appeal 89 provisions set forth in section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the 90 postconviction relief proceeding provisions set forth in 91 division (B)(2) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, and the 92 appeals from judgments entered in such postconviction relief 93 proceedings. The data so collected and maintained shall include, 94 but shall not be limited to, the number of convictions resulting 95 from a plea, the number of convictions resulting from a trial, 96 the number of persons convicted of any given offense, the number 97 of grounds relied upon in postconviction relief proceedings, the 98 number of appeals filed, the percentage of appeals filed, the 99 number of appeals that affirm a conviction, the number of 100 appeals that reverse a conviction, the number of appeals that 101 are remanded, and of the cases that are remanded, the number of 102 cases that are dismissed, stayed, or terminated, including the 103 reasons for each dismissal, stay, or termination. 104

(B) Beginning in 2024, not later than the fifteenth day of

Page 4

| January of each year, each appellate court shall file an annual  | 106 |
|--|-----|
| report with the state criminal sentencing commission that        | 107 |
| includes the data collected in the prior year.                   | 108 |
| Sec. 2929.06. (A)(1) If a sentence of death imposed upon         | 109 |
| an offender is set aside, nullified, vacated, or voided for any  | 110 |
| of the following reasons, the trial court that sentenced the     | 111 |
| offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender in   | 112 |
| accordance with division (A)(2) of this section:                 | 113 |
| (a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of       | 114 |
| death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1,     | 115 |
| 1995, or the supreme court, in a case in which the supreme court | 116 |
| reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the sentence  | 117 |
| of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05 of the   | 118 |
| Revised Code.  | 119 |
| (b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for             | 120 |
| imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections     | 121 |
| 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional.     | 122 |
| (c) The sentence of death is set aside, nullified, or            | 123 |
| vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the       | 124 |
| Revised Code.  | 125 |
| (d) A court has determined that the offender is a person         | 126 |
| with an intellectual disability under standards set forth in     | 127 |
| decisions of the supreme court of this state or the United       | 128 |
| States supreme court.  | 129 |
| (e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to       | 130 |
| division $(H)$ (I) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.       | 131 |
| (2) At a resentencing hearing conducted under division (A)       | 132 |

(1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender a
sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting
134

of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 135 imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division. 136 If the sentence of death was voided by a court pursuant to 137 division (H) (I) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, the 138 offender has waived any right to be sentenced to any sentence 139 other than life imprisonment without parole as described in 140 division  $\frac{(A)(3)(b)}{(B)}$  (B)(3)(b) of that section and the court shall 141 impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole. If the 142 143 immediately preceding sentence does not apply and if division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the time the 144 offender committed the aggravated murder for which the sentence 145 of death was imposed, required the imposition when a sentence of 146 death was not imposed of a sentence of life imprisonment without 147 parole or a sentence of an indefinite term consisting of a 148 minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 149 imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or (B) (3) of 150 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant to that 151 section, except as provided in division (F) of this section, the 1.52 court shall impose the sentence so required. In all other cases, 153 except as provided in division (F) of this section, the 154 sentences of life imprisonment that are available at the 155 hearing, and from which the court shall impose sentence, shall 156 be the same sentences of life imprisonment that were available 157 under division (D) of section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 158 of the Revised Code at the time the offender committed the 159 offense for which the sentence of death was imposed. Nothing in 160 this division regarding the resentencing of an offender shall 161 affect the operation of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. 162

(B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court
sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed
upon an offender because of error that occurred in the
165

sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this 166 section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the 167 offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender. 168 If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall 169 impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by 170 a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new 171 panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing, 172 the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in 173 division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in 174 determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of 175 death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term 176 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 177 of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court 178 or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a 179 sentence of death, except as provided in division (F) of this 180 section, the court or panel shall impose upon the offender one 181 of the sentences of life imprisonment that could have been 182 imposed at the time the offender committed the offense for which 183 the sentence of death was imposed, determined as specified in 184 this division, or an indefinite term consisting of a minimum 185 term of thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment 186 that is determined as specified in this division. If division 187 (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the time the 188 offender committed the aggravated murder for which the sentence 189 of death was imposed, required the imposition when a sentence of 190 death was not imposed of a sentence of life imprisonment without 191 parole or a sentence of an indefinite term consisting of a 192 minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life 193 imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or (B) (3) of 194 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant to that 195 section, except as provided in division (F) of this section, the 196 court or panel shall impose the sentence so required. In all 197

other cases, except as provided in division (F) of this section, 198 the sentences of life imprisonment that are available at the 199 hearing, and from which the court or panel shall impose 200 sentence, shall be the same sentences of life imprisonment that 201 were available under division (D) of section 2929.03 or under 202 section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time the offender 203 committed the offense for which the sentence of death was 204 205 imposed.

(C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 206 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 207 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 208 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the 209 sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 210 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 211 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender 212 shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 213 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 214 full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole 215 eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 216

(D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of that nature otherwise would be available.

(E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th
general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been
sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed
on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was
committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by
H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to
all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after

Page 8

217

218

219

March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are 228 challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence 229 of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court 230 of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23, 231 2005, have not yet been resentenced. 232

(F) A court shall not impose a sentence of life
233
imprisonment without parole on a person under division (A) or
(B) of this section for an offense that was committed when the
235
person was under eighteen years of age.
236

#### Sec. 2953.21. (A) (A) (A) As used in this section: 237

(1) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the 238 DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the 239 Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code 240 been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in 241 the context of and upon consideration of all available 242 admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in 243 division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no 244 reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner quilty of 245 the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the 246 person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would 247 have found the petitioner quilty of the aggravating circumstance 248 or circumstances the petitioner was found quilty of committing 249 and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 250

(2) "Former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means251section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July2526, 2010.253

(3) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in254section 2929.025 of the Revised Code.255

(B) (1) (a) A person in any of the following categories may 256

file a petition in the court that imposed sentence, stating the 257 grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court to vacate 258 or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant other 259 appropriate relief: 260

(i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal
 offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that
 there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights
 as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio
 Constitution or the Constitution of the United States;

(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense and sentenced to death and who claims that there was a denial or infringement of the person's rights under either of those Constitutions that creates a reasonable probability of an altered verdict;

(iii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense that is a felony and who is an offender for whom DNA testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of all available admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death;

(iv) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated285murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims286

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the287commission of the offense and that as a result the court should288render void the sentence of death, with the filing of the289petition constituting the waiver described in division (A) (3) (b)290(B) (3) (b) of this section.291

(b) A petitioner under division (A) (1) (a) (B) (1) (a) of
292
this section may file a supporting affidavit and other
293
documentary evidence in support of the claim for relief.
294

(c) As used in division (A)(1)(a) of this section:

(i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the 296 DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the 297 Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code 298 been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in-299 the context of and upon consideration of all available-300 301 admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no-302 reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of 303 the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the 304 person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would 305 have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance 306 or circumstances the petitioner was found quilty of committing 307 and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 308

(ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in 309 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code. 310

(d) As used in divisions (A) (1) (a) and (c) of this311section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means312section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July3136, 2010.314

 $\frac{(e)}{(c)}$  At any time in conjunction with the filing of a 315

petition for postconviction relief under division  $\frac{(A)}{(B)}$  of 316 this section by a person who has been sentenced to death, or 317 with the litigation of a petition so filed, the court, for good 318 cause shown, may authorize the petitioner in seeking the 319 postconviction relief and the prosecuting attorney of the county 320 served by the court in defending the proceeding, to take 321 depositions and to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in 322 accordance with divisions (A) (1) (e) (B) (1) (c), (A) (1) (f) (B) (1) 323 (d), and  $\frac{(C)}{(D)}$  (D) of this section, and to any other form of 324 325 discovery as in a civil action that the court in its discretion permits. The court may limit the extent of discovery under this 326 division. Prior to requesting copies of discovery that was made 327 under Criminal Rule 16 at the time of trial, the petitioner 328 shall make a good faith effort to obtain such discovery from 329 counsel. In addition to discovery that is relevant to the claim 330 and was available under Criminal Rule 16 through conclusion of 331 the original criminal trial, the court, for good cause shown, 332 may authorize the petitioner or prosecuting attorney to take 333 depositions and issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in 334 either of the following circumstances: 335 (i) For any witness who testified at trial or who was 336

disclosed by the state prior to trial, except as otherwise 337 provided in this division, the petitioner or prosecuting 338 attorney shows clear and convincing evidence that the witness is 339 material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of 340 a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to 341 substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a 342 reasonable probability of an altered verdict. This division does 343 not apply if the witness was unavailable for trial or would not 344 voluntarily be interviewed by the defendant or prosecuting 345 attorney. 346

#### H. B. No. 738 As Introduced

(f) (d) If a person who has been sentenced to death and 354 who files a petition for postconviction relief under division 355 356 (A) (B) of this section requests postconviction discovery as described in division (A) (1) (e) (B) (1) (c) of this section or if 357 the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court 358 requests postconviction discovery as described in that division, 359 within ten days after the docketing of the request, or within 360 any other time that the court sets for good cause shown, the 361 prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or motion to the 362 petitioner's request or the petitioner shall respond by answer 363 or motion to the prosecuting attorney's request, whichever is 364 365 applicable.

366 (g) (e) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who files a petition for postconviction relief under division 367 (A) (B) of this section requests postconviction discovery as 368 described in division (A) (1) (e) (B) (1) (c) of this section or if 369 the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court 370 requests postconviction discovery as described in that division, 371 upon motion by the petitioner, the prosecuting attorney, or the 372 person from whom discovery is sought, and for good cause shown, 373 the court in which the action is pending may make any order that 374 justice requires to protect a party or person from oppression or 375 undue burden or expense, including but not limited to the orders 376 described in divisions (A) (1) (h) (i) (B) (1) (f) (i) to (viii) of 377

#### H. B. No. 738 As Introduced

this section. The court also may make any such order if, in its378discretion, it determines that the discovery sought would be379irrelevant to the claims made in the petition; and if the court380makes any such order on that basis, it shall explain in the381order the reasons why the discovery would be irrelevant.382

(h) (f) If a petitioner, prosecuting attorney, or person 383 from whom discovery is sought makes a motion for an order under 384 division (A) (1) (g) (B) (1) (e) of this section and the order is 385 denied in whole or in part, the court, on terms and conditions 386 as are just, may order that any party or person provide or 387 permit discovery as described in division (A) (1) (e) (B) (1) (c) of 388 this section. The provisions of Civil Rule 37(A)(4) apply to the 389 award of expenses incurred in relation to the motion, except 390 that in no case shall a court require a petitioner who is 391 indigent to pay expenses under those provisions. 392

Before any person moves for an order under division (A) (1)393(g) (B) (1) (e) of this section, that person shall make a394reasonable effort to resolve the matter through discussion with395the petitioner or prosecuting attorney seeking discovery. A396motion for an order under division (A) (1) (g) (B) (1) (e) of this397section shall be accompanied by a statement reciting the effort398made to resolve the matter in accordance with this paragraph.399

The orders that may be made under division (A) (1) (g) (B)400(1) (e) of this section include, but are not limited to, any of401the following:402

(i) That the discovery not be had;

(ii) That the discovery may be had only on specified termsand conditions, including a designation of the time or place;405

(iii) That the discovery may be had only by a method of 406

| discovery other than that selected by the party seeking discovery;  | 407<br>408                      |
|---|---------------------------------|
| (iv) That certain matters not be inquired into or that the scope of the discovery be limited to certain matters;  | 409<br>410                      |
| <ul><li>(v) That discovery be conducted with no one present except<br/>persons designated by the court;</li></ul>   | 411<br>412                      |
| (vi) That a deposition after being sealed be opened only by order of the court;   | 413<br>414                      |
| (vii) That a trade secret or other confidential research,<br>development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be<br>disclosed only in a designated way;   | 415<br>416<br>417               |
| (viii) That the parties simultaneously file specified<br>documents or information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be<br>opened as directed by the court.  | 418<br>419<br>420               |
| (i) (g) Any postconviction discovery authorized under division $(A)(1)(e) - (B)(1)(c)$ of this section shall be completed not later than eighteen months after the start of the discovery proceedings unless, for good cause shown, the court extends that period for completing the discovery. | 421<br>422<br>423<br>424<br>425 |
| <u>(j) (h)</u> Nothing in division $(A)(1)(e) - (B)(1)(c)$ of this section authorizes, or shall be construed as authorizing, the relitigation, or discovery in support of relitigation, of any matter barred by the doctrine of res judicata.   | 426<br>427<br>428<br>429        |
| (k) (i) Division $(A)$ (1) (B) (1) of this section does not<br>apply to any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense<br>and sentenced to death and who has unsuccessfully raised the<br>same claims in a petition for postconviction relief.   | 430<br>431<br>432<br>433        |

(2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of 434

the Revised Code, a A petition under division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) 435 (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section shall be filed no later 436 than three hundred sixty-five days after the date on which the 437 trial transcript is filed in the court of appeals in the direct 438 appeal of the judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the 439 direct appeal involves a sentence of death, the date on which 440 the trial transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal 441 is taken, except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the 442 Revised Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three 443 hundred sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for 444 445 filing the appeal. (b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the 446 Revised Code, a A petition under division (A) (1) (a) (iv) (B) (1) 447 (a) (iv) of this section shall be filed not later than three 448 hundred sixty-five days after the effective date of this 449 amendment April 12, 2021. 4.50 (c) A court may consider a petition filed after the 451 expiration of the time period described in division (B)(2)(a) or 452 (b) of this section if one of the following applies: 453 (i) The petitioner has demonstrated cause for the untimely 454 filing and prejudice from the denial or infringement of the 455 petitioner's rights. 456 (ii) The failure to consider the petition would result in 457 manifest injustice. 458 (iii) The United States supreme court or Ohio supreme 459 court recognized a new federal or state right that applies 460 retroactively to persons in the petitioner's situation, and the 461 petition asserts a claim based on that right. 462 (iv) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the 463

| petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed     | 464 |
|--|-----|
| under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under   | 465 |
| former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the   | 466 |
| context of and upon consideration of all available admissible    | 467 |
| evidence related to the person's case as described in division   | 468 |
| (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of   | 469 |
| the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence,     | 470 |
| actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was    | 471 |
| sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, | 472 |
| actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or              | 473 |
| circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that | 474 |
| is or are the basis of that sentence of death.                   | 475 |

(3) (a) In a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to death may ask the court to render void or voidable the judgment with respect to the conviction of aggravated murder or the specification of an aggravating circumstance or the sentence of death.

(b) A person sentenced to death who files a petition under 482 division (A) (1) (a) (iv) (B) (1) (a) (iv) of this section may ask the 483 court to render void the sentence of death and to order the 484 resentencing of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06 485 of the Revised Code. If a person sentenced to death files such a 486 petition and asks the court to render void the sentence of death 487 and to order the resentencing of the person under division (A) 488 of section 2929.06 of the Revised Code, the act of filing the 489 petition constitutes a waiver of any right to be sentenced under 490 the law that existed at the time the offense was committed and 491 constitutes consent to be sentenced to life imprisonment without 492 parole under division (A) of section 2929.06 of the Revised 493 Code. 494

476

477

478

479

480

#### H. B. No. 738 As Introduced

(4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended
(4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended
(4) petition filed under division (A) (B) of this section all
(4) 496
(4) grounds for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided
(4) 497
(4) in section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any Any ground for
(4) 498
(4) relief that is not so stated in the petition is waived.

(5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 500 (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section was 501 convicted of or pleaded quilty to a felony, the petition may 502 include a claim that the petitioner was denied the equal 503 protection of the laws in violation of the Ohio Constitution or 504 the United States Constitution because the sentence imposed upon 505 the petitioner for the felony was part of a consistent pattern 506 507 of disparity in sentencing by the judge who imposed the sentence, with regard to the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic 508 background, or religion. If the supreme court adopts a rule 509 requiring a court of common pleas to maintain information with 510 regard to an offender's race, gender, ethnic background, or 511 religion, the supporting evidence for the petition shall 512 include, but shall not be limited to, a copy of that type of 513 information relative to the petitioner's sentence and copies of 514 that type of information relative to sentences that the same 515 judge imposed upon other persons. 516

(6) Notwithstanding any law or court rule to the contrary, 517 there is no limit on the number of pages in, or on the length 518 of, a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), 519 (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section by a person who has been 520 sentenced to death. If any court rule specifies a limit on the 521 number of pages in, or on the length of, a petition filed under 522 division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this 523 section or on a prosecuting attorney's response to such a 524 petition by answer or motion and a person who has been sentenced 525

to death files a petition that exceeds the limit specified for526the petition, the prosecuting attorney may respond by an answer527or motion that exceeds the limit specified for the response.528

(B) (C) The clerk of the court in which the petition for 529 postconviction relief and, if applicable, a request for 530 postconviction discovery described in division (A)(1)(e) (B)(1) 531 (c) of this section is filed shall docket the petition and the 532 request and bring them promptly to the attention of the court. 533 The clerk of the court in which the petition for postconviction 534 relief and, if applicable, a request for postconviction 535 536 discovery described in division  $\frac{(A)(1)(e)}{(B)(1)(c)}$  of this section is filed immediately shall forward a copy of the 537 petition and a copy of the request if filed by the petitioner to 538 the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court. If 539 the request for postconviction discovery is filed by the 540 prosecuting attorney, the clerk of the court immediately shall 541 forward a copy of the request to the petitioner or the 542 petitioner's counsel. 543

(C) (D) If a person who has been sentenced to death and 544 who files a petition for postconviction relief under division 545 (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section 546 requests a deposition or the prosecuting attorney in the case 547 requests a deposition, and if the court grants the request under 548 division  $\frac{(A)(1)(e)(B)(1)(c)}{(B)(1)(c)}$  of this section, the court shall 549 notify the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel and the 550 prosecuting attorney. The deposition shall be conducted pursuant 551 to divisions (B), (D), and (E) of Criminal Rule 15. 552 Notwithstanding division (C) of Criminal Rule 15, the petitioner 553 is not entitled to attend the deposition. The prosecuting 554 attorney shall be permitted to attend and participate in any 555 deposition. 556

(D) (E) The court shall consider a petition that is timely 557 filed within the period specified in division  $\frac{(A)(2)}{(B)(2)}$  of 558 this section even if a direct appeal of the judgment is pending. 559 Before granting a hearing on a petition filed under division (A) 560 (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (iii), (iii), or (iv) of this section, the 561 court shall determine whether there are substantive grounds for 562 relief. In making such a determination, the court shall 563 consider, in addition to the petition, the supporting 564 affidavits, and the documentary evidence, all the files and 565 records pertaining to the proceedings against the petitioner, 566 including, but not limited to, the indictment, the court's 567 journal entries, the journalized records of the clerk of the 568 court, and the court reporter's transcript. The court reporter's 569 transcript, if ordered and certified by the court, shall be 570 taxed as court costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it 571 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law with 572 respect to such dismissal. If the petition was filed by a person-573 who has been sentenced to death, the The findings of fact and 574 conclusions of law shall state specifically the reasons for the 575 dismissal of the petition and of each claim it contains. 576

(E) (F) Within ten days after the docketing of the 577 petition, or within any further time that the court may fix for 578 good cause shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by 579 answer or motion. Division (A) (6) (B) (6) of this section applies 580 with respect to the prosecuting attorney's response. Within 581 twenty days from the date the issues are raised, either party 582 may move for summary judgment. The right to summary judgment 583 shall appear on the face of the record. 584

(F) (G) Unless the petition and the files and records of585the case, viewed in the light most favorable to the petitioner,586show the petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court shall587

proceed to a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct 588 appeal of the case is pending. If the court notifies the parties 589 that it has found grounds for granting relief, either party may 590 request an appellate court in which a direct appeal of the 591 judgment is pending to remand the pending case to the court. 592

With respect to a petition filed under division (A) (1) (a) 593 (iv) (B) (1) (a) (iv) of this section, the procedures and rules 594 regarding introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the 595 pretrial hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and 596 (F) of section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering 597 the petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for 598 granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one 599 or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of 600 section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of 601 the aggravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of 602 death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the 603 person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of 604 that section. 605

(G) (H) A petitioner who files a petition under division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section may amend the petition as follows:

(1) If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to death, at <u>At</u> any time that is not later than one hundred eighty days after the petition is filed, the petitioner may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the proceedings.

(2) If division (G) (1) of this section does not apply, at
any time before the answer or motion is filed, the petitioner
615
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the
616
proceedings.

606 607

608

609

610

611

612

(3) The petitioner may amend the petition with leave of618court at any time after the expiration of the applicable period619specified in division (G)(1) or (2) (H)(1) of this section.620

(H) (3) If the petitioner amends the petition pursuant to621division (H) (1) or (2) of this section, at any time after the622answer or motion is filed by the prosecuting attorney, the court623shall permit the prosecuting attorney to file an amended answer624or motion. The prosecuting attorney may amend the answer or625motion during the time period described in division (F) of this626section.627

(I) If the court does not find grounds for granting 628 relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions 629 of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition. 630 If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to 631 death, the The findings of fact and conclusions of law shall 632 state specifically the reasons for the denial of relief on the 633 petition and of each claim it contains. If no direct appeal of 634 the case is pending and the court finds grounds for relief or if 635 a pending direct appeal of the case has been remanded to the 636 court pursuant to a request made pursuant to division  $\frac{(F)}{(G)}$  of 637 this section and the court finds grounds for granting relief, it 638 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law and 639 shall enter a judgment that vacates and sets aside the judgment 640 in question, and, in the case of a petitioner who is a prisoner 641 in custody, except as otherwise described in this division, 642 shall discharge or resentence the petitioner or grant a new 643 trial as the court determines appropriate. If the court finds 644 grounds for relief in the case of a petitioner who filed a 645 petition under division (A) (1) (a) (iv) (B) (1) (a) (iv) of this 646 section, the court shall render void the sentence of death and 647 order the resentencing of the offender under division (A) of 648

section 2929.06 of the Revised Code. If the petitioner has been 649 sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law 650 shall state specifically the reasons for the finding of grounds 651 for granting the relief, with respect to each claim contained in 652 the petition. The court also may make supplementary orders to 653 the relief granted, concerning such matters as rearraignment, 654 retrial, custody, and bail. If the trial court's order granting 655 the petition is reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of 656 the case has been remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a 657 request under division (F) (G) of this section, the appellate 658 court reversing the order granting the petition shall notify the 659 appellate court in which the direct appeal of the case was 660 pending at the time of the remand of the reversal and remand of 661 the trial court's order. Upon the reversal and remand of the 662 trial court's order granting the petition, regardless of whether 663 notice is sent or received, the direct appeal of the case that 664 was remanded is reinstated. 665

(I) (J) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A) (1) (a) (i) (B) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section by a person sentenced to death, only the supreme court may stay execution of the sentence of death.

(J) (1) (K) (1) If a person sentenced to death intends to 670 file a petition under this section, the court shall appoint 671 counsel to represent the person upon a finding that the person 672 is indigent and that the person either accepts the appointment 673 of counsel or is unable to make a competent decision whether to 674 accept or reject the appointment of counsel. The court may 675 decline to appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, 676 after a hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the 677 appointment of counsel and understands the legal consequences of 678 that decision or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. 679

666

667

668

(2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division 680 (J) (1) (1) of this section an attorney who represented the 681 petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates 682 unless the person and the attorney expressly request the 683 appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division 684 (J) (1) (K) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified 685 under Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of 686 Ohio to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted 687 of an offense for which the death penalty can be or has been 688 imposed. The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during 689 proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds a 690 separate ground for relief in a proceeding under this section, 691 in an appeal of any action under this section, or in an 692 application to reopen a direct appeal, but may be considered for 693 purposes of actual innocence under this section. 694

(3) Division (J) (K) of this section does not preclude 695 attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the 696 provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that 697 were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July 698 1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were 699 700 represented in proceedings under this section by one or more counsel appointed by the court under this section or section 701 120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those 702 appointed counsel meet the requirements of division (J)(2) (K) 703 (2) of this section. 704

(K) (4) (a) If a person who has not been sentenced to death705intends to file a petition under this section, the court shall706appoint counsel to represent the person upon a finding that the707person is indigent and a motion by the person or the person's708counsel demonstrating that under the person's postconviction709claim there is a reasonable probability of an altered verdict. A710

motion made pursuant to this division may include a request for 711 712 an ex parte order. (b) Notwithstanding division (K)(4)(a) of this section, a 713 court, in its discretion, may appoint counsel for an indigent 714 person who has not been sentenced to death regardless of whether 715 the person or the person's counsel has filed a motion 716 demonstrating that under the person's postconviction claim there 717 is a reasonable probability of an altered verdict. 718 (L) Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony that 719 is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the remedy 720 set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by which a 721 person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity of a 722 conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the validity of 723 an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for the 724 commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if 725 committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of 726 disposition. 727 Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a 728 petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, 729 a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration 730 of the period prescribed in division (A) of that section or a 731 second petition or successive petitions for similar relief on 732 behalf of a petitioner unless division (A) (1) or (2) of this 733 section applies: 734 (1) Both of the following apply: 735 (a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was 736 unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the 737

petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or, 738 subsequent to the period prescribed in division  $\frac{(A)(2)}{(B)(2)}$  of 739 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an 740 earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a 741 new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons 742 in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim 743 based on that right. 744

(b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence
745
that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable
746
factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense
747
of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim
748
challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional
749
error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would
750
have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence.

(2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the 752 petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed 753 under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under 754 former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the 755 context of and upon consideration of all available admissible 756 evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division 757 (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of 758 the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 759 actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was 760 sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 761 762 actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that 763 is or are the basis of that sentence of death. 764

As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same 765 meaning as in division (A) (1) (c) (A) (1) of section 2953.21 of 766 the Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised 767 Code" has the same meaning as in division (A) (1) (d) (A) (2) of 768 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code. 769

(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a 770
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code 771
is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter 772
2953. of the Revised Code. 773

If a petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the 774 Revised Code by a person who has been sentenced to death is 775 denied and the person appeals the judgment, notwithstanding any 776 law or court rule to the contrary, there is no limit on the 777 number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or 778 briefs related to an appeal filed by the person. If any court 779 780 rule specifies a limit on the number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or briefs described in this 781 division or on a prosecuting attorney's response or briefs with 782 respect to such an appeal and a person who has been sentenced to 783 death files a notice of appeal or briefs that exceed the limit 784 specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may file a 785 response or briefs that exceed the limit specified for the 786 answer or briefs. 787

Sec. 2953.85. (A) There is hereby created the Ohio788innocence commission. The purpose of the commission is to create789an independent entity within Ohio's justice system to790investigate and determine claims of innocence.791

(B) The Ohio innocence commission shall consist of eight792members: one court of common pleas judge, one prosecuting793attorney, one victim advocate, one criminal defense attorney,794one member of the public who is not an attorney or an officer or795employee of the judiciary, one sheriff, and two other persons796whose vocation shall be at the discretion of the chief justice797of the Ohio supreme court.798

(C) The chief justice of the Ohio supreme court shall 799

| appoint the members of the Ohio innocence commission, who shall  | 800 |
|--|-----|
| serve for three-year terms. In the event of a vacancy, the chief |     |
| justice shall appoint a replacement member. The chairperson      | 802 |
| shall be the court of common pleas judge. A majority of the      |     |
| members constitutes a quorum.                                    | 804 |
| (D) Members shall serve without compensation but shall           | 805 |
| receive reasonable and necessary expenses incurred in the        | 806 |
| conduct of commission business. The commission shall meet a      | 807 |
| minimum of once every six months and may also meet more often at | 808 |
| the call of the chairperson.                                     | 809 |
| (E)(1) The Ohio innocence commission shall be an                 | 810 |
| independent, neutral, fact-finding entity empowered to           | 811 |
| investigate claims of innocence arising out of felony            | 812 |
| convictions from any court of common pleas. The commission staff | 813 |
| shall be a professional staff insulated from political pressure  | 814 |
| aimed at overturning or validating criminal convictions.         | 815 |
| (2) The commission's authority to review claims shall be         | 816 |
| limited to claims where the claimant has, with the benefit of    | 817 |
| counsel, waived the claimant's fifth amendment right and         |     |
| attorney-client privilege reasonably related to the claim of     |     |
| innocence.   | 820 |
| (3) The commission shall be empowered to issue subpoenas         | 821 |
| for documents, compel the attendance of witnesses, and utilize   | 822 |
| the methods of discovery available under the Rules of Criminal   | 823 |
| Procedure and the Rules of Civil Procedure.                      | 824 |
| (4) The commission shall have the power to inspect,              | 825 |
| examine, and temporarily take possession of physical evidence    | 826 |
| for forensic examination or testing.                             |     |
| (5) The commission's authority, policies, and practices          | 828 |

shall be consistent with the Ohio Constitution, Article I, 829 section 10a. 830 (6) Subject to limited exceptions to be determined by the 831 supreme court involving circumstances where exculpatory evidence 832 or inculpatory evidence is discovered during its investigation, 833 as well as in cases where there is sufficient evidence to 834 warrant a public hearing on the claim, the commission's work 835 product shall be confidential. 836 837 (7) In a case where the commission believes a viable claim of innocence has been established, a specially authorized three-838 judge panel, established by the supreme court and composed of 839 sitting appellate court judges from outside the appellate 840 district where the case arose shall consider the matter. 841 Judicial proceedings shall be public and shall provide an 842 opportunity for the defendant or the defendant through counsel, 843 the prosecutor, and the victim to be heard. If the judicial 844 panel finds the defendant to be innocent, the panel shall be 845 authorized to take appropriate remedial measures, as authorized 846 by rules adopted by the supreme court, and the conviction shall 847 848 be vacated. 849 (F) The supreme court shall adopt rules establishing procedures and standards necessary to implement this section. 850 Section 2. That existing sections 181.25, 2929.06, 851 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the Revised Code are hereby repealed. 852 Section 3. Section 2929.06 of the Revised Code is 853 presented in this act as a composite of the section as amended 854 by both H.B. 136 and S.B. 256 of the 133rd General Assembly. The 855 General Assembly, applying the principle stated in division (B) 856

of section 1.52 of the Revised Code that amendments are to be

Page 29

harmonized if

| reasonably  | capable of simultaneous operation,      | 858 |
|-------------|---|-----|
| e composite | is the resulting version of the section | 859 |

| finds that the composite is the resulting version of the sect. | ion |
|--|-----|
| in effect prior to the effective date of the section as        |     |
| presented in this act.   |     |