

General Assembly

Substitute Bill No. 5380

February Session, 2024

4



AN ACT CONCERNING THE COMPOSITION OF THE JUDICIAL SELECTION COMMISSION AND DECISIONS RENDERED BY SAID COMMISSION.

Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives in General Assembly convened:

- Section 1. Section 51-44a of the general statutes is repealed and the following is substituted in lieu thereof (*Effective July 1, 2024*):
- 3 (a) There is established a Judicial Selection Commission, within the
 - Office of Governmental Accountability established under section 1-300.
- 5 [Said] (1) Until December 31, 2024, the commission shall be comprised
- 6 of twelve members. Six of the members shall be attorneys-at-law and six
- 7 of the members shall not be attorneys-at-law. Not more than six of the
- 8 members shall belong to the same political party. None of the members
- 9 shall be an elected or appointed official of the state or hold state-wide
- office in a political party. (2) On and after January 1, 2025, the commission shall be comprised of eleven members, appointed in
- commission shall be comprised of eleven members, appointed in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (2) of subsection (b) of
- this section. Nine of the members shall be attorneys-at-law and two of
- the members shall not be attorneys-at-law. Not more than six of the
- members shall belong to the same political party. None of the members
- shall be an elected or appointed official of the state or hold state-wide
- 17 office in a political party.
- 18 (b) The members of the commission shall be appointed as follows:

LCO 1 of 10

19 [The] (1) Until December 31, 2024, the Governor shall appoint six 20 members, one from each congressional district and one at-large 21 member, three of whom shall be attorneys-at-law and three of whom 22 shall not be attorneys-at-law; the president pro tempore of the Senate 23 shall appoint one member who shall be an attorney-at-law; the speaker 24 of the House of Representatives shall appoint one member who shall 25 not be an attorney-at-law; the majority leader of the Senate shall appoint 26 one member who shall not be an attorney-at-law; the majority leader of 27 the House of Representatives shall appoint one member who shall be an 28 attorney-at-law; the minority leader of the Senate shall appoint one 29 member who shall not be an attorney-at-law; and the minority leader of 30 the House of Representatives shall appoint one member who shall be an 31 attorney-at-law. (2) On and after January 1, 2025, (A) the Governor shall 32 appoint five members, one from each congressional district, three of 33 whom shall be attorneys-at-law with not less than ten years of active 34 practice in Connecticut state courts, and two of whom shall not be 35 attorneys-at-law; (B) the president pro tempore of the Senate shall 36 appoint one member who shall be an attorney-at-law with not less than 37 ten years of active practice in Connecticut state courts; (C) the speaker 38 of the House of Representatives shall appoint one member who shall be 39 an attorney-at-law with not less than ten years of active practice in Connecticut state courts; (D) the majority leader of the Senate shall 40 41 appoint one member who shall be an attorney-at-law with not less than 42 ten years of active practice in Connecticut state courts; (E) the majority 43 leader of the House of Representatives shall appoint one member who 44 shall be an attorney-at-law with not less than ten years of active practice 45 in Connecticut state courts; (F) the minority leader of the Senate shall 46 appoint one member who shall be an attorney-at-law with not less than 47 ten years of active practice in Connecticut state courts; and (G) the minority leader of the House of Representatives shall appoint one 48 49 member who shall be an attorney-at-law with not less than ten years of 50 active practice in Connecticut state courts. (3) Each nomination for 51 appointment as a member of the Judicial Selection Commission shall be 52 referred, without debate, to the joint standing committee of the General 53 Assembly having cognizance of matters relating to the judiciary, which

LCO 2 of 10

shall report on each appointment not later than thirty days after the date of reference. Each appointment by the General Assembly of a member of the Judicial Selection Commission shall be by concurrent resolution. If the General Assembly is not in session at the time that a person is appointed to be a member of the Judicial Selection Commission, such person shall serve as an acting member of the Judicial Selection Commission until the General Assembly meets and confirms the nomination of such person to be a member of the Judicial Selection Commission, in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (2) of this subsection.

- (c) [The] (1) Prior to December 31, 2024, members of the commission shall elect a chairperson from among the members appointed by the Governor. (2) On and after January 1, 2025, members of the commission, appointed in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (2) of subsection (b) of this section, shall elect a chairperson from among the members appointed. Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (4) of subsection (d) of this section, a member serving on the commission on December 31, 2024, who meets the requirements prescribed in subsection (b) of this section, may be reappointed to the commission.
- (d) (1) The members of the commission shall serve for terms of three years.
- (2) [Members appointed on or after June 26, 2003, shall serve for terms of three years and, notwithstanding the provisions of section 4-1, until their successors are appointed and have qualified or ninety days after the completion of their terms, whichever is earlier.] (A) The term of any member appointed pursuant to subdivision (1) of subsection (b) of this section shall end on December 31, 2024. (B) Members appointed on or after January 1, 2025, shall serve for a term of three years from the date of confirmation by both houses of the General Assembly and until their successors are appointed and have qualified.
- [(3) Members serving on June 26, 2003, shall continue to serve as members until the end of their terms and, notwithstanding the

LCO 3 of 10

provisions of section 4-1, until their successors are appointed and have qualified or ninety days after the completion of their terms, whichever is earlier, except that members serving on June 26, 2003, who have completed their terms and are serving until their successors are appointed and have qualified shall, notwithstanding the provisions of section 4-1, continue to serve until their successors are appointed and have qualified, but not later than January 1, 2004.]

- [(4)] (3) Any vacancy in the membership of the commission shall be filled for the unexpired portion of the term by the appointing authority. The members of the commission shall receive no compensation for their services but shall be reimbursed for any necessary expenses incurred in the performance of their duties.
- [(5)] (4) No member of the commission may serve consecutive terms, except that if [, on or after June 26, 2003,] a person is appointed a member of the commission to fill a vacancy and complete an unexpired term, such person may serve an additional term. If a commission member is an attorney, no member of the commission member's firm may serve a term consecutive to such commission member.
- (e) The commission shall evaluate incumbent judges who seek reappointment to the same court and shall forward to the Governor for consideration the names of incumbent judges who are recommended for reappointment as provided in this subsection. The commission shall adopt regulations in accordance with the provisions of chapter 54 concerning criteria by which to evaluate incumbent judges who seek reappointment to the same court; provided pending adoption of such regulations, the commission shall use criteria established prior to June 22, 1989, for the evaluation of such judges. In evaluating the reappointment of an incumbent judge, the commission shall consider the legal ability, competence, integrity, character and temperament of such judge and any other relevant information concerning such judge. There shall be a presumption that each incumbent judge who seeks reappointment to the same court qualifies for retention in judicial office. The burden of rebutting such presumption shall be on the commission.

LCO **4** of 10

The commission shall investigate and interview each incumbent judge who seeks reappointment and, prior to the expiration of a term of office of such judge, shall recommend such incumbent judge for nomination for reappointment by the Governor to the same court unless, as provided in this subsection, recommendation of such judge is denied. If a preliminary examination indicates further inquiry is necessary before a recommendation of reappointment may be made, the commission shall hold a hearing concerning the reappointment of such judge. The commission shall send notice to the judge by certified or registered mail, return receipt requested, not less than one hundred eighty days prior to the convening of such legislative session which is to consider the reappointment of the incumbent judge, (A) that a hearing by the commission on such reappointment shall be held and of the time, date and place of such hearing, which shall be not less than thirty days nor more than forty-five days after the date of such notice and (B) of specific claims made against the judge. The commission shall make a record of all hearings conducted pursuant to this subsection. The hearing may be open to the public at the request of the judge. For purposes of conducting a hearing under this subsection, not less than ten members of the commission shall be present and voting. A judge appearing before such a hearing shall be entitled to counsel, to present evidence and to cross-examine witnesses who appear voluntarily. No judge shall be required to sign or execute any release in order to proceed with the hearing. The commission shall not later than twenty days after the close of such hearing render its decision whether it shall recommend such incumbent judge for nomination for reappointment by the Governor. [Any affirmative vote of a majority plus one of the members present and voting shall be required to deny recommendation to the Governor for nomination of an incumbent judge to the same court.] A judge who has not received approval by the commission may within ten days after receipt of the notice of decision, which shall include a record of the numerical vote, request a rehearing on the grounds that the conclusions of the commission are contrary to the evidence presented at the hearing or the commission failed to comply with the procedural or substantive requirements of this section. The decision of the commission following

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152153

LCO 5 of 10

<u>a rehearing</u> shall be final. There shall be no right of appeal by any judge appearing before the commission, at law or in equity, or any resort to any court following the decision of the commission.

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161162

163

164

165

166

167

168169

170

171172

173

174

175176

177178

179

180

181

182183

184

185

186

187

(f) Except as provided in subsection (e) of this section, the commission shall seek qualified candidates for consideration by the Governor for nomination as judges for the Superior Court, Appellate Court and Supreme Court. The commission shall adopt regulations, in accordance with the provisions of chapter 54, concerning criteria by which to evaluate the qualifications of candidates, including incumbent judges who seek appointment to a different court. The commission shall investigate and interview the candidates, including incumbent judges seeking appointment to a different court. A list of such qualified candidates shall be compiled by the commission. No candidate shall remain on the list of qualified candidates for more than ten years. A decision of the commission denying a recommendation to a candidate or judge shall include a summary of the specific facts established through evaluation of the candidate or judge and a record of the commission's numerical vote on the candidate or judge. A candidate or judge may request a rehearing on the grounds that the conclusions of the commission are contrary to the evidence presented at the hearing or the commission failed to comply with the procedural or substantive requirements of this section. The rehearing shall occur not later than thirty days after the date of the request and the candidate or judge shall be entitled to be present during such rehearing. The decision of the commission following a rehearing shall be final. There shall be no right of appeal by any candidate or judge appearing before the commission, at law or in equity, or any resort to any court following the decision of the commission.

(g) In connection with any inquiry concerning the reappointment of an incumbent judge, the commission shall have the power to issue subpoenas requiring the attendance of witnesses and the production of any books or papers which in the judgment of the commission are relevant to the inquiry. The commission may, upon request of the judge whose reappointment is at issue, issue a subpoena on behalf of such

LCO **6** of 10

judge. If any person disobeys such process or, having appeared in obedience thereto refuses to answer any pertinent question put to [him] such person by the commission, or to produce any books and papers pursuant thereto, the commission, on its own behalf or on behalf of the judge, may apply to the superior court for the judicial district of Hartford setting forth such disobedience to process or refusal to answer, and said court may cite such person to appear before said court to answer such question or to produce such books and papers and, upon [his] refusal so to do shall commit [him] such person to a community correctional center, there to remain until [he] such person so testifies.

188

189

190

191 192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

(h) (1) Judges of all courts, except those courts to which judges are elected, shall be nominated by the Governor exclusively from the list of candidates or incumbent judges submitted by the Judicial Selection Commission. Any candidate or incumbent judge who is nominated from such list by the Governor to be Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, and who is appointed Chief Justice by the General Assembly, shall serve a term of eight years from the date of appointment. The Governor shall nominate a candidate for a vacancy in a judicial position within fortyfive days of the date the Governor receives the recommendations of the commission. When considering the nomination of an incumbent judge for reappointment to the same court, the Governor may nominate the incumbent judge if the commission did not deny recommendation for reappointment. Whenever incumbent an judge denied recommendation for reappointment to the same court by the commission or is recommended by the commission but not nominated by the Governor for reappointment to the same court, or whenever a vacancy in a judicial position occurs or is anticipated, the Governor shall choose a nominee from the list of candidates compiled pursuant to subsection (f) of this section. (2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (1) of this subsection and subsection (f) of this section, the Governor may nominate an associate judge of the Supreme Court to be Chief Justice of the Supreme Court without such judge being investigated and interviewed by the commission and being on the list of qualified candidates compiled and submitted to the Governor by the

LCO **7** of 10

commission. An associate judge of the Supreme Court who has been nominated by the Governor to be Chief Justice of the Supreme Court in accordance with this subdivision, and who is appointed Chief Justice by the General Assembly, shall serve an initial term as Chief Justice equal to the remainder of such judge's term as an associate judge of the Supreme Court.

- (i) A majority of the membership of the commission shall constitute a quorum. The affirmative vote of at least a majority of the members of the commission present and voting shall be required for any action by the commission. [except (1) an affirmative vote of at least a majority plus one of the members present and voting shall be required for a new nominee to be recommended to the Governor for nomination as a judge or for an incumbent judge to be recommended to the Governor for nomination as a judge to a different court and (2) an affirmative vote of a majority plus one of the members present and voting shall be required to deny recommendation to the Governor for nomination of an incumbent judge to the same court.] No vote of the commission on a new nominee shall be by secret ballot. The vote of the commission on an incumbent judge may be by secret ballot.
- (j) Except as provided in subsections (e), (f) and (m) of this section, the investigations, deliberations, files and records of the commission shall be confidential and not open to the public or subject to disclosure except that the criteria by which candidates or incumbent judges who seek reappointment to the same court or appointment to a different court are evaluated and the procedural rules adopted by the commission shall be public.
- (k) The commission may employ such staff as is necessary for the performance of its functions and duties.
 - (l) No member of the commission who is an attorney-at-law shall be considered for recommendation to the Governor for nomination as a judge during his tenure on the commission or for a period of [two] three years following the termination of his tenure on the commission.

LCO 8 of 10

(m) On [January 15, 2011, and annually thereafter] or before January fifteenth annually, the chairperson of the commission shall report to the joint standing committee on judiciary the following information with respect to the prior calendar year: (1) The number of candidates interviewed for appointment as new nominees, the number of incumbent judges interviewed for reappointment to the same court and the number of incumbent judges interviewed for appointment to a different court, (2) the number of candidates who were recommended and denied recommendation to the Governor as new nominees, the iudges number incumbent recommended and recommendation for appointment to the same court and the number of incumbent judges recommended and denied recommendation for appointment to a different court, (3) the statistics regarding the race, gender, national origin, religion, areas of professional experience and years of experience as members of the bar of all such candidates and incumbent iudges interviewed, recommended and recommendation under subdivisions (1) and (2) of this subsection, and (4) as of January first in the year of such report, the number of candidates on the list compiled by the commission pursuant to subsection (f) of this section and the statistics regarding the race, gender, national origin, religion, areas of professional experience, years of experience as members of the bar and calendar year of recommendation of all such candidates.

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267268

269

270271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

(n) The commission shall have the power to enter into such contractual agreements as may be necessary for the discharge of its duties concerning the investigation of candidates seeking appointment to a judicial position and incumbent judges seeking reappointment to the same court or appointment to a different court, within the limits of appropriated funds and in accordance with established procedures.

This act shall take effect as follows and shall amend the following sections:		
Section 1	Iulu 1 2024	51-44a

LCO 9 of 10

Statement of Legislative Commissioners:

In Subsec. (b)(2), in Subparas. (C), (D) and (F), "shall not be" was changed to "shall be" for internal consistency with Subsec. (a)(2), in Subsec. (b), "Claims Commissioner" was changed to "Judicial Selection Commission" for accuracy, and in Subsec. (c)(2), "Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (4) of subsection (d) of this section," was added for clarity and internal consistency.

JUD Joint Favorable Subst.

LCO 10 of 10