# SECOND REGULAR SESSION HOUSE BILL NO. 2218

## 99TH GENERAL ASSEMBLY

INTRODUCED BY REPRESENTATIVE ROBERTS.

D. ADAM CRUMBLISS, Chief Clerk

### AN ACT

To repeal sections 546.680, 546.690, 546.700, 546.710, 546.720, 546.730, 546.740, 546.750, 546.800, 546.810, 546.820, 565.004, 565.006, 565.020, 565.030, 565.032, 565.035, and 565.040, RSMo, and to enact in lieu thereof four new sections relating to repealing the death penalty, with penalty provisions.

Be it enacted by the General Assembly of the state of Missouri, as follows:

Section A. Sections 546.680, 546.690, 546.700, 546.710, 546.720, 546.730, 546.740, 546.750, 546.800, 546.810, 546.820, 565.004, 565.006, 565.020, 565.030, 565.032, 565.035, and 565.040, RSMo, are repealed and four new sections enacted in lieu thereof, to be known as sections 565.004, 565.006, 565.020, and 565.040, to read as follows:

565.004. 1. Each homicide offense which is lawfully joined in the same indictment or information together with any homicide offense or offense other than a homicide shall be 2 charged together with such offense in separate counts. A count charging any offense of homicide 3 may only be charged and tried together with one or more counts of any other homicide or offense 4 other than a homicide as provided in subsection 2 of section 545.140. Except as provided in 5 6 subsections 2[,] and 3[, and 4] of this section, no murder in the first degree offense may be tried together with any offense other than murder in the first degree. In the event of a joinder of 7 8 homicide offenses, all offenses charged which are supported by the evidence in the case, together with all proper lesser offenses under section 565.029, shall, when requested by one of the parties 9 10 or the court, be submitted to the jury or, in a jury-waived trial, considered by the judge. 11 2. A count charging any offense of homicide of a particular individual may be joined in

an indictment or information and tried with one or more counts charging alternatively any otherhomicide or offense other than a homicide committed against that individual. The state shall not

EXPLANATION — Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and is intended to be omitted from the law. Matter in **bold-face** type in the above bill is proposed language.

6097H.01I

be required to make an election as to the alternative count on which it will proceed. This subsection in no way limits the right to try in the conjunctive, where they are properly joined under subsection 1 of this section, either separate offenses other than murder in the first degree or separate offenses of murder in the first degree committed against different individuals.

3. When a defendant has been charged and proven before trial to be a prior offender pursuant to chapter 558 so that the judge shall assess punishment and not a jury for an offense other than murder in the first degree, that offense may be tried and submitted to the trier together with any murder in the first degree charge with which it is lawfully joined. In such case the judge will assess punishment on any offense joined with a murder in the first degree charge according to law and, when the trier is a jury, it shall be instructed upon punishment on the charge of murder in the first degree in accordance with section 565.030.

[4. When the state waives the death penalty for a murder first degree offense, that offense
 may be tried and submitted to the trier together with any other charge with which it is lawfully
 joined.]

565.006. 1. At any time before the commencement of the trial of a homicide offense,
the defendant may, with the assent of the court, waive a trial by jury and agree to submit all
issues in the case to the court, whose finding shall have the force and effect of a verdict of a jury.
Such a waiver must include a waiver of a trial by jury of all issues and offenses charged in the
case, including the punishment to be assessed and imposed if the defendant is found guilty.

6 2. No defendant who pleads guilty to a homicide offense or who is found guilty of a 7 homicide offense after trial to the court without a jury shall be permitted a trial by jury on the 8 issue of the punishment to be imposed, except by agreement of the state.

9 3. [If a defendant is found guilty of murder in the first degree after a jury trial in which 10 the state has not waived the death penalty, the defendant may not waive a jury trial of the issue 11 of the punishment to be imposed, except by agreement with the state and the court.

12 — 4.] Any waiver of a jury trial and agreement permitted by this section shall be entered
 13 in the court record.

565.020. 1. A person commits the offense of murder in the first degree if [he or she]
2 such person knowingly causes the death of another person after deliberation upon the matter.

2. The offense of murder in the first degree is a class A felony, and, if a person is eighteen years of age or older at the time of the offense, the punishment shall be [either death or] imprisonment for life without eligibility for probation or parole, or release except by act of the governor. If a person has not reached his or her eighteenth birthday at the time of the commission of the offense, the punishment shall be as provided under section 565.033.

565.040. [1. In the event that the death penalty provided in this chapter is held to be 2 unconstitutional,] Any person convicted of murder in the first degree [shall be] and sentenced

3 by the court to death prior to August 28, 2018, shall be sentenced by the court to life

4 imprisonment without eligibility for probation, parole, or release except by act of the governor[,
5 with the exception that when a specific aggravating circumstance found in a case is held to be

6 unconstitutional or invalid for another reason, the supreme court of Missouri is further authorized

7 to remand the case for resentencing or retrial of the punishment pursuant to subsection 5 of

8 section 565.035.

9 2. In the event that any death sentence imposed pursuant to this chapter is held to be unconstitutional, the trial court which previously sentenced the defendant to death shall cause 10 the defendant to be brought before the court and shall sentence the defendant to life 11 imprisonment without eligibility for probation, parole, or release except by act of the governor, 12 with the exception that when a specific aggravating circumstance found in a case is held to be 13 inapplicable, unconstitutional or invalid for another reason, the supreme court of Missouri is 14 further authorized to remand the case for retrial of the punishment pursuant to subsection 5 of 15 16 section 565.0351.

546.680. When judgment of death is rendered by any court of competent 2 jurisdiction, a warrant signed by the judge and attested by the clerk under the seal of the court must be drawn and delivered to the sheriff. It must state the 3 4 conviction and judgment and appoint a day on which the judgment must be 5 executed, which must not be less than thirty nor more than sixty days from the 6 date of judgment, and must direct the sheriff to deliver the defendant, at a time 7 specified in said order, not more than ten days from the date of judgment, to the 8 chief administrative officer of a correctional facility of the department of 9 corrections, for execution.]

10

2

3 4

8

[546.690. The judge of a court at which a conviction is had must, immediately after the conviction, transmit to the governor of the state, by mail or otherwise, a statement of the conviction and judgment.]

[546.700. Whenever, for any reason, any convict sentenced to the punishment of death shall not have been executed pursuant to such sentence, and the cause shall stand in full force, the supreme court, or the court of the county in which the conviction was had, on the application of the prosecuting attorney, shall issue a writ of habeas corpus to bring such convict before the court; or if he be at large, a warrant for his apprehension may be issued by such court, or any judge thereof.]

2 [546.710. Upon such convicted offender being brought before the court,
 2 they shall proceed to inquire into the facts, and if no legal reasons exist against
 3 the execution of sentence, such court shall issue a warrant to the director of the

- 4 department of corrections, for the execution of the prisoner at the time therein
   5 specified, which execution shall be obeyed by the director accordingly.]
- 6

2

3 4

5

6 7

8

30

[546.720. 1. The manner of inflicting the punishment of death shall be by the administration of lethal gas or by means of the administration of lethal injection. And for such purpose the director of the department of corrections is hereby authorized and directed to provide a suitable and efficient room or place, enclosed from public view, within the walls of a correctional facility of the department of corrections, and the necessary appliances for carrying into execution the death penalty by means of the administration of lethal gas or by means of the administration of lethal injection.

9 2. The director of the department of corrections shall select an execution 10 team which shall consist of those persons who administer lethal gas or lethal chemicals and those persons, such as medical personnel, who provide direct 11 12 support for the administration of lethal gas or lethal chemicals. The identities of members of the execution team, as defined in the execution protocol of the 13 department of corrections, shall be kept confidential. Notwithstanding any 14 provision of law to the contrary, any portion of a record that could identify a 15 person as being a current or former member of an execution team shall be 16 privileged and shall not be subject to discovery, subpoena, or other means of 17 18 legal compulsion for disclosure to any person or entity, the remainder of such 19 record shall not be privileged or closed unless protected from disclosure by law. The section of an execution protocol that directly relates to the administration of 20 21 lethal gas or lethal chemicals is an open record, the remainder of any execution protocol of the department of corrections is a closed record. 22

3. A person may not, without the approval of the director of the
 department of corrections, knowingly disclose the identity of a current or former
 member of an execution team or disclose a record knowing that it could identify
 a person as being a current or former member of an execution team. Any person
 whose identity is disclosed in violation of this section shall:

(1) Have a civil cause of action against a person who violates this
 section;

(2) Be entitled to recover from any such person:

31 (a) Actual damages; and

(b) Punitive damages on a showing of a willful violation of this section. 32 4. Notwithstanding any provision of law to the contrary, if a member of 33 34 the execution team is licensed by a board or department, the licensing board or department shall not censure, reprimand, suspend, revoke, or take any other 35 disciplinary action against the person's license because of his or her participation 36 in a lawful execution. All members of the execution team are entitled to 37 coverage under the state legal expense fund established by section 105.711 for 38 conduct of such execution team member arising out of and performed in 39 40 connection with his or her official duties on behalf of the state or any agency of

41 the state, provided that moneys in this fund shall not be available for payment of 42 claims under chapter 287.]

43

2 3

4

11

2 3

5

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

2

3

4

5

2

3

[546.730. A judgment of death must be executed within a correctional center of the department of corrections; and such execution shall be under the supervision and direction of the director of the department of corrections.

[546.740. The chief administrative officer of the correctional center, or 2 his duly appointed representative shall be present at the execution and the 3 director of the department of corrections shall invite the presence of the attorney 4 general of the state, and at least eight reputable citizens, to be selected by him; 5 and he shall at the request of the defendant, permit such clergy or religious 6 leaders, not exceeding two, as the defendant may name, and any person, other 7 than another incarcerated offender, relatives or friends, not to exceed five, to be 8 present at the execution, together with such peace officers as he may think 9 expedient, to witness the execution; but no person under twenty-one years of age 10 shall be allowed to witness the execution.]

[546.750. After the execution the chief administrative officer of the correctional facility shall make a return upon the death warrant to the court by which the judgment was rendered, showing the time, mode and manner in which 4 it was executed.]

[546.800. If, after any female convict shall be sentenced to the punishment of death, the officer having charge of her person shall have reason to suspect that she is pregnant, he shall in like manner summon a jury of six persons, not less than three of whom shall be physicians, and shall give notice thereof to the prosecuting attorney of the county where such criminal proceedings originated, or to the circuit attorney of the city of St. Louis, if such criminal proceedings originated in that city, who shall attend, and the proceedings shall be had as provided.]

[546.810. The inquisition shall be signed by the jury and the officer in charge of such convict, and if it appear that such female convict is pregnant with child, her execution shall be suspended and the inquisition shall be transmitted to the governor.]

[546.820. Whenever the governor shall be satisfied that the cause of such suspension no longer exists, he shall issue his warrant, appointing a day for the execution of such convict, pursuant to her sentence; or he may, at his discretion, commute her punishment to imprisonment in the penitentiary for life.]

4 5 2

3

4

[565.030. 1. Where murder in the first degree is charged but not submitted or where the state waives the death penalty, the submission to the trier and all subsequent proceedings in the case shall proceed as in all other criminal cases.

5 2. Where murder in the first degree is submitted to the trier without a 6 waiver of the death penalty, the trial shall proceed in two stages before the same 7 trier. At the first stage the trier shall decide only whether the defendant is guilty 8 or not guilty of any submitted offense. The issue of punishment shall not be 9 submitted to the trier at the first stage. If an offense is charged other than murder 10 in the first degree in a count together with a count of murder in the first degree, the trial judge shall assess punishment on any such offense according to law, after 11 the defendant is found guilty of such offense and after he finds the defendant to 12 be a prior offender pursuant to chapter 558. 13

3. If murder in the first degree is submitted and the death penalty was not
 waived but the trier finds the defendant guilty of a lesser homicide, a second
 stage of the trial shall proceed as in all other criminal cases. The attorneys may
 then argue as in other criminal cases the issue of punishment, after which the trier
 shall assess and declare the punishment as in all other criminal cases.

19 4. If the trier at the first stage of a trial where the death penalty was not 20 waived finds the defendant guilty of murder in the first degree, a second stage of the trial shall proceed at which the only issue shall be the punishment to be 21 22 assessed and declared. Evidence in aggravation and mitigation of punishment, 23 including but not limited to evidence supporting any of the aggravating or 24 mitigating circumstances listed in subsection 2 or 3 of section 565.032, may be presented subject to the rules of evidence at criminal trials. Such evidence may 25 include, within the discretion of the court, evidence concerning the murder victim 2627 and the impact of the offense upon the family of the victim and others. Rebuttal 28 and surrebuttal evidence may be presented. The state shall be the first to proceed. If the trier is a jury it shall be instructed on the law. The attorneys may then 29 30 argue the issue of punishment to the jury, and the state shall have the right to open and close the argument. The trier shall assess and declare the punishment 31 32 at life imprisonment without eligibility for probation, parole, or release except by 33 act of the governor:

(1) If the trier finds by a preponderance of the evidence that the defendant
 is intellectually disabled; or

36 (2) If the trier does not find beyond a reasonable doubt at least one of the
 37 statutory aggravating circumstances set out in subsection 2 of section 565.032;
 38 or

(3) If the trier concludes that there is evidence in mitigation of
 punishment, including but not limited to evidence supporting the statutory
 mitigating circumstances listed in subsection 3 of section 565.032, which is
 sufficient to outweigh the evidence in aggravation of punishment found by the
 trier; or

44	(4) If the trier decides under all of the circumstances not to assess and
45	declare the punishment at death. If the trier is a jury it shall be so instructed.
46	destate the pullishinent at death. If the titer is a july it shall be so instructed.
47	If the trier assesses and declares the punishment at death it shall, in its findings
48	or verdict, set out in writing the aggravating circumstance or circumstances listed
49	in subsection 2 of section 565.032 which it found beyond a reasonable doubt. If
50	the trier is a jury it shall be instructed before the case is submitted that if it is
51	unable to decide or agree upon the punishment the court shall assess and declare
52	the punishment at life imprisonment without eligibility for probation, parole, or
53	release except by act of the governor or death. The court shall follow the same
54	procedure as set out in this section whenever it is required to determine
55	punishment for murder in the first degree.
56	5. Upon written agreement of the parties and with leave of the court, the
57	issue of the defendant's intellectual disability may be taken up by the court and
58	decided prior to trial without prejudicing the defendant's right to have the issue
59	submitted to the trier of fact as provided in subsection 4 of this section.
60	6. As used in this section, the terms "intellectual disability" or
61	"intellectually disabled" refer to a condition involving substantial limitations in
62	general functioning characterized by significantly subaverage intellectual
63	functioning with continual extensive related deficits and limitations in two or
64	more adaptive behaviors such as communication, self-care, home living, social
65	skills, community use, self-direction, health and safety, functional academics,
66	leisure and work, which conditions are manifested and documented before
67	eighteen years of age.
68	7. The provisions of this section shall only govern offenses committed
69	on or after August 28, 2001.]
70	
	[565.032. 1. In all cases of murder in the first degree for which the death
2	penalty is authorized, the judge in a jury-waived trial shall consider, or shall
3	include in his or her instructions to the jury for it to consider:
4	(1) Whether a statutory aggravating circumstance or circumstances
5	enumerated in subsection 2 of this section is established by the evidence beyond
6	a reasonable doubt; and
7	(2) If a statutory aggravating circumstance or circumstances is proven
8	beyond a reasonable doubt, whether the evidence as a whole justifies a sentence
9	of death or a sentence of life imprisonment without eligibility for probation,
10	parole, or release except by act of the governor.
11	
12	In determining the issues enumerated in subdivisions (1) and (2) of this
13	subsection, the trier shall consider all evidence which it finds to be in aggravation
14 15	or mitigation of punishment, including evidence received during the first stage
15 16	of the trial and evidence supporting any of the statutory aggravating or mitigating
10	circumstances set out in subsections 2 and 3 of this section. If the trier is a jury,

17	it shall not be instructed upon any specific evidence which may be in aggravation
18	or mitigation of punishment, but shall be instructed that each juror shall consider
19	any evidence which he or she considers to be aggravating or mitigating.
20	2. Statutory aggravating circumstances for a murder in the first degree
21	offense shall be limited to the following:
22	(1) The offense was committed by a person with a prior record of
23	conviction for murder in the first degree, or the offense was committed by a
24	person who has one or more serious assaultive criminal convictions;
25	(2) The murder in the first degree offense was committed while the
26	offender was engaged in the commission or attempted commission of another
27	unlawful homicide;
28	(3) The offender by his or her act of murder in the first degree knowingly
29	created a great risk of death to more than one person by means of a weapon or
30	device which would normally be hazardous to the lives of more than one person;
31	(4) The offender committed the offense of murder in the first degree for
32	himself or herself or another, for the purpose of receiving money or any other
33	thing of monetary value from the victim of the murder or another;
34	(5) The murder in the first degree was committed against a judicial
35	officer, former judicial officer, prosecuting attorney or former prosecuting
36	attorney, circuit attorney or former circuit attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney
37	or former assistant prosecuting attorney, assistant circuit attorney or former
38	assistant circuit attorney, peace officer or former peace officer, elected official or
39	former elected official during or because of the exercise of his official duty;
40	(6) The offender caused or directed another to commit murder in the first
41	degree or committed murder in the first degree as an agent or employee of
42	another person;
43	(7) The murder in the first degree was outrageously or wantonly vile,
44	horrible or inhuman in that it involved torture, or depravity of mind;
45	(8) The murder in the first degree was committed against any peace
46	officer, or fireman while engaged in the performance of his or her official duty;
47	(9) The murder in the first degree was committed by a person in, or who
48	has escaped from, the lawful custody of a peace officer or place of lawful
49	confinement;
50	(10) The murder in the first degree was committed for the purpose of
51	avoiding, interfering with, or preventing a lawful arrest or custody in a place of
52	lawful confinement, of himself or herself or another;
53	(11) The murder in the first degree was committed while the defendant
54	was engaged in the perpetration or was aiding or encouraging another person to
55	perpetrate or attempt to perpetrate a felony of any degree of rape, sodomy,
56	burglary, robbery, kidnapping, or any felony offense in chapter 195 or 579;
57	(12) The murdered individual was a witness or potential witness in any
58	past or pending investigation or past or pending prosecution, and was killed as
58 59	a result of his or her status as a witness or potential witness;
57	a result of his of her status as a withess of potential withess,

60	(13) The murdered individual was an employee of an institution or
61	facility of the department of corrections of this state or local correction agency
62	and was killed in the course of performing his or her official duties, or the
63	murdered individual was an inmate of such institution or facility;
64	(14) The murdered individual was killed as a result of the hijacking of an
65	airplane, train, ship, bus or other public conveyance;
66	(15) The murder was committed for the purpose of concealing or
67	attempting to conceal any felony offense defined in chapter 195 or 579;
68	(16) The murder was committed for the purpose of causing or attempting
69	to cause a person to refrain from initiating or aiding in the prosecution of a felony
70	offense defined in chapter 195 or 579;
71	(17) The murder was committed during the commission of an offense
72	which is part of a pattern of criminal street gang activity as defined in section
73	<del>578.421.</del>
74	
75	(1) The defendant has no significant history of prior criminal activity;
76	(2) The murder in the first degree was committed while the defendant
77	was under the influence of extreme mental or emotional disturbance;
78	(3) The victim was a participant in the defendant's conduct or consented
79	to the act;
80	(4) The defendant was an accomplice in the murder in the first degree
81	committed by another person and his or her participation was relatively minor;
82	(5) The defendant acted under extreme duress or under the substantial
83	domination of another person;
84	(6) The capacity of the defendant to appreciate the criminality of his or
85	her conduct or to conform his or her conduct to the requirements of law was
86	substantially impaired;
87	(7) The age of the defendant at the time of the offense.]
88	
	[565.035. 1. Whenever the death penalty is imposed in any case, and
2	upon the judgment becoming final in the trial court, the sentence shall be
3	reviewed on the record by the supreme court of Missouri. The circuit clerk of the
4	court trying the case, within ten days after receiving the transcript, shall transmit
5	the entire record and transcript to the supreme court together with a notice
6	prepared by the circuit clerk and a report prepared by the trial judge. The notice
7	shall set forth the title and docket number of the case, the name of the defendant
8	and the name and address of his attorney, a narrative statement of the judgment,
9	the offense, and the punishment prescribed. The report by the judge shall be in
10	the form of a standard questionnaire prepared and supplied by the supreme court
11	<del>of Missouri.</del>
12	2. The supreme court of Missouri shall consider the punishment as well
13	as any errors enumerated by way of appeal.
14	3. With regard to the sentence, the supreme court shall determine:

15 -	(1) Whether the sentence of death was imposed under the influence of
16	passion, prejudice, or any other arbitrary factor; and
17 -	(2) Whether the evidence supports the jury's or judge's finding of a
18	statutory aggravating circumstance as enumerated in subsection 2 of section
19	565.032 and any other circumstance found;
20 -	(3) Whether the sentence of death is excessive or disproportionate to the
21	penalty imposed in similar cases, considering both the offense, the strength of the
22	evidence and the defendant.
23 -	4. Both the defendant and the state shall have the right to submit briefs
24	within the time provided by the supreme court, and to present oral argument to
25	the supreme court.
26 -	5. The supreme court shall include in its decision a reference to those
27	similar cases which it took into consideration. In addition to its authority
28	regarding correction of errors, the supreme court, with regard to review of death
29	sentences, shall be authorized to:
30 -	(1) Affirm the sentence of death; or
31 -	(2) Set the sentence aside and resentence the defendant to life
32	imprisonment without eligibility for probation, parole, or release except by act
33	of the governor; or $(2)$ . Set the contenes exide and remard the case for retries of the
34 -	(3) Set the sentence aside and remand the case for retrial of the
35	punishment hearing. A new jury shall be selected or a jury may be waived by
36	agreement of both parties and then the punishment trial shall proceed in
37	accordance with this chapter, with the exception that the evidence of the guilty
38	verdict shall be admissible in the new trial together with the official transcript of
39 40	any testimony and evidence properly admitted in each stage of the original trial
40 41 -	where relevant to determine punishment. 6. There shall be an assistant to the supreme court, who shall be an
41	attorney appointed by the supreme court and who shall serve at the pleasure of
43	the court. The court shall accumulate the records of all cases in which the
43 44	sentence of death or life imprisonment without probation or parole was imposed
45	after May 26, 1977, or such earlier date as the court may deem appropriate. The
46	assistant shall provide the court with whatever extracted information the court
47	desires with respect thereto, including but not limited to a synopsis or brief of the
48	facts in the record concerning the offense and the defendant. The court shall be
49	authorized to employ an appropriate staff, within the limits of appropriations
50	made for that purpose, and such methods to compile such data as are deemed by
51	the supreme court to be appropriate and relevant to the statutory questions
52	concerning the validity of the sentence. The office of the assistant to the supreme
53	court shall be attached to the office of the clerk of the supreme court for
54	administrative purposes.
55 -	7. In addition to the mandatory sentence review, there shall be a right of
56	direct appeal of the conviction to the supreme court of Missouri. This right of
57	appeal may be waived by the defendant. If an appeal is taken, the appeal and the
- /	"FF

HB 2218	
---------	--

- 58 sentence review shall be consolidated for consideration. The court shall render
- 59 its decision on legal errors enumerated, the factual substantiation of the verdict,
- 60 and the validity of the sentence.]