As Introduced

135th General Assembly

Regular Session 2023-2024

H. B. No. 594

Representatives Jarrells, Williams

Cosponsors: Representatives Grim, Isaacsohn, Brewer, Somani, Piccolantonio, Upchurch, Sims, Skindell, Thomas, C., Brent, Rogers, Mohamed, Dell'Aquila, Blackshear, Humphrey, Sweeney, Dobos, Willis, Klopfenstein, Gross, White, Schmidt, Russo

A BILL

То	amend sections 181.25, 2929.06, 2945.79,	1
	2945.80, 2945.81, 2953.21, and 2953.23 and to	2
	enact section 2945.811 of the Revised Code to	3
	allow a person to file a motion for a new trial	4
	or a petition for postconviction relief if the	5
	person produces new evidence that would	6
	establish a strong probability of a different	7
	result at trial.	8

BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That sections 181.25, 2929.06, 2945.79,	9
2945.80, 2945.81, 2953.21, and 2953.23 be amended and section	10
2945.811 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as follows:	11
Sec. 181.25. (A) If the comprehensive criminal sentencing	12
bec. 101.25. (ii) If the complementative elimination benefiting	
structure that it recommends to the general assembly pursuant to	13
section 181.24 of the Revised Code or any aspects of that	14
sentencing structure are enacted into law, the state criminal	15
sentencing commission shall do all of the following:	16

(1) Assist the general assembly in the implementation of	17
those aspects of the sentencing structure that are enacted into	18
law;	19
(2) Monitor the operation of the aspects of the sentencing	20
structure that are enacted into law and report to the general	21
assembly no later than January 1, 1997, and biennially	22
thereafter, on all of the following matters:	23
(a) The impact of the sentencing structure in effect on	24
and after July 1, 1996, on political subdivisions and other	25
relevant aspects of local government in this state, including	26
all of the following information:	27
(i) The number and type of offenders who were being	28
imprisoned in a state correctional institution under the law in	29
effect prior to July 1, 1996, but who are being punished under a	30
community control sanction, as defined in section 2929.01 of the	31
Revised Code, under the law in effect on and after July 1, 1996;	32
(ii) The fiscal and other impact of the law in effect on	33
and after July 1, 1996, on political subdivisions and other	34
relevant aspects of local government in this state, including	35
law enforcement agencies, the court system, prosecutors, as	36
defined in section 2935.01 of the Revised Code, the public	37
defender and assigned counsel system, jails and workhouses,	38
probation departments, the drug and alcohol abuse intervention	39
and treatment system, and the mental health intervention and	40
treatment system.	41
(b) The impact of the sentencing structure in effect on	42
and after July 1, 1996, on the population of state correctional	43
institutions, including information regarding the number and	44
types of offenders who are being imprisoned under the law in	45

effect on and after July 1, 1996, and the amount of space in	46
state correctional institutions that is necessary to house those	47
offenders;	48
(c) The impact of the sentencing structure and the	49
sentence appeal provisions in effect on and after July 1, 1996,	50
on the appellate courts of this state, including information	51
regarding the number of sentence-based appeals, the cost of	52
reviewing appeals of that nature, whether a special court should	53
be created to review sentences, and whether changes should be	54
made to ensure that sentence-based appeals are conducted	55
expeditiously.	56
(3) Review all bills that are introduced in the general	57
assembly that provide for new criminal offenses or that change	58
the penalty for any criminal offense, determine if those bills	59
are consistent with the sentencing policy adopted under division	60
(B) of section 181.23 of the Revised Code, determine the impact	61
of those bills upon the correctional resources of the state, and	62
recommend to the general assembly any necessary amendments to	63
those bills. When the commission recommends any amendment for a	64
bill before the general assembly, it shall do so in a manner	65
that is consistent with the requirements of section 181.24 of	66
the Revised Code.	67
(4) Objects suining lands and a share	60
(4) Study criminal sentencing structures in this state,	68
other states, and the federal government, recommend necessary	69
changes to the sentencing structure of the state, and determine	70
the costs and effects of any proposed changes in the sentencing	71
structure of the state;	72
(5) Collect and maintain data that pertains to the cost to	73
counties of the felony sentence appeal provisions set forth in	74

section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, of the postconviction

relief proceeding provisions set forth in division $\frac{(A)(2)}{(B)(2)}$	76
of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, and of appeals from	77
judgments entered in such postconviction relief proceedings. The	78
data so collected and maintained shall include, but shall not be	79
limited to, the increase in expenses that counties experience as	80
a result of those provisions and those appeals and the number of	81
felony sentence appeals made, postconviction relief proceedings	82
filed, and appeals of postconviction relief proceeding judgments	83
made in each county under those provisions.	84
(B) In addition to its duties set forth in section 181.24	85
of the Revised Code and division (A) of this section, the state	86
criminal sentencing commission shall review all forfeiture	87
statutes in Titles XXIX and XLV of the Revised Code and, not	88
later than July 1, 2002, recommend to the general assembly any	89
necessary changes to those statutes.	90
Sec. 2929.06. (A)(1) If a sentence of death imposed upon	91
an offender is set aside, nullified, vacated, or voided for any	92
of the following reasons, the trial court that sentenced the	93
offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender in	94
accordance with division (A)(2) of this section:	95
(a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of	96
death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1,	97
1995, or the supreme court, in a case in which the supreme court	98
reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the sentence	99
of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05 of the	100
Revised Code.	101
(b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for	102
imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections	103

2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional.

(c) The sentence of death is set aside, nullified, or	105
vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the	106
Revised Code.	107
(d) A court has determined that the offender is a person	108
with an intellectual disability under standards set forth in	109
decisions of the supreme court of this state or the United	110
States supreme court.	111
(e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to	112
division $\frac{\text{(H)}}{\text{(I)}}$ of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.	113
(2) At a resentencing hearing conducted under division (A)	114
(1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender a	115
sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting	116
of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	117
imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division.	118
If the sentence of death was voided by a court pursuant to	119
division $\frac{\text{(H)}}{\text{(I)}}$ of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, the	120
offender has waived any right to be sentenced to any sentence	121
other than life imprisonment without parole as described in	122
division (A)(3)(b) of that section and the court shall impose a	123
sentence of life imprisonment without parole. If the immediately	124
preceding sentence does not apply and if division (D) of section	125
2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the time the offender committed	126
the aggravated murder for which the sentence of death was	127
imposed, required the imposition when a sentence of death was	128
not imposed of a sentence of life imprisonment without parole or	129
a sentence of an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of	130
thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment to be	131
imposed pursuant to division (A) or (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of	132
the Revised Code and served pursuant to that section, except as	133

provided in division (F) of this section, the court shall impose

the sentence so required. In all other cases, except as provided	135
in division (F) of this section, the sentences of life	136
imprisonment that are available at the hearing, and from which	137
the court shall impose sentence, shall be the same sentences of	138
life imprisonment that were available under division (D) of	139
section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at	140
the time the offender committed the offense for which the	141
sentence of death was imposed. Nothing in this division	142
regarding the resentencing of an offender shall affect the	143
operation of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	144

(B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court 145 sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed 146 upon an offender because of error that occurred in the 147 sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this 148 section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the 149 offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender. 150 If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall 151 impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by 152 a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new 153 panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing, 154 the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in 155 division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in 156 determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of 157 death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term 158 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 159 of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court 160 or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a 161 sentence of death, except as provided in division (F) of this 162 section, the court or panel shall impose upon the offender one 163 of the sentences of life imprisonment that could have been 164 imposed at the time the offender committed the offense for which 165

the sentence of death was imposed, determined as specified in	166
this division, or an indefinite term consisting of a minimum	167
term of thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment	168
that is determined as specified in this division. If division	169
(D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the time the	170
offender committed the aggravated murder for which the sentence	171
of death was imposed, required the imposition when a sentence of	172
death was not imposed of a sentence of life imprisonment without	173
parole or a sentence of an indefinite term consisting of a	174
minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	175
imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or (B)(3) of	176
section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant to that	177
section, except as provided in division (F) of this section, the	178
court or panel shall impose the sentence so required. In all	179
other cases, except as provided in division (F) of this section,	180
the sentences of life imprisonment that are available at the	181
hearing, and from which the court or panel shall impose	182
sentence, shall be the same sentences of life imprisonment that	183
were available under division (D) of section 2929.03 or under	184
section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time the offender	185
committed the offense for which the sentence of death was	186
imposed.	187

(C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 188 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 189 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 190 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the 191 sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 192 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 193 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender 194 shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 195 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 196

full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole	197
eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment.	198
(D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights	199
of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or	200
vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of	201
that nature otherwise would be available.	202
(E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th	203
general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been	204
sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed	205
on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was	206
committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by	207
H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to	208
all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after	209
March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are	210
challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence	211
of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court	212
of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23,	213
2005, have not yet been resentenced.	214
(F) A court shall not impose a sentence of life	215
imprisonment without parole on a person under division (A) or	216
(B) of this section for an offense that was committed when the	217
person was under eighteen years of age.	218
Sec. 2945.79. A new trial, after a verdict of conviction,	219
may be granted on the application of the defendant for any of	220
the following causes <u>affecting that</u> materially <u>his affect the</u>	221
fairness of the defendant's substantial rightstrial or that	222
<pre>demonstrate a miscarriage of justice:</pre>	223
(A) Irregularity in the proceedings of the court, jury,	224
prosecuting attorney, or the witnesses for the state, or for any	225

order of the court, or abuse of discretion by which the	226
defendant was prevented from having a fair trial;	227
(B) Misconduct of the jury, prosecuting attorney, or the	228
witnesses for the state;	229
(C) Accident or surprise which ordinary prudence could not	230
have guarded against;	231
(D) That the verdict is not sustained by sufficient	232
evidence or is contrary to law; but if the evidence shows the	233
defendant is not guilty of the degree of crime for which—he_the_	234
<u>defendant</u> was convicted, but guilty of a lesser degree thereof,	235
or of a lesser crime included therein, the court may modify the	236
verdict or finding accordingly, without granting or ordering a	237
new trial, and pass sentence on such verdict or finding as	238
modified, provided that this power extends to any court to which	239
the cause may be taken on appeal;	240
(E) Error of law occurring at the trial;	241
(F) When new evidence is discovered material to the	242
defendant, which he the defendant could not with reasonable	243
diligence have discovered and produced at the trial. When a	244
motion for a new trial is made upon the ground of newly	245
discovered evidence, the defendant must produce at the hearing	246
of said motion, in support thereof, the affidavits of the	247
witnesses by whom such evidence is expected to be given, and if	248
time is required by the defendant to procure such affidavits,	249
the court may postpone the hearing of the motion for such length	250
of time as under all the circumstances of the case is	251
reasonable. The prosecuting attorney may produce affidavits or	252
other evidence to impeach the affidavits of such witnesses.	253
(G) When new evidence is discovered that, were it to be	254

considered at a new trial, would establish a strong probability	255
of a different result at trial.	256
Sec. 2945.80. Application (A) Except as provided in	257
divisions (B) and (C) of this section, applications for a new	258
trial shall be made by motion upon written grounds, and $ ext{except}$	259
for the cause of newly discovered evidence material for the	260
person applying, which he could not with reasonable diligence	261
have discovered and produced at the trial, shall be filed within	262
three days after the verdict was rendered, or the decision of	263
the court where a trial by jury has been waived, unless it is	264
made to appear by clear and convincing proof that the defendant	265
was unavoidably prevented from filing-his_a motion for new trial	266
in which case it shall be filed within three days from the order	267
of the court finding that—he the defendant was unavoidably	268
prevented from filing such motion within the time provided	269
herein.	270
(B) Motions for new trial on account of newly discovered	271
evidence under division (F) of section 2945.79 of the Revised	272
<u>Code</u> shall be filed within one hundred twenty days following the	273
day upon which the verdict was rendered, or the decision of the	274
court where trial by jury has been waived. If it is made to	275
appear by clear and convincing proof that the defendant was	276
unavoidably prevented from the discovery of the evidence upon	277
which—he the defendant must rely, such motion shall be filed	278
within three days from an order of the court finding that—he_the_	279
<u>defendant</u> was unavoidably prevented from discovering the	280
evidence within the one hundred twenty day period.	281
(C) Motions for new trial on account of newly discovered	282
evidence under division (G) of section 2945.79 of the Revised	283
Code shall be filed at any time after the verdict was rendered.	284

Sec. 2945.81. (A) The causes enumerated in divisions (B)	285
and (C) of section 2945.79 of the Revised Code must be sustained	286
by affidavit showing their truth, and may be controverted by	287
affidavits.	288
(B) The causes enumerated in division (G) of section	289
2945.79 of the Revised Code must be sustained by affidavit	290
showing their truth, and may be controverted by affidavit and	291
other documentary evidence in support of the claim for relief.	292
Sec. 2945.811. (A) As used in this section, "patently	293
frivolous" means offering evidence that, even if true, would not	294
satisfy the standard in division (G) of section 2945.79 of the	295
Revised Code.	296
(B) A motion for new trial on account of newly discovered	297
evidence under division (G) of section 2945.79 of the Revised	298
Code shall include all of the following:	299
(1) Specific, nonconclusory facts identifying the newly	300
discovered evidence;	301
(2) An explanation of how the newly discovered evidence	302
entitles the defendant to relief;	303
(3) An explanation of why the newly discovered evidence	304
was not proffered at trial or at any pretrial proceedings in the	305
<pre>case;</pre>	306
(4) Any supporting evidence or documentation.	307
(C) Before granting a hearing on a motion for a new trial,	308
the court shall review, in addition to the motion and supporting	309
evidence or documentation described in division (B) of this	310
section, the supporting affidavits and the documentary evidence,	311
all the files and records pertaining to the proceedings against	312

the defendant, including, but not limited to, the indictment,	313
the court's journal entries, the journalized records of the	314
clerk of the court, and the court reporter's transcript.	315
(D) If, after reviewing the materials described in	316
division (C) of this section, the court finds that the motion	317
for a new trial is patently frivolous, the court shall dismiss	318
the motion.	319
(E) If the court does not dismiss the motion for a new	320
trial pursuant to division (D) of this section, the parties may	321
obtain discovery in accordance with the Ohio Rules of Civil	322
Procedure.	323
(F) After reviewing the materials described in division	324
(C) of this section and after discovery is completed pursuant to	325
division (D) of this section, the court shall promptly hold a	326
hearing on the motion for a new trial.	327
(G) If the court finds that the new evidence, were it to	328
be considered at a new trial, would establish a strong	329
probability of a different result at trial, the court shall	330
grant a new trial. If the court does not find that the new	331
evidence would establish a strong probability of a different	332
result at trial, the court shall not grant a new trial.	333
(H) The court may appoint counsel to represent a person	334
who files a motion for a new trial upon a finding that the	335
person is indigent, unless after reviewing the materials	336
described in division (C) of this section, the court finds that	337
the motion is patently frivolous.	338
Sec. 2953.21. (A) (1) (a) (A) As used in this section,	339
"patently frivolous" means offering evidence which, even if	340
true, would not satisfy the standard in division (B)(1)(a)(v) of	341

this section.	342
(B)(1)(a) A person in any of the following categories may	343
file a petition in the court that imposed sentence, stating the	344
grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court to vacate	345
or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant other	346
appropriate relief:	347
(i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	348
offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that	349
there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights	350
as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio	351
Constitution or the Constitution of the United States;	352
(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	353
offense and sentenced to death and who claims that there was a	354
denial or infringement of the person's rights under either of	355
those Constitutions that creates a reasonable probability of an	356
altered verdict;	357
(iii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	358
offense that is a felony and who is an offender for whom DNA	359
testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of	360
the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised	361
Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of	362
all available admissible evidence related to the person's case	363
as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised	364
Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing	365
evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the	366
person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and	367
convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating	368
circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of	369
committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of	370
death;	371

(iv) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated	372
murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims	373
that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the	374
commission of the offense and that as a result the court should	375
render void the sentence of death, with the filing of the	376
petition constituting the waiver described in division (A)(3)(b)	377
(B)(3)(b) of this section;	378
(v) Any person who produces newly discovered evidence	379
that, were it to be considered at a new trial, would establish a	380
strong probability of a different result at trial.	381
(b) A petitioner under division $\frac{(A)(1)(a)}{(B)(1)(a)}$ of	382
this section may file a supporting affidavit and other	383
documentary evidence in support of the claim for relief.	384
(c) As used in division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1) (a) $\frac{B}{A}$ (B) (1) (a) of this	385
section:	386
(i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the	387
DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the	388
Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code	389
been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in	390
the context of and upon consideration of all available	391
admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in	392
division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no	393
reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of	394
the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the	395
person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would	396
have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance	397
or circumstances the petitioner was found guilty of committing	398
and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death.	399
(ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in	400

section 2929.025 of the Revised Code.	401
(d) As used in divisions $\frac{A}{(A)(1)(a)}$ (B) (1) (a) and (c) of	402
this section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means	403
section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July	404
6, 2010.	405
(e) At any time in conjunction with the filing of a	406
petition for postconviction relief under division $\frac{A}{B}$ of	407
this section—by a person who has been sentenced to death, or	408
with the litigation of a petition so filed, the court, for good	409
cause shown, may authorize the petitioner in seeking the	410
postconviction relief and the prosecuting attorney of the county	411
served by the court in defending the proceeding, to take	412
depositions and to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in	413
accordance with divisions $\frac{A}{A}$	414
$\underline{\text{(f)}}$, and $\underline{\text{(C)}}\underline{\text{(D)}}$ of this section, and to any other form of	415
discovery as in a civil action that the court in its discretion	416
permits. The court may limit the extent of discovery under this	417
division. In addition to discovery that is relevant to the claim	418
and was available under Criminal Rule 16 through conclusion of	419
the original criminal trial, the court, for good cause shown,	420
may authorize the petitioner or prosecuting attorney to take	421
depositions and issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in	422
either of the following circumstances:	423
(i) For any witness who testified at trial or who was	424
disclosed by the state prior to trial, except as otherwise	425
provided in this division, the petitioner or prosecuting	426
attorney shows clear and convincing evidence that the witness is	427
material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of	428
a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to	429

substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a

reasonable probability of an altered verdict. This division does	431
not apply if the witness was unavailable for trial or would not	432
voluntarily be interviewed by the defendant or prosecuting	433
attorney.	434
(ii) For any witness with respect to whom division $\frac{A}{A}$	435
$\frac{\text{(e) (i)}}{\text{(B) (1) (e) (i)}}$ of this section does not apply, the	436
petitioner or prosecuting attorney shows good cause that the	437
witness is material and that a deposition of the witness or the	438
issuing of a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance	439
in order to substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that	440
there is a reasonable probability of an altered verdict.	441
(f) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who	442
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A)	443
(B) of this section requests postconviction discovery as	444
described in division $\frac{(A)}{(1)}\frac{(e)}{(e)}\frac{(B)}{(1)}\frac{(e)}{(e)}$ of this section or if	445
the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court	446
requests postconviction discovery as described in that division,	447
within ten days after the docketing of the request, or within	448
any other time that the court sets for good cause shown, the	449
prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or motion to the	450
petitioner's request or the petitioner shall respond by answer	451
or motion to the prosecuting attorney's request, whichever is	452
applicable.	453
(g) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who	454
files a petition for postconviction relief under division $\frac{(A)}{(A)}$	455
(B) of this section requests postconviction discovery as	456
described in division $\frac{(A)}{(1)}\frac{(e)}{(e)}\frac{(B)}{(1)}\frac{(e)}{(e)}$ of this section or if	457
the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court	458
requests postconviction discovery as described in that division,	459
upon motion by the petitioner, the prosecuting attorney, or the	460

person from whom discovery is sought, and for good cause shown,	461
the court in which the action is pending may make any order that	462
justice requires to protect a party or person from oppression or	463
undue burden or expense, including but not limited to the orders	464
described in divisions $\frac{A}{A}$ \frac	465
this section. The court also may make any such order if, in its	466
discretion, it determines that the discovery sought would be	467
irrelevant to the claims made in the petition; and if the court	468
makes any such order on that basis, it shall explain in the	469
order the reasons why the discovery would be irrelevant.	470

(h) If a petitioner, prosecuting attorney, or person from 471 whom discovery is sought makes a motion for an order under 472 division $\frac{A}{A} \frac{1}{g} \frac{B}{a} \frac{B}{a}$ of this section and the order is 473 denied in whole or in part, the court, on terms and conditions 474 as are just, may order that any party or person provide or 475 permit discovery as described in division $\frac{(A)(1)(e)}{(B)(1)(e)}$ of 476 this section. The provisions of Civil Rule 37(A)(4) apply to the 477 award of expenses incurred in relation to the motion, except 478 that in no case shall a court require a petitioner who is 479 indigent to pay expenses under those provisions. 480

Before any person moves for an order under division (A) (1) 481 (g) (B) (1) (g) of this section, that person shall make a 482 reasonable effort to resolve the matter through discussion with 483 the petitioner or prosecuting attorney seeking discovery. A 484 motion for an order under division (A) (1) (g) (B) (1) (g) of this 485 section shall be accompanied by a statement reciting the effort 486 made to resolve the matter in accordance with this paragraph. 487

The orders that may be made under division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1) (g) (B) (1) (g) of this section include, but are not limited to, any of the following:

488

489

(i) That the discovery not be had;	491
(ii) That the discovery may be had only on specified terms	492
and conditions, including a designation of the time or place;	493
(iii) That the discovery may be had only by a method of	494
discovery other than that selected by the party seeking	495
discovery;	496
(iv) That certain matters not be inquired into or that the	497
scope of the discovery be limited to certain matters;	498
(v) That discovery be conducted with no one present except	499
persons designated by the court;	500
(vi) That a deposition after being sealed be opened only	501
by order of the court;	502
(vii) That a trade secret or other confidential research,	503
development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be	504
disclosed only in a designated way;	505
(viii) That the parties simultaneously file specified	506
documents or information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be	507
opened as directed by the court.	508
(i) Any postconviction discovery authorized under division	509
$\frac{A}{(A)}$ (1) (e) $\frac{B}{(B)}$ (1) (e) of this section shall be completed not later	510
than eighteen months after the start of the discovery	511
proceedings unless, for good cause shown, the court extends that	512
period for completing the discovery.	513
(j) Nothing in division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1) (e) (B) (1) (e) of this	514
section authorizes, or shall be construed as authorizing, the	515
relitigation, or discovery in support of relitigation, of any	516
matter barred by the doctrine of res judicata.	517

(k) Division $\frac{(A)(1)}{(B)(1)}$ of this section does not apply	518
to any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense and	519
sentenced to death and who has unsuccessfully raised the same	520
claims in a petition for postconviction relief.	521
(2)(a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of	522
the Revised Code, a petition under division $\frac{A}{A} = \frac{A}{A} = $	523
(a)(i), (ii), or (iii) of this section shall be filed no later	524
than three hundred sixty-five days after the date on which the	525
trial transcript is filed in the court of appeals in the direct	526
appeal of the judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the	527
direct appeal involves a sentence of death, the date on which	528
the trial transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal	529
is taken, except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the	530
Revised Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three	531
hundred sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for	532
filing the appeal.	533
(b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the	534
Revised Code, a petition under division $\frac{A}{A} = \frac{A}{A} = \frac{A}$	535
(iv) of this section shall be filed not later than three hundred	536
sixty-five days after the effective date of this amendment April	537
<u>12, 2021.</u>	538
(c) A petition under division (B)(1)(a)(v) of this section	539
shall be filed at any time after the expiration of the time for	540
filing the appeal.	541
(3)(a) In a petition filed under division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1)(a)(i)(B)	542
(1) (a) (i) , (ii) , $\frac{or}{or}$ (iii) , $\frac{or}{or}$ (v) of this section, a person who	543
has been sentenced to death may ask the court to render void or	544
voidable the judgment with respect to the conviction of	545
aggravated murder or the specification of an aggravating	546
circumstance or the sentence of death.	547

(b) A person sentenced to death who files a petition under	548
division $\frac{A}{A}$ $\frac{A}{$	549
court to render void the sentence of death and to order the	550
resentencing of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06	551
of the Revised Code. If a person sentenced to death files such a	552
petition and asks the court to render void the sentence of death	553
and to order the resentencing of the person under division (A)	554
of section 2929.06 of the Revised Code, the act of filing the	555
petition constitutes a waiver of any right to be sentenced under	556
the law that existed at the time the offense was committed and	557
constitutes consent to be sentenced to life imprisonment without	558
parole under division (A) of section 2929.06 of the Revised	559
Code.	560

561

562

563

564

- (4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended petition filed under division (A)—(B) of this section all grounds for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any ground for relief that is not so stated in the petition is waived.
- (5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 566 $\frac{(A)(1)(a)(i)(B)(1)(a)(i)}{(a)(i)}$, (ii), or (iii) of this section was 567 convicted of or pleaded guilty to a felony, the petition may 568 569 include a claim that the petitioner was denied the equal protection of the laws in violation of the Ohio Constitution or 570 the United States Constitution because the sentence imposed upon 571 the petitioner for the felony was part of a consistent pattern 572 of disparity in sentencing by the judge who imposed the 573 sentence, with regard to the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic 574 background, or religion. If the supreme court adopts a rule 575 requiring a court of common pleas to maintain information with 576 regard to an offender's race, gender, ethnic background, or 577 religion, the supporting evidence for the petition shall 578

include, but shall not be limited to, a copy of that type of information relative to the petitioner's sentence and copies of	579
	580
that type of information relative to sentences that the same	581
judge imposed upon other persons.	582

(6) Notwithstanding any law or court rule to the contrary, 583 there is no limit on the number of pages in, or on the length 584 of, a petition filed under division $\frac{A}{A} \cdot \frac{1}{A} \cdot \frac{A}{A} \cdot \frac{A}{A}$ 585 (ii), (iii), or (iv), or (v) of this section by a person who has 586 been sentenced to death. If any court rule specifies a limit on 587 the number of pages in, or on the length of, a petition filed 588 under division $\frac{(A)(1)(a)(i)}{(B)(1)(a)(i)}$, (ii), (iii), or (iv), 589 or (v) of this section or on a prosecuting attorney's response 590 to such a petition by answer or motion and a person who has been 591 sentenced to death files a petition that exceeds the limit 592 specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may respond 593 by an answer or motion that exceeds the limit specified for the 594 response. 595

(B) (C) The clerk of the court in which the petition for 596 postconviction relief and, if applicable, a request for 597 postconviction discovery described in division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1) (e) (B) (1) 598 (e) of this section is filed shall docket the petition and the 599 request and bring them promptly to the attention of the court. 600 The clerk of the court in which the petition for postconviction 601 relief and, if applicable, a request for postconviction 602 discovery described in division $\frac{A}{A}$ (1) (e) (B) (1) (e) of this 603 section is filed immediately shall forward a copy of the 604 petition and a copy of the request if filed by the petitioner to 605 the prosecuting attorney of the county served by the court. If 606 the request for postconviction discovery is filed by the 607 prosecuting attorney, the clerk of the court immediately shall 608 forward a copy of the request to the petitioner or the 609

610

petitioner's counsel.

$\frac{(C)-(D)}{(D)}$ If a person who has been sentenced to death and	611
who files a petition for postconviction relief under division	612
$\frac{(A)(1)(a)(i)(B)(1)(a)(i)}{(B)(1)(a)(i)}$, (iii), (iii), or (iv) of this	613
section requests a deposition or the prosecuting attorney in the	614
case requests a deposition, and if the court grants the request	615
under division $\frac{A}{(1)(e)}$ (B) (1) (e) of this section, the court	616
shall notify the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel and the	617
prosecuting attorney. The deposition shall be conducted pursuant	618
to divisions (B), (D), and (E) of Criminal Rule 15.	619
Notwithstanding division (C) of Criminal Rule 15, the petitioner	620
is not entitled to attend the deposition. The prosecuting	621
attorney shall be permitted to attend and participate in any	622
deposition.	623

(D) (E) The court shall consider a petition that is timely 624 filed within the period specified in division $\frac{A}{(A)(2)}$ of 625 this section even if a direct appeal of the judgment is pending. 626 Before granting a hearing on a petition filed under division (A) 627 $\frac{(1)(a)(i)}{(B)(1)(a)(i)}$, (ii), (iii), $\frac{or}{(iv)}$, or $\frac{(v)}{(iv)}$ of this 628 629 section, the court shall determine whether there are substantive grounds for relief. In making such a determination, the court 630 shall consider, in addition to the petition, the supporting 631 affidavits, and the documentary evidence, all the files and 632 records pertaining to the proceedings against the petitioner, 633 including, but not limited to, the indictment, the court's 634 journal entries, the journalized records of the clerk of the 635 court, and the court reporter's transcript. The court reporter's 636 transcript, if ordered and certified by the court, shall be 637 taxed as court costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it 638 shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law with 639 respect to such dismissal. If the petition was filed by a person 640

who has been sentenced to death, the findings of fact and	641
conclusions of law shall state specifically the reasons for the	642
dismissal of the petition and of each claim it contains.	643
$\frac{(E)-(F)}{(F)}$ Within ten days after the docketing of the	644
petition, or within any further time that the court may fix for	645
good cause shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by	646
answer or motion. Division $\frac{(A)(6)}{(B)(6)}$ of this section applies	647
with respect to the prosecuting attorney's response. Within	648
twenty days from the date the issues are raised, either party	649
may move for summary judgment. The right to summary judgment	650
shall appear on the face of the record.	651
(F) Unless (G) For a petition filed under division (B) (1)	652
(a)(i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section, unless the	653
petition and the files and records of the case show the	654
petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court shall proceed to	655
a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct appeal of the	656
case is pending. For a petition filed under division (B)(1)(a)	657
(v) of this section, unless the petition and the files and	658
records of the case show that the petition is patently	659
frivolous, the court shall hold a hearing on the issues thirty	660
days after the prosecuting attorney is required to respond by	661
answer or motion as described in division (E) of this section	662
even if a direct appeal of the case is pending. If the court	663
notifies the parties that it has found grounds for granting	664
relief, either party may request an appellate court in which a	665
direct appeal of the judgment is pending to remand the pending	666
case to the court.	667
With respect to a petition filed under division $\frac{(A)(1)(a)}{(a)}$	668
$\frac{\text{(iv)}}{\text{(B)}}$ (1) (a) (iv) of this section, the procedures and rules	669
regarding introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the	670

precriat hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and	0/1
(F) of section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering	672
the petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for	673
granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one	674
or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of	675
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of	676
the aggravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of	677
death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the	678
person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of	679
that section.	680
(G) (H) A petitioner who files a petition under division	681
$\frac{(A)(1)(a)(i)(B)(1)(a)(i)}{(B)(1)(a)(i)}$, (iii), $\frac{or}{or}$ (iv), $\frac{or}{or}$ (v) of this	682
section may amend the petition as follows:	683
(1) If the petition was filed by a person who has been	684
sentenced to death, at any time that is not later than one	685
hundred eighty days after the petition is filed, the petitioner	686
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the	687
proceedings.	688
(2) If division $\frac{(G)(1)}{(H)(1)}$ of this section does not	689
apply, at any time before the answer or motion is filed, the	690
petitioner may amend the petition with or without leave or	691
prejudice to the proceedings.	692
(3) The petitioner may amend the petition with leave of	693
court at any time after the expiration of the applicable period	694
specified in division $\frac{(G)(1)-(H)(1)}{(G)(1)}$ or (2) of this section.	695
$\frac{(H)}{(I)}$ If the court does not find grounds for granting	696
relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions	697
of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition.	698
If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to	699

death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law shall state	700
specifically the reasons for the denial of relief on the	701
petition and of each claim it contains. If no direct appeal of	702
the case is pending and the court finds grounds for relief or if	703
a pending direct appeal of the case has been remanded to the	704
court pursuant to a request made pursuant to division $\frac{(F)-(G)}{(G)}$ of	705
this section and the court finds grounds for granting relief, it	706
shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law and	707
shall enter a judgment that vacates and sets aside the judgment	708
in question, and, in the case of a petitioner who is a prisoner	709
in custody, except as otherwise described in this division,	710
shall discharge or resentence the petitioner or grant a new	711
trial as the court determines appropriate. If the court finds	712
grounds for relief in the case of a petitioner who filed a	713
petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iv) (B)(1)(a)(iv) of this	714
section, the court shall render void the sentence of death and	715
order the resentencing of the offender under division (A) of	716
section 2929.06 of the Revised Code. If the petitioner has been	717
sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law	718
shall state specifically the reasons for the finding of grounds	719
for granting the relief, with respect to each claim contained in	720
the petition. The court also may make supplementary orders to	721
the relief granted, concerning such matters as rearraignment,	722
retrial, custody, and bail. If the trial court's order granting	723
the petition is reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of	724
the case has been remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a	725
request under division $\frac{(F)-(G)}{(G)}$ of this section, the appellate	726
court reversing the order granting the petition shall notify the	727
appellate court in which the direct appeal of the case was	728
pending at the time of the remand of the reversal and remand of	729
the trial court's order. Upon the reversal and remand of the	730
trial court's order granting the petition, regardless of whether	731

notice is sent or received, the direct appeal of the case that	732
was remanded is reinstated.	733
$\frac{(I)}{(J)}$ Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division	734
$\frac{(A)(1)(a)(i)(B)(1)(a)(i)}{(B)(1)(a)(i)}$, (iii), $\frac{(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)}{(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)}$, (iii), $\frac{(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)}{(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)}$, (iii), $(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)(a)($	735
section by a person sentenced to death, only the supreme court	736
may stay execution of the sentence of death.	737
(J) (1) If (K) (1) (a) Except as provided in division (J) (1)	738
(b) of this section, if a person sentenced to death intends to	739
file a petition under division (B)(1)(a)(i), (ii), (iii), or	740
(iv) of this section, the court shall appoint counsel to	741
represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent	742
and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or	743
is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or	744
reject the appointment of counsel. The court may decline to	745
appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a	746
hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of	747
counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision	748
or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. If a person	749
sentenced to death intends to file a petition under division (B)	750
(1) (a) (v) of this section, the court shall appoint counsel to	751
represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent	752
and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or	753
is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or	754
reject the appointment of counsel, unless the court finds that	755
the evidence is patently frivolous. The court may decline to	756
appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a	757
hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of	758
counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision	759
or upon a finding that the person is not indigent.	760
(b) The court may appoint counsel to represent a person	761

who files a petition under division (B)(1)(a)(v) of this section	762
upon a finding that the person is indigent, unless the court	763
finds that the evidence is patently frivolous.	764
(2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division	765
$\frac{J}{(J)}$ (I) of this section an attorney who represented the	766
petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates	767
unless the person and the attorney expressly request the	768
appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division	769
$\frac{J}{L}$ (K) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified	770
under Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of	771
Ohio to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted	772
of an offense for which the death penalty can be or has been	773
imposed. The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during	774
proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds for	775
relief in a proceeding under this section, in an appeal of any	776
action under this section, or in an application to reopen a	777
direct appeal.	778
(3) Division $\frac{(J)}{(K)}$ of this section does not preclude	779
attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the	780
provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that	781
were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July	782
1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were	783
represented in proceedings under this section by one or more	784
counsel appointed by the court under this section or section	785
120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those	786
appointed counsel meet the requirements of division $\frac{(J)(2)}{(K)}$	787
(2) of this section.	788
$\frac{(K)-(L)}{(L)}$ Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony	789
that is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the	790

remedy set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by

which a person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity	792
of a conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the	793
validity of an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for	794
the commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if	795
committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of	796
disposition.	797

Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a 798 petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, 799 a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration 800 of the period prescribed in division (A)—(B) of that section or 801 a second petition or successive petitions for similar relief on 802 behalf of a petitioner unless division (A)(1) or (2) of this 803 section applies:

805

(1) Both of the following apply:

- (a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was 806 807 unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or, 808 subsequent to the period prescribed in division $\frac{(A)(2)-(B)(2)}{(B)(B)(B)}$ of 809 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an 810 earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a 811 new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons 812 in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim 813 based on that right. 814
- (b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence 815
 that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable 816
 factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense 817
 of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim 818
 challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional 819
 error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would 820
 have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence. 821

(2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the	822
petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed	823
under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under	824
former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the	825
context of and upon consideration of all available admissible	826
evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division	827
(D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of	828
the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence,	829
actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was	830
sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence,	831
actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or	832
circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that	833
is or are the basis of that sentence of death.	834

As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same meaning as in division $\frac{(A)(1)(c)}{(B)(1)(c)}$ of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" has the same meaning as in division $\frac{(A)(1)(d)}{(B)(1)(d)}$ of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.

(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a 840 petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code 841 is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter 842 2953. of the Revised Code. 843

835

836

837

838

839

If a petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the 844 Revised Code by a person who has been sentenced to death is 845 denied and the person appeals the judgment, notwithstanding any 846 law or court rule to the contrary, there is no limit on the 847 number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or 848 briefs related to an appeal filed by the person. If any court 849 rule specifies a limit on the number of pages in, or on the 850 length of, a notice of appeal or briefs described in this 851

division or on a prosecuting attorney's response or briefs with	852
respect to such an appeal and a person who has been sentenced to	853
death files a notice of appeal or briefs that exceed the limit	854
specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may file a	855
response or briefs that exceed the limit specified for the	856
answer or briefs.	857
Section 2. That existing sections 181.25, 2929.06,	858
2945.79, 2945.80, 2945.81, 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the Revised	859
Code are hereby repealed.	860
Section 3. Section 2929.06 of the Revised Code is	861
presented in this act as a composite of the section as amended	862
by both H.B. 136 and S.B. 256 of the 133rd General Assembly. The	863
General Assembly, applying the principle stated in division (B)	864
of section 1.52 of the Revised Code that amendments are to be	865
harmonized if reasonably capable of simultaneous operation,	866
finds that the composite is the resulting version of the section	867
in effect prior to the effective date of the section as	868
presented in this act.	869