

General Assembly

Committee Bill No. 296

January Session, 2021

LCO No. 4964



Referred to Committee on GOVERNMENT ADMINISTRATION AND ELECTIONS

Introduced by: (GAE)

## AN ACT ESTABLISHING A RIGHT TO APPEAL THE DECISION OF A MUNICIPAL ETHICS BOARD TO THE OFFICE OF STATE ETHICS.

Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives in General Assembly convened:

- Section 1. Section 7-148h of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective October 1, 2021*):
- 3 (a) Any town, city, district, as defined in section 7-324, or borough 4 may, by charter provision or ordinance, establish a board, commission, 5 council, committee or other agency to investigate allegations of 6 unethical conduct, corrupting influence or illegal activities levied 7 against any official, officer or employee of such town, city, district or 8 borough. The provisions of subsections (a) to (e), inclusive, of section 9 1-82a, as amended by this act, shall apply to allegations before any such 10 agency of such conduct, influence or activities, to an investigation of 11 such allegations conducted prior to a probable cause finding, and to a 12 finding of probable cause or no probable cause. Any board, commission, 13 council, committee or other agency established pursuant to this section 14 may issue subpoenas or subpoenas duces tecum, enforceable upon 15 application to the Superior Court, to compel the attendance of persons

LCO No. 4964 **1** of 12

at hearings and the production of books, documents, records and papers.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36 37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

- (b) Notwithstanding the provisions of any special act, municipal charter or ordinance to the contrary, an elected official of any town, city, district or borough that has established a board, commission, council, committee or other agency under subsection (a) of this section, has an interest that is in substantial conflict with the proper discharge of the official's duties or employment in the public interest and of the official's responsibilities as prescribed by the laws of this state, if the official has reason to believe or expect that the official, the official's spouse or dependent child, or a business with which he is associated, as defined in section 1-79, will derive a direct monetary gain or suffer a direct monetary loss, as the case may be, by reason of the official's official activity. Any such elected official does not have an interest that is in substantial conflict with the proper discharge of the official's duties in the public interest and of the official's responsibilities as prescribed by the laws of this state, if any benefit or detriment accrues to the official, the official's spouse or dependent child, or a business with which he, his spouse or such dependent child is associated as a member of a profession, occupation or group to no greater extent than to any other member of such profession, occupation or group. Any such elected official who has a substantial conflict may not take official action on the matter.
- (c) Any person who is aggrieved by the decision of a board, commission, council, committee or other agency established under subsection (a) of this section that presents an issue of law shall have a right to appeal such decision to the Office of State Ethics under part I of chapter 10.
- Sec. 2. Subsection (a) of section 1-81 of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective October 1, 2021*):
- (a) The board and general counsel and staff of the Office of State Ethics shall:

LCO No. 4964 **2** of 12

(1) Compile and maintain an index of all reports, advisory opinions, informal staff letters, memoranda issued in accordance with subsection (b) of section 1-82, as amended by this act, and statements filed by and with the Office of State Ethics to facilitate public access to such reports and advisory opinions, informal staff letters, memoranda statements as provided by this part;

- (2) Preserve advisory opinions and informal staff letters, permanently; preserve memoranda issued in accordance with subsection (b) of section 1-82, as amended by this act, and statements and reports filed by and with the board for a period of five years from the date of receipt;
- (3) Upon the concurring vote of a majority of the board present and voting, issue advisory opinions with regard to the requirements of this part or part IV of this chapter, upon the request of any person subject to the provisions of this part or part IV of this chapter, and publish such advisory opinions in the Connecticut Law Journal. Advisory opinions rendered by the board, until amended or revoked, shall be binding on the board and shall be deemed to be final decisions of the board for purposes of appeal to the superior court, in accordance with the provisions of section 4-175 or 4-183. Any advisory opinion concerning the person who requested the opinion and who acted in reliance thereon, in good faith, shall be binding upon the board, and it shall be an absolute defense in any criminal action brought under the provisions of this part or part IV of this chapter, that the accused acted in reliance upon such advisory opinion;
- (4) Respond to inquiries and provide advice regarding the code of ethics either verbally or through informal letters;
- (5) Hear appeals filed by an aggrieved person concerning decisions of a municipal board, commission, council, committee or other agency established under subsection (a) of section 7-148h, as amended by this act, that present an issue of law;

LCO No. 4964 3 of 12

79 [(5)] (6) Provide yearly training to all state employees regarding the code of ethics;

81

82

83

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

- [(6)] (7) Make legislative recommendations to the General Assembly and report annually, not later than February fifteenth, to the Governor summarizing the activities of the Office of State Ethics; and
- [(7)] (8) Meet not less than once per month with the office's executive director and ethics enforcement officer.
- Sec. 3. Section 1-82 of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective October 1, 2021*):
  - (a) (1) Upon the complaint of any person on a form prescribed by the board, signed under penalty of false statement, or upon its own complaint, the ethics enforcement officer of the Office of State Ethics shall investigate any alleged violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an appeal of a decision made under section 7-148h, as amended by this act. Not later than five days after the receipt or issuance of such complaint, the board shall provide notice of such receipt or issuance and a copy of the complaint by registered or certified mail to any respondent against whom such complaint is filed and shall provide notice of the receipt of such complaint to the complainant. When the ethics enforcement officer of the Office of State Ethics undertakes an evaluation of a possible violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an appeal of a decision made under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, prior to the filing of a complaint, the subject of the evaluation shall be notified not later than five business days after an Office of State Ethics staff member's first contact with a third party concerning the matter.
  - (2) In the conduct of its investigation of an alleged violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an appeal of a decision made under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, the Office of State Ethics shall have the power to hold hearings, administer oaths, examine witnesses and receive oral and documentary evidence. The Office of

LCO No. 4964 **4** of 12

State Ethics may subpoena witnesses under procedural rules adopted by the Citizen's Ethics Advisory Board as regulations in accordance with the provisions of chapter 54 to compel attendance before the Office of State Ethics and to require the production for examination by the ethics enforcement officer of the Office of State Ethics of any books and papers which the Office of State Ethics deems relevant in any matter under investigation or in question, provided any such subpoena is issued either pursuant to a majority vote of the Citizen's Ethics Advisory Board or pursuant to the signature of the chairperson of such board. The vicechairperson of such board may sign any such subpoena if the chairperson of such board is unavailable. In the exercise of such powers, the Office of State Ethics may use the services of the state police, who shall provide the same upon the office's request. The Office of State Ethics shall make a record of all proceedings conducted pursuant to this subsection. The ethics enforcement officer of the Office of State Ethics may bring any alleged violation of this part before a judge trial referee assigned by the Chief Court Administrator for such purpose for a probable cause hearing. Such judge trial referee shall be compensated in accordance with the provisions of section 52-434 from such funds as may be available to the Office of State Ethics. Any witness summoned before the Office of State Ethics or a judge trial referee pursuant to this subsection shall receive the witness fee paid to witnesses in the courts of this state. During any investigation conducted pursuant to this subsection or any probable cause hearing conducted pursuant to this subsection, the respondent shall have the right to appear and be heard and to offer any information which may tend to clear the respondent of probable cause to believe the respondent has violated any provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or made an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act. The respondent shall also have the right to be represented by legal counsel and to examine and cross-examine witnesses. Not later than ten days prior to the commencement of any hearing conducted pursuant to this subsection, the Office of State Ethics shall provide the respondent with a list of its intended witnesses. Any finding of probable cause to

110

111112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

LCO No. 4964 5 of 12

believe the respondent is in violation of any provisions of this part shall be made by a judge trial referee not later than thirty days after the ethics enforcement officer brings such alleged violation before such judge trial referee, except that such thirty-day limitation period shall not apply if the judge trial referee determines that good cause exists for extending such limitation period.

144

145

146

147

148

149

150151

152

153

154

155156

157

158

159

160

161

162163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

(b) If a judge trial referee determines that probable cause exists for the violation of a provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, the board shall initiate hearings to determine whether there has been a violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act. Any such hearing shall be initiated by the board not later than thirty days after the finding of probable cause by a judge trial referee and shall be concluded not later than ninety days after its initiation, except that such thirty or ninety-day limitation period shall not apply if the judge trial referee determines that good cause exists for extending such limitation period. A judge trial referee, who has not taken part in the probable cause determination on the matter shall be assigned by the Chief Court Administrator and shall be compensated in accordance with section 52-434 out of funds available to the Office of State Ethics. Such judge trial referee shall preside over such hearing and rule on all issues concerning the application of the rules of evidence, which shall be the same as in judicial proceedings. The judge trial referee shall have no vote in any decision of the board. All hearings of the board held pursuant to this subsection shall be open. At such hearing the board shall have the same powers as the Office of State Ethics under subsection (a) of this section and the respondent shall have the right to be represented by legal counsel, to compel attendance of witnesses and the production of books, documents, records and papers and to examine and cross-examine witnesses. Not later than ten days prior to the commencement of any hearing conducted pursuant to this subsection, the Office of State Ethics shall provide the respondent with a list of its intended witnesses. The judge trial referee shall, while engaged in the

LCO No. 4964 6 of 12

discharge of the duties as provided in this subsection, have the same authority as is provided in section 51-35 over witnesses who refuse to obey a subpoena or to testify with respect to any matter upon which such witness may be lawfully interrogated, and may commit any such witness for contempt for a period no longer than thirty days. The Office of State Ethics shall make a record of all proceedings pursuant to this subsection. During the course of any such hearing, no ex-parte communication shall occur between the board, or any of its members, and: (1) The judge trial referee, or (2) any staff member of the Enforcement Division of the Office of State Ethics, concerning the complaint or the respondent. The board shall find no person in violation of any provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or a finding of an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, except upon the concurring vote of two-thirds of its members present and voting. No member of the board shall vote on the question of whether a violation of any provision of this part has occurred unless such member was physically present for the duration of any hearing held pursuant to this subsection. Not later than fifteen days after the public hearing conducted in accordance with this subsection, the board shall publish its finding and a memorandum of the reasons therefor. Such finding and memorandum shall be deemed to be the final decision of the board on the matter for the purposes of chapter 54. The respondent, if aggrieved by the finding and memorandum, may appeal therefrom to the Superior Court in accordance with the provisions of section 4-183, except a finding concerning an issue of law for an appeal filed under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, shall not be appealable to the Superior Court.

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

(c) If a judge trial referee finds, after a hearing pursuant to this section, that there is no probable cause to believe that a public official or state employee has violated a provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn, or if the board determines that a public official or state employee has not violated any such provision, or if a court of competent jurisdiction overturns a finding by the board of a violation by such a respondent, the state shall pay the reasonable legal expenses of the

LCO No. 4964 7 of 12

respondent as determined by the Attorney General or by the court if appropriate. If any complaint brought under the provisions of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn is made with the knowledge that it is made without foundation in fact, the respondent shall have a cause of action against the complainant for double the amount of damage caused thereby and, if the respondent prevails in such action, the respondent may be awarded by the court the costs of such action together with reasonable attorneys' fees.

- (d) No complaint may be made under this section later than five years after the violation alleged in the complaint has been committed.
- (e) No person shall take or threaten to take official action against an individual for such individual's disclosure of information to the board or the general counsel, ethics enforcement officer or staff of the Office of State Ethics under the provisions of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an appeal under section 7-148h, as amended by this act. After receipt of information from an individual under the provisions of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an appeal under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, the Office of State Ethics shall not disclose the identity of such individual without such individual's consent unless the Office of State Ethics determines that such disclosure is unavoidable during the course of an investigation. No person shall be subject to civil liability for any good faith disclosure that such person makes to the Office of State Ethics.
  - Sec. 4. Section 1-82a of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective October 1, 2021*):
    - (a) Unless a judge trial referee makes a finding of probable cause, a complaint alleging a violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, shall be confidential except upon the request of the respondent. An evaluation of a possible violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn or a possible incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, by the Office of State

LCO No. 4964 8 of 12

Ethics prior to the filing of a complaint shall be confidential except upon the request of the subject of the evaluation. If the evaluation is confidential, any information supplied to or received from the Office of State Ethics shall not be disclosed to any third party by a subject of the evaluation, a person contacted for the purpose of obtaining information or by the ethics enforcement officer or staff of the Office of State Ethics. No provision of this subsection shall prevent the Office of State Ethics from reporting the possible commission of a crime to the Chief State's Attorney or other prosecutorial authority.

- (b) An investigation conducted prior to a probable cause finding shall be confidential except upon the request of the respondent. If the investigation is confidential, the allegations in the complaint and any information supplied to or received from the Office of State Ethics shall not be disclosed during the investigation to any third party by a complainant, respondent, witness, designated party, or board or staff member of the Office of State Ethics.
- (c) Not later than three business days after the termination of the investigation, the Office of State Ethics shall inform the complainant and the respondent of its finding and provide them a summary of its reasons for making that finding. The Office of State Ethics shall publish its finding upon the respondent's request and may also publish a summary of its reasons for making such finding.
- (d) If a judge trial referee makes a finding of no probable cause, the complaint and the record of the Office of State Ethics' investigation shall remain confidential, except upon the request of the respondent and except that some or all of the record may be used in subsequent proceedings. No complainant, respondent, witness, designated party, or board or staff member of the Office of State Ethics shall disclose to any third party any information learned from the investigation, including knowledge of the existence of a complaint, which the disclosing party would not otherwise have known. If such a disclosure is made, the judge trial referee may, after consultation with the respondent if the

LCO No. 4964 9 of 12

- (e) The judge trial referee shall make public a finding of probable cause not later than five business days after any such finding. At such time the entire record of the investigation shall become public, except that the Office of State Ethics may postpone examination or release of such public records for a period not to exceed fourteen days for the purpose of reaching a stipulation agreement pursuant to subsection (c) of section 4-177. Any such stipulation agreement or settlement shall be approved by a majority of those members present and voting.
- Sec. 5. Section 1-88 of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective October 1, 2021*):
- (a) (1) The board, upon a finding made pursuant to section 1-82, as amended by this act, that there has been a violation of any provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn, shall have the authority to order the violator to do any or all of the following: [(1)] (A) Cease and desist the violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn; [(2)] (B) file any report, statement or other information as required by this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn; and [(3)] (C) pay a civil penalty of not more than ten thousand dollars for each violation of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn.
  - (2) The board, upon a finding made pursuant to section 1-82, as amended by this act, that there has been an incorrect decision on an issue of law under section 7-148h, as amended by this act, shall remand the case to the municipal board, commission, council, committee or other agency established under subsection (a) of section 7-148h, as amended by this act, for any remedies authorized by law.
    - (b) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (a) of this section, the board may, after a hearing conducted in accordance with sections 4-176e to 4-184, inclusive, upon the concurring vote of two-thirds of its

LCO No. 4964 10 of 12

members present and voting, impose a civil penalty not to exceed ten dollars per day upon any individual who fails to file any report, statement or other information as required by this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn. Each distinct violation of this subsection shall be a separate offense and in case of a continued violation, each day thereof shall be deemed a separate offense. In no event shall the aggregate penalty imposed for such failure to file exceed ten thousand dollars.

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

328

329

330

331

332

333

334

335

- (c) The board may also report its finding to the Chief State's Attorney for any action deemed necessary. The board, upon a finding made pursuant to section 1-82, as amended by this act, that a member or member-elect of the General Assembly has violated any provision of this part, section 1-101bb or section 1-101nn, shall notify the appropriate house of the General Assembly, in writing, of such finding and the basis for such finding.
- (d) Any person who knowingly acts in such person's financial interest in violation of section 1-84, 1-85, 1-86, 1-86d, 1-86e or 1-101nn or any person who knowingly receives a financial advantage resulting from a violation of any of said sections shall be liable for damages in the amount of such advantage. If the board determines that any person may be so liable, it shall immediately inform the Attorney General of that possibility.
  - (e) Any employee of the Office of State Ethics or member of the Citizen's Ethics Advisory Board who, in violation of this part or section 1-101nn, discloses information filed in accordance with subparagraph (F) of subdivision (1) of subsection (b) of section 1-83, shall be dismissed, if an employee, or removed from the board, if a member.
  - (f) Any civil penalty imposed by the board pursuant to this section may be enforced by the Office of State Ethics as a money judgment in accordance with chapter 906.

LCO No. 4964 11 of 12

This act shall take effect as follows and shall amend the following sections:		
Section 1	October 1, 2021	7-148h
Sec. 2	October 1, 2021	1-81(a)
Sec. 3	October 1, 2021	1-82
Sec. 4	October 1, 2021	1-82a
Sec. 5	October 1, 2021	1-88

## Statement of Purpose:

To permit aggrieved parties to appeal a local municipal ethics board decision to the Office of State Ethics.

[Proposed deletions are enclosed in brackets. Proposed additions are indicated by underline, except that when the entire text of a bill or resolution or a section of a bill or resolution is new, it is not underlined.]

Co-Sponsors: SEN. LOPES, 6th Dist.; REP. FISHBEIN, 90th Dist.

S.B. 296

LCO No. 4964 12 of 12